Effectiveness of Nintendo Wii in functional and health outcomes of individuals with Parkinson’s disease: a systematic review

Eficácia do Nintendo Wii em desfechos funcionais e de saúde de indivíduos com doença de Parkinson: uma revisão sistemática

Eficacia del Nintendo Wii en resultados funcionales y de salud de individuos con enfermedad de Parkinson: una revisión sistemática

Nayara Felicidade Tomaz Braz¹, Letícia Rocha Dutra², Paulo Eduardo Souza Medeiros³, Aline Alvim Scianni⁴, Christina Danielli Coelho de Morais Faria⁴

ABSTRACT | The objective of this study was to conduct a systematic review of the literature on the effectiveness of Nintendo Wii in the improvement of functional and health outcomes of individuals with Parkinson’s disease. A systematic review of the literature was developed following the PRISMA (Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic reviews and Meta-Analyses), with research in MEDLINE, SciELO, LILACS, PEDro through a search strategy that combined the terms Wii, Parkinson’s Disease, rehabilitation, and physical therapy, followed by manual search. Inclusion criteria were: experimental studies or quasi-experiments related to interventions involving the use of Nintendo Wii to improve functional outcomes in individuals with Parkinson’s disease, published until February 2016, without language restriction. The methodological quality of the studies was assessed with the PEDro scale. Of the 701 studies found, we included seven that met the inclusion criteria – most of the articles (57.14%) had bad methodological quality and were quasi-experiments. The results suggest that the use of Wii seems effective to improve functional outcomes (balance, mobility, motor performance and independence) and health (reducing the risk of falls), being more consistent the results for the improvement of balance. Studies with better methodological quality are needed for the establishment of evidence. Standardization on the types of games, intensity and frequency suitable for each type of patient with PD are still required.

Keywords | Parkinson’s Disease; Virtual Reality; Neurology; Rehabilitation; Physical Therapy.

RESUMO | O objetivo deste estudo foi revisar sistematicamente a literatura sobre a eficácia do Nintendo Wii na melhora de desfechos funcionais e de saúde de indivíduos com doença de Parkinson. A revisão foi desenvolvida seguindo o PRISMA (Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses), com buscas nas bases de dados MEDLINE, SciELO, LILACS e PEDro mediante estratégia de busca composta pela combinação dos termos “Wii”, “Doença de Parkinson”, “reabilitação” e “fisioterapia”, seguida de busca manual. Os critérios de inclusão foram: estudos experimentais ou quase-experimentais relacionados a intervenções envolvendo o uso do Nintendo Wii para melhora de desfechos funcionais em indivíduos com doença de Parkinson, publicados até fevereiro de 2016, sem restrição de idioma. A qualidade metodológica dos estudos foi avaliada pela escala PEDro. Dos 701 estudos encontrados, 70 estudos foram incluídos, sendo que mais da metade (57.14%) apresentaram baixa qualidade metodológica e foram estudos quase-experimentais. Os resultados sugiram que o uso de Wii parece eficaz para melhorar os resultados funcionais (balanço, mobilidade, desempenho motor e independência) e os resultados foram mais consistentes para a melhora do balanço. Estudos de melhor qualidade metodológica são necessários para estabelecer evidências. A padronização em tipos de jogos, intensidade e frequência adequada para cada tipo de paciente com PD ainda é necessária.

Keywords | Doença de Parkinson; Realidade Virtual; Neurologia; Reabilitação; Terapia Física.

¹Physical therapist, PhD student of the Graduate Program in Neuroscience at Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais (UFGM) – Belo Horizonte (MG), Brazil.
²Occupational therapist, PhD student of the Graduate Program in Rehabilitation Sciences at Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais (UFGM) – Belo Horizonte (MG), Brazil.
³Physical therapist, master’s student of the Graduate Program in Sports Science at the Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais (UFGM) – Belo Horizonte (MG), Brazil.
⁴Physical Therapist, Assistant Professor of the Department of Physical Therapy, Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais (UFGM) – Belo Horizonte (MG), Brazil.

