This article presents a short biography of Celso Furtado, and his life as a civil servant between 1943 and 1964. Despite being recognized for his contributions to the field of economics, Furtado started his professional and academic career (as researcher and professor) in the field of public administration. In 1943, Furtado was hired as organizational assistant at the Public Service Administration Department (Dasp), after a competitive selection process. Twenty years later, he was appointed as Minister by President João Goulart for the administration 1961-1964. During the period covered in this study Furtado worked in the Economic Commission for Latin America (Ecla), in Santiago/Chile, from 1949 to 1957. After that, he returned to Brazil to become director at the Brazilian National Development Bank (BNDE), where he created (and directed) the Superintendency for the Development of the Northeast (Sudene). Furtado was the main disseminator of Ecla's ideas in Brazil, which proposed a centrality of the State in the promotion of development and the consequent need for a new profile of the public manager to conduct this process. The period was marked by the dialogue between economic development and development management, which led to a linkage of economic development to the development of the technique and art of administration. In addition, he was one of the thinkers whose theoretical and practical thoughts have supported the consolidation of the big state-owned companies in Brazil. Studying the history of Celso Furtado as a public manager is a source of important reflections about the government's role in the economy and about the role of public managers.

**Keywords:** Celso Furtado; Dasp; Ecla; Ecla-BNDE Commission; Sudene.
Celso Furtado: un economista al servicio de la gestión pública

Este artículo investiga la trayectoria de Celso Furtado como administrador público entre 1943 y 1964. Más conocido por sus contribuciones para el campo de la economía, todavía, Furtado inició su carrera como funcionario y académico, como investigador y profesor, en la administración pública. En 1943, Furtado se unió mediante licitación al Departamento Administrativo de la Función Pública (Dasp) como asistente de organización y alcanzó, 20 años más tarde, la posición de ministro de estado en el gobierno João Goulart (1961-1964). Durante el periodo investigado, Furtado trabajó en la Comisión Económica para América Latina (Cepal) en Santiago (Chile), entre 1949 y 1957, donde retornó a Brasil para ser nombrado director del Banco Nacional de Desarrollo Económico (BNDE), que lo llevaría a organizar la Sudene de la que fue el primer superintendente. Furtado fue el principal diseminador de las ideas de la Cepal en Brasil, que proponían una centralidad del Estado en la promoción del desarrollo y, en consecuencia, la necesidad de un nuevo perfil de gestor público para gestionar ese proceso. El periodo fue marcado por el diálogo entre desarrollo económico y administración del desarrollo, y que llevó a una vinculación del desarrollo económico al desarrollo de la técnica y arte de administración. Por lo tanto, Furtado fue uno de los pensadores cuyas reflexiones teórica y práctica han ayudado a consolidar las grandes empresas de propiedad estatal en el país. El rescate de la carrera de Furtado como gestor público ofrece una reflexión profunda sobre el papel del Estado en la economía y sobre el del administrador público.

Palabras clave: Celso Furtado; Cepal; Dasp; Grupo Misto Cepal-BNDE; Sudene.

1. INTRODUCTION

Celso Monteiro Furtado is one of the best-known economists in Brazil and abroad and was nominated by his peers for the 2003 Nobel Prize in Economics, one year before his death. Perhaps, because of his recognition as an economist, his career as a public manager has been less mentioned in management literature. However, Furtado began his career as a civil servant, and his initial academic concerns concentrated on organizations in general and, in particular, public administration.

Some researches that deal with the historiography of administration show Furtado’s influence in the area: for Fischer (1984:59), the ideas promoted by the Economic Commission for Latin America (Eclac) were an incentive to “support the training of public managers, who would be responsible for modernizing the field of administration”. Eclac is a development agency of the United Nations (UN) and was founded in Santiago, Chile in 1948. Furtado was the main Brazilian representative in Eclac and the main disseminator in Brazil of the ideas developed in the organization (Bielschowsky, 1988); according to Bertero (2006:10), the texts of authors such as Furtado “were important references for the first courses on administration”; for Coelho (2006), the ideas elaborated by Eclac confronted the assumptions of scientific management inspired by the the United States, and brought about the introduction of the debate on national issues in public administration teaching, which began to deal with the political-administrative and socio-economic history of the country, rather than the mere appropriation of imported models. One of the professors who participated in the creation of Escola de Administração de Empresas de São Paulo (Eaesp) stated that “[…] the entire strategic logic of the Higher Institute of Brazilian Studies (Iseb) and of Eclac was a logic of industrialization with the support of the state and the opposition to that concept were Americans and Europeans […]” (Alcadipani and Bertero, 2014:160). The theorizations issued by Iseb and Eclac were contrary to the proclaimed US scientific management (Wanderley, 2015a).
These authors (Fischer, 1984; Bertero, 2006; Coelho, 2006; Alcadipani and Bertero, 2014) corroborate the influence of Furtado and Eclac in administration courses and in the modernization of the Brazilian state in the 1950s and early 1960s. However, these authors did not elaborate the way in which this influence would have occurred (actually, this was not the aim of their study). A recent literature review based on references to the ‘Brazilian interpreters’ in the total citations of Brazilian social thought, showed Guerreiro Ramos and Celso Furtado as the most cited in articles of the main academic events of public administration (Martins et al., 2013:35). The contributions of Guerreiro Ramos to the areas of organizations and public administration are already widespread (for example, Tenório (2010)), while Celso Furtado is still understudied.

Therefore, the objective of this article is to show Celso Furtado’s career as a public manager and the context in which this happened. The study analyzes Furtado’s first works, written when he was still an employee at the Department of Public Services Administration (Dasp), when he studied the literature of organizations with the intention of contributing to the administrative reform of the Brazilian state. The period analyzed is between 1943, when Furtado — 23 years old — started his career at the DASP, and 1964, the year when he — working as superintendent at the Superintendency for Northeast Development (Sudene) — was exiled by the military coup. The theoretical contributions of Furtado and Eclac are not the center of this study, but considered part of the context of the time analyzed and as the background of the biography of Celso Furtado as public manager. This article offers this modest contribution in face of the vast work of Furtado and the literature about him, which still lacks research to better understand his role as a civil servant.

This article is divided into four additional sections following this introduction. In the next section, we present the methodological approach and then we describe the context of the formation of the modern Brazilian state when Furtado joined the public service, and the role of Eclac in this historical moment. The third section presents the analysis of Celso Furtado’s career as a public manager, and is followed by the final considerations in the last section.

2. METHODOLOGICAL APPROACH

The vast work of and about Furtado is both a blessing and a challenge. The delimitation of our investigation in the history of Furtado as public manager made our task easier. The personal support of Furtado’s widow, Rosa Freire D’Aguiar, and of the International Celso Furtado Center for Development Policies (Center) were fundamental for this research. The Center has reissued several works that were used here, some of them not easily available in the market.

The recent publication of his three autobiographical books in a single volume (Furtado, 2014) and the book Anos de formação (D’Aguiar, 2014), form the basis of our research. This last book republished the first articles written while he was in Dasp, published originally in the 1940s in the Revista do Serviço Público. The main books published by Furtado (1954, 1959, 1961) during the researched period were reviewed for this study. Despite the many works on Furtado, few deal with the initial period of his career, and the work that generated more interest in our research was Silva (2011). This author analyzes the “Young Celso Furtado”, that is, the period in which he works as a civil servant and dedicates to the literature on organizations. This shows that even in the area of economics, Furtado’s period of education is neglected.
In addition to using the literature of administration historiography to investigate the period (Fischer, 1984; Wahrlich, 1983; Bertero, 2006; Coelho, 2006), we decided to adopt the interdisciplinarity. Research in the area of history (Abreu, 1975; Rabelo, 2012) and mainly in the area of history of Brazilian economic thought (HBET) have contributed to this study (Lima, 1975; Diniz, 1978; Bianchi, 2002; Cepeda, 2004; Vernengo, 2006). Bielschowsky (1988) in HBET was important to understand the “ideological cycle of developmentalism” that permeates the entire period of our research, as well as the work of Celso Furtado and Eclac. In the area of political science, the book “Bohemios Civicos” (Lima, 13) was important for the investigation of the democratic government of Vargas (1951-1954).