Corresponding address: Professor Christina Danielli Coelho de Morais Faria – Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais, Escola de Educação Física, Fisioterapia e Terapia Ocupacional, Departamento de Fisioterapia – Av. Antônio Carlos, 6627, Campus Pampulha – Belo Horizonte (MG), Brazil – Zip Code: 31270-901 – Phone: (31) 3409-4763 – E-mail: cdcmf@ufmg.br – Finance source: CAPES (Coordenação de Aperfeiçoamento de Pessoal de Nível Superior), Fundação de Amparo à Pesquisa do Estado de Minas Gerais and CNPq (Conselho Nacional de Desenvolvimento Científico e Tecnológico) – Conflict of interest: Nothing to declare – Presentation: Nov. 13th, 2016 – Accepted for publication: Dec. 2nd, 2017.
INTRODUCTION

Parkinson’s disease (PD) is a chronic, progressive and degenerative disorder of the central nervous system, the second most common neurodegenerative disease and the leading cause of Parkinsonism, with higher prevalence in the population over 65 years of age and in the male sex. In addition to Parkinsonism (presence of bradykinesia and at least one of the following signs: trembling and/or stiffness), the patients with PD may show postural instability, deficits in balance, limitations in activities, with loss of functional independence and compromise of the quality of life.

Several studies have investigated the efficacy of rehabilitation associated with the pharmacological treatment in patients with PD for the improvement of health, functionality and quality of life. Recently, virtual reality began to be used in these rehabilitation programs. It is a computerized technology that simulates real environmental stimuli to promote interaction between people and machines based on sensory, cognitive, psychological and motor feedback, allowing the intensive repetition of complex tasks and providing a motivational training environment.

Among the virtual reality devices with potential for use in rehabilitation, the video game Nintendo Wii stands out with its feasibility, safety and efficacy in the improvement of balance of patients with cerebrovascular accident (CVA), cerebral palsy (CP), multiple sclerosis and traumatic brain injury (TBI). Moreover, in a recent study that aimed to list, compare and classify VR devices that assessed the motor symptoms of people with PD, Nintendo Wii showed good clinimetric properties and was recommended for measuring the postural instability and monitor the motor signs of these individuals. It is noteworthy that Nintendo Wii is a low-cost device when compared with others, and it can be used at home, important characteristic for its applicability in individuals with disturbances caused by brain injuries. Despite its advantages and possibilities, it is not yet clear the effectiveness of this technology in the rehabilitation process of individuals with PD. In this context, the objective of this systematic review was to verify the effectiveness of Nintendo Wii in rehabilitating these individuals.
METHODOLOGY

This systematic review was carried out according to PRISMA (Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses)\textsuperscript{13}, with all the steps conducted by two independent researchers, who, at the end of each step, met to reach a consensus. A third one would be involved in case of disagreement between the two researchers. In the first step, we searched the term “Wii” in the MEDLINE, SciELO, LILACS and PEDro databases. All scientific studies published until February 2016 were included, without language restriction, and with the following inclusion criteria: experimental or quasi-experimental studies, and those that used Nintendo Wii in the rehabilitation process of individuals with PD. In the second step, the titles of all studies found in the electronic databases were evaluated, and those that clearly did not meet the inclusion criteria were excluded. The same procedure was used in the third step with the analysis of the abstracts of studies included in the second step. In the fourth step, we read all the texts included in the previous phase, and those that used Nintendo Wii in the rehabilitation of individuals with PD were included. In the fifth step, another search was conducted in the reference list of all studies included after searching in the electronic databases, following the same procedures.

The scale Physiotherapy Evidence Database (PEDro)\textsuperscript{14} was used to determine the methodological quality of each study included. The basis adopted for the interpretation of the quality score was: from 9 to 10, excellent; 6 to 8, good; 4 to 5, reasonable; and less than 4, poor\textsuperscript{14}.

RESULTS

From the electronic search, 701 studies that used Nintendo Wii were identified, but only seven met the inclusion criteria. New studies that met the inclusion criteria were not found in reference list search (Figure 1). All seven studies were published in the last four years: three in 2012\textsuperscript{12,15,16}, two in 2013\textsuperscript{17,18}, one in 2014\textsuperscript{19} and one in 2015\textsuperscript{20} (Chart 1).