Among the main documents investigated are the speeches of Getúlio Vargas (Brasil, 1930; 1937), the Carta Econômica and Teresópolis (Conclap, 1945) and the annual reports of the BNDE (1953, 1955, 1956, 1957) when it comes to Furtado’s work with Eclac.

As previously stated, we limited the investigation to the interval between 1943-1964, period where Furtado entered Dasp, and was exiled by the dictatorship’s Institutional Act — 1 (AI-1), when he was Superintendent of Sudene. Throughout the research, it was clear to us that Furtado’s history in the period had three distinct stages:

1. — 1943-1948: Civil servant at Dasp
2. — 1949-1957: Director of Eclac for Brazil
3. — 1958-1964: Director of public agency

It should be noted that in the second period, 1949-1957, Furtado was not linked to organs of public administration, but to Eclac, an organ of the United Nations. However, he came to Brazil on missions that worked directly with the Brazilian government and, for that reason, it is included in our analysis. It was also during those years that he began a collaboration with the Iseb, a body linked to the Ministry of Education and Culture (MEC) that operated between 1955-1964. During the years 1958-1964, Furtado continued to collaborate with Iseb, where he lectured (1959) on “Operation Northeast”, which became a book published by Iseb and led to the creation of Sudene. The thesis of Abreu (1975) was important to analyze the performance of Iseb. Therefore, it is important that we also deal with this part of Furtado’s history, when he worked directly with agents and public agencies (Wanderley, 2015a).

In the second period, for example, as director of Eclac and president of the Joint Eclac-BNDE Group, Furtado was responsible for the publication of the “Outline of a Development Program for the Brazilian Economy (period 1955-1962)” (Cepal, 1955). This document served as a basis for the Plan of Goals edited by President Juscelino Kubitschek (JK) (1956-1960) and, along with the experience of Furtado in Eclac, it was important to prove his capability to become director of the National Bank for Economic Development (BNDE). Thus, this second period of analysis contributes to show that there is no discontinuity in Furtado’s collaboration with the public administration in Brazil, even with his time living in Santiago, Chile, where Eclac headquarters is located.

3. THE CONSTRUCTION OF THE BRAZILIAN MODERN STATE, FURTADO AND ECLAC

Celso Furtado started his career in the public service working at Dasp in 1943, in a historical-institutional context administrative modernization originated in President Getúlio Vargas’ first
government (1930-1945). In his inauguration speech, on 3 November 1930, Vargas defined the parameters of his proposal for the reform of the Brazilian public administration, saying: “[…] to recast the cadres of functionalism, which should be reduced to what is indispensable, by abolishing unnecessary personnel; maintain an administration of a rigorous economy, cutting off all unproductive and sumptuary expenditures” (Brasil, 1930:7). To achieve this goal in 1935 the Permanent Commission on Standardization was created, and in 1936 the Federal Council of Civil Service.

With the installation of the so-called Estado Novo (new state) in 1937, Vargas resumed the theme of the need for change in the public administration in his radio presentation on 10 November, in which he said: “The actual government apparatus did not conform to the demands of national life, rather, it poses difficulties to expand services and it inhibits government’s mobility” (Brasil, 1937:9). In order to improve this bureaucratic apparatus, Vargas passed Law n. 579, of 30 November 1938, which created Dasp, a body that would be directly connected to the Presidency of the Republic with the following initial attributions (Brasil, 1938):

a) to study in detail the departments and public agencies in order to determine, from the point of view of economy and efficiency, the changes to be made in public services organization, distribution and merging, budget allocations, work conditions and processes, relationships among agencies and with the public;

b) to organize annually, in accordance with the instructions of the President of the Republic, the budget proposal to be sent by to the parliament;

c) to supervise the budget execution, by delegation of the President of the Republic and in accordance with their instructions.

Thus, Dasp, in addition to the attributions aimed at improving the organizational structure of the Brazilian State, still played the role that was later attributed to the Ministry of Planning, created in Brazil only in 1963 (D’Aguiar, 2011). Decree-Law 579 provided for the creation, in each ministry, of an Efficiency Committee subordinate in administrative terms to each minister and technically to Dasp. According to Furtado (1985:48), Dasp was created to carry out “the roles of both the Federal Council of Civil Service and the Budget Bureau, in the same way as these two agencies were conceived by F.D. Roosevelt”. These agencies were the first subjects of Furtado’s academic research (Silva, 2011).

Throughout his first administration, Vargas (1930-1945) created agencies of public administration in which a “technical elite” was formed (Rabelo, 2013:79) even before undergraduate courses in public administration were created. One of these first agencies was the Federal Council of Foreign Trade (FCFT), created in 1934. The FCFT greatly exceeded its foreign trade attributions and dealt with general matters of the Brazilian economy and, from its transformation into a deliberative organ in 1937, came to include representatives of industry, commerce and agriculture (Diniz, 1978). This was the first federal agency in which Vargas promoted the participation of industrial businesspeople, whose main participant was Roberto Simonsen (Cêpeda, 2004).
Jesus Soares Pereira (Lima, 1975:49), public manager who worked for eight years in FCFT stated that:

I am not exaggerating if I say that the FCFT was involved in all the major projects that promoted Brazilian development […] It was the deliberative and even legislative ‘engine’ of the Estado Novo period, the true forum where the country’s economic legislation was created. For me, it was a great technical school.

In his analysis of FCFT’s main projects, Pereira lists the projects on coal, electricity and oil. The latter led to the creation of the Brazilian National Petroleum Council in 1938, of which he participated (Lima, 1975). Pereira became one of the economic advisor for Vargas years later, in Vargas democratic government (1951-1954), period that marked the national-developmentalism. This group of advisors that Pereira was part of, was responsible for the creation of agencies and companies such as Petrobras, BNDE, Banco do Nordeste do Brasil, CAPES and Eletrobras, which marked the participation of the Brazilian state in the economy (Lima, 2013).

The participation of the state in the economy in that period was discussed at the 1st Conference of the Producing Classes of Brazil — Conclap, in May 1945, in Teresópolis/RJ. This conference brought together “delegations from the three branches of production activities […] representing the totality of the national economic forces […] at a moment when […] Brazil is preparing to restructure its institutions of government” (Conclap, 1945:1). The result of this conference was the publication of the Economic Charter of Teresópolis, which had recommendations to the government in all aspects of economic policy, and describes the aspirations of these classes regarding the organization of government and participation of foreign capital. It is surprising that in the final draft of the Charter, private initiative leaves consigned “the admission of a certain degree of state interference”, but exalts “the simplification of public administration” and admits the “need for economic planning” of the state (Conclap, 1945:1-2). Simonsen had been advocating the planning thesis for some time, but it was at this point that he succeeded in establishing it as one of the central theses of the Teresópolis conference (Cepêda, 2004).

It was at that time that the debate on the role of the state in the economy had its most striking moment in what became known as the “Simonsen-Gudin Debate”. The thesis of Simonsen in the Teresópolis Charter opposed the view of Eugenio Gudin’s liberal economist who “criticized industrialization and defended the country’s ‘agricultural vocation’. He was a defender of foreign capital and opposed the creation of Petrobras, as well as the State’s participation in the economy” (Teixeira, Maringoni and Gentil, 2010:17).

Behind the debate on the role of the state in the economy, there was the dialogue between economic development and the administration of development, and that in the 1950s the theory of “linking economic development with the development of the technique and art of administration” (Campos, 1954:3). At that time, the prevailing idea was the “vital importance of improvements in administrative processes, before initiatives of technical assistance or financing for the economic development of underdeveloped countries could be undertaken with prospects of success” (Campos, 1954:3).
Eclac played an important role both in the dissemination of techniques on state planning and in the improvement of administrative processes. The ideas formulated by Eclac provided a theoretical basis for the practices that had emerged in the region since the 1930s, before its foundation. Eclac's contribution was largely welcomed by the developmentalist states that governed the region — having in the organization a UN body endorsing their policies — and by the bourgeoisie local industry that yearned for state support (Bianchi, 2002). In other words, Eclac's theorizing “consolidated a series of visions and policies that were already part of the dominant intellectual milieu in Latin America” and discussed alternatives for development (Vernengo, 2006:556). Eclac's ideas preached a central role of the state in encouraging private organizations in the search for the country's development. The state should act as the great inducer of the process of industrialization and directly in the areas in which the private organizations had no interest. In this way, public organizations and their managers would play a role as (if not more) important as private organizations, an idea that was against the foreign literature on organizations diffused in Brazil at that time, which considered organizations of the state with direct action in the economy as an anomaly to be avoided (Wanderley, 2015b).