The studies included men and women with PD, with ages that ranged from 44 years to 91 years, with predominance of older adults (average age of 65 years). Five studies used the Hoehn & Yahr scale to assess the PD severity\textsuperscript{21}. Three studies included individuals with moderate disability\textsuperscript{15,17,19} and two individuals with mild disability\textsuperscript{16,20}. Two studies used the Unified Parkinson’s Disease Rating Scale (UPDRS)\textsuperscript{22} to assess the signs, symptoms and certain activities\textsuperscript{12,18}. The average time of involvement of the individuals ranged from 6.4 to 9.2 years\textsuperscript{12,17-20}.

Regarding the outcomes of the studies, 85.7% analyzed balance\textsuperscript{12,15-18,20}, and most of them used the Berg Balance Scale (4/7; 57.14%)\textsuperscript{15-18}. Other outcomes were also assessed (Chart 1). The measuring instruments used to assess the main outcomes (Chart 1) present appropriate properties and are recommended by the International Parkinson and Movement Disorder Society\textsuperscript{23,24}.

Figure 1. Flowchart of the search and selection of studies. n: number of studies.
Most of the studies (4/7; 57.14%) presented score three in the PEDro scale (poor methodological quality)\textsuperscript{15,17-19}, were quasi-experimental (4/7; 57.14%) and used a group with pre- and post-test\textsuperscript{15,17-19}, followed by experimental studies with two groups: PD (Parkinson’s disease) and GC (control group) (2/7; 28.57%)\textsuperscript{12,16} and only one experimental study with three groups (1/7; 14.28%)\textsuperscript{20} (Chart 1). Only one study conducted follow-up after the intervention period\textsuperscript{16}.

In all quasi-experimental studies in which balance was assessed\textsuperscript{15,17,18}, a significant improvement was observed with the use of Nintendo Wii (Chart 2). As to experimental studies, in the lowest score in the PEDro scale (4 in 11 points)\textsuperscript{12}, the static and dynamic balance improved, as well as the global mobility and functional abilities of the PD group when compared with the CG group. In the study by Pompey et al.\textsuperscript{16} (PEDro=6), both groups with (conventional or with Nintendo Wii) balance training showed significant improvement in independence (UPDRS–II), without significant differences between the groups immediately.
after or 60 days after the intervention. In the study by Liao et al.20 (score 9 in the PEDro scale), significant improvements were reported in the PDWiit compared with the group without any intervention in the performance when crossing obstacles, in dynamic balance and in quality of life. In addition, the PDWiit group presented significant improvement in movement speed when compared with the PDct (Chart 2).

**DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION**

The results of the studies included in this review suggest that the use of Nintendo Wii is effective to improve functional outcomes (balance, mobility, motor performance and independence) and health outcomes (decrease in the risk of falls and improvement of quality of life), being more consistent the evidence regarding the balance. A single study conducted follow-up after the end of the intervention and the results were positive for the continued improvement of the independence, both with conventional training and with Nintendo Wii. In other words, we did not identify better results with Nintendo Wii in comparison with conventional training.

The studies of this review included individuals with PD with more commonly described clinical and demographic characteristics and used assessment tools to classify the severity of the disease, Hoehn & Yahr and UPDRS, which are commonly cited and recommended for assessment and staging of PD. In quasi–experimental studies in which balance was assessed, the significant improvement observed...
with Nintendo Wii (Chart 2) can be justified by the fact that Wii activities provide visual feedback to the postural response to movements of the center of gravity. Although there are a great number of studies related to Nintendo Wii, only a few used it in individuals with PD, all published recently. Moreover, most of the studies had low methodological quality and are quasi-experimental, limiting thus the conclusions. It is important to consider that studies of this type are referred to as proof of concept and provide the first evidence that a new intervention can be effective in clinical situations, constituting phase I/II of experimental studies. This temporal sequence is recommended to answer some questions before conducting controlled studies. Considering the results found in this review, this seems to have been the sequence used by experimental studies with Nintendo Wii in individuals with PD. Therefore, randomized clinical trials with follow-up of the intervention should be conducted with the aim to investigate the effectiveness of using the Nintendo Wii in individuals with PD.

REFERENCES