Eclac made the Simonsen-Gudin debate stand in favor of Simonsen and it was decisive in the developmental policies of Vargas’ (1951-1954) and JK's (1956-1960) governments. Unfortunately, Simonsen did not experience that moment, since he died prematurely in 1948 (Cepêda, 2004). Celso Furtado was then the main propagator of Eclac's ideas in Brazil (Bielschowsky, 1988). Furtado was a member of the technical elite formed in the Dasp and was “often considered apolitical and little influenced by external pressures or decisions” (Rabelo, 2013:82).

Therefore, Furtado’s insertion in the public sector occurred at a time when the country sought a modernization of the state and in which the role of public organizations as well as public servant were re-discussed.

4. CELSO FURTADO’S CAREER AS PUBLIC MANAGER

The implementation of the required activities of Dasp as a new public administration body would require a team of officials trained to meet its central purpose of promoting the administrative modernization of the bureaucratic apparatus of Brazil. Among the positions created to help Dasp to achieve this goal was the position of administration technician, justified by Explanatory Memorandum No 2,487, of 30 December 1939, that advocated that it was “imperative […] in accordance with the fundamental principle of career formation, the creation of an administration technician position, to be filled by specialized professionals who are not occupying positions in other careers, in order to carry out the specific duties entrusted to Dasp” (Brasil, 1939). The new positions were created and 150 managerial technicians where hired through public selection process conducted during the period from 1940-1942 (Wahrlich, 1983:243).

4.1 CIVIL SERVANT AT DASP: 1943-1948

Furtado started his career as Civil Servant in the period known as Estado Novo, when Brazil was under a dictatorial regime and Dasp, with the leadership of Luis Simões Lopes, concentrated strong powers. After a public selection process, in 1943, Furtado was hired at Dasp in the position of organization
assistant and in 1944, after another public selection process, he was hired as administration technician (still at Dasp). After this second selection process he was assigned to “work in the city of Niterói, in the Area of Organization and Budget of the Department of Public Service (DSP) of the State of Rio de Janeiro, one of the many daspinhos (N.T. Dasp offices) created around the country” (D’Aguiar, 2014:16, italics in the original quote). The Dasp offices, or daspinhos, represented the regional branches throughout Brazil, which responded to the headquarters of Dasp in Rio. Furtado’s professional career began in the bureaucracy rather than in economy, the field in which he is usually known and celebrated. Furtado’s initial concern with the science of administration started in 1940 when he began studying Law at the then National Faculty of Law of Rio de Janeiro, now Federal University of Rio de Janeiro (UFRJ). In the third year of the course, while taking classes in Administrative Law with Professor José Rodrigues Vale, the discipline, in Furtado’s own words “opened my eyes to administration” (Furtado, 2014:9). According to him (Furtado, 1997:17): “In the field of administration, I became interested specifically in organizational problems. I then came into contact with the modern American literature on organization, both for state and business activities”.

At DSP, Celso Furtado began to operationalize the activities assigned to him from theoretical references that went beyond the stimuli originated in the classes of Administrative Law. The “modern North-American literature” to which Furtado (1997:17) referred included references, now considered classic in the study of organizations, not only in the public sector but also in the business sector, and demonstrated the content explored by Celso Furtado. Examples of the cited authors are James D. Mooney and Alan C. Reiley, Ralph Currier Davis, Marshall E. Dimock, G. D. H Cole (D’Aguiar, 2014:16).

In this early phase of Dasp, Furtado researched and wrote about theories of organizations. His first four articles on the subject were published in the Revista do Serviço Público, which was edited by Dasp (D’Aguiar, 2014). Under the guidance of the president of Dasp, Simões Lopes, the research was centered on the US model, of which he was a great admirer. Thus, Furtado’s first two articles (1944:69) dealt with an analysis of the Civil Service Commission (CSC), which for him would have evolved becoming “the cornerstone of the personnel administration system at the federal level in that country”.

Furtado (D’Aguiar, 2014:132) analyzed the structure of the CSC in order to contribute “to the understanding of our problems”. According to Furtado (D’Aguiar, 2014:132-133), the Brazilian federal government “placed itself at the forefront of a movement of ideas promoting an administrative reform based on a vast and complex system of agencies of general administration articulated on the basis of function”. However, according to him, several unexpected problems arose throughout the implementation of this system, and Furtado (D’Aguiar, 2014:133) hoped that his studies could contribute “to the consolidation of our administrative reform in the organizational sector”. That is, inserted in the administrative reform of the period, Furtado looked for inspiration in the model of the USA, following the direction of the president of Dasp, Simões Lopes. In time, the Brazilian government had an agreement with the CSC to send technicians for training (Silva, 2011).

Between the first two articles and the next two, from January to August 1945, Furtado was summoned by the Brazilian army to fight in Italy (D’Aguiar, 2014). This interregnum impacted what he wrote. Furtado’s exposure to war and his stay in France after World War II made him realize the
effectiveness of state planning in the war effort and later in the country’s reconstruction (Wanderley and Faria, 2012).

His third article, published in 1946, “Organizational structure theory” which, while remaining in the technical line of the first two in analyzing the United States model, “has as its central point to examine how actions can be structured and executed in relation to the specific types of organization” (Silva, 2001:67). Furtado was interested in understanding the different forms that organizations could adopt, and was dazzled by the complexity of general administration bodies and how they were articulated within the scope of administrative reform. This reform represented the vanguard of ideas, and in studying administrative theory and organizations, it seemed to point to his future interest in planning: “Administrative studies are given the inflow of planning, and this is outlined on the assumption that specialized planner and distanced from the execution processes” (Silva, 2011:69).

The technical elite at the new agencies of the public administration, had in Dasp their main expression and assumed that “authoritarianism would bring an idea of control of the virtues of the state, reducing irrationalism and giving rise to more technical knowledge in the institutional apparatus” (Rabelo, 2012:82). Among the virtues of the state would be the belief in planning as a technique to achieve development, which would mark the performance of Furtado as a public manager in the following two decades.

Furtado’s fourth and final article, entitled “Theory of the Department of General Administration”, provided a note from the editor explaining his intention. The editor wrote: “The author focuses on the evolution of differential systems of general administration activities in the most advanced democratic countries, and positions Dasp and the Brazilian administrative reform of 1936 within the world framework of scientific progress that has grounded modern public administration” (Furtado, 1946:25). The democratic countries were the United States and the UK, which, according to Furtado, directly inspired the Brazilian administrative reform of 1936. Furtado recast the history of the main experiences of administrative reform in these countries, and the consequent creation of a central administrative body. With regard to scientific progress, Furtado discussed the private contributions made by Taylor and Fayol (Furtado, 1946).

In this article, Furtado analyzed the contributions of the leading writers of the day, William F. Willoughby, Harvey Walker, and John Pfiffner to understand the theory of the General Department of Administration and compare them with the ongoing administrative reform in Brazil. Furtado thus summed up the fundamental items “of the reform that established the System of General Administration in Brazil” (1946:32):

a) Articulation of the auxiliary bodies of the heads of the executive branches of all levels of government;

b) Centralization of study activities, and decentralization as a rule of activities operation;

c) Supervision of general administrative activities under the command of the same body (Dasp) and connection of roles among units of Dasp (its various sections and departments), leading to convergent systems.

Furtado referred to the Brazilian administrative reform (which had completed ten years) as “revolutionary and constructive”, but considered whether it would be necessary to consider “the total
centralization of study activities” (Furtado, 1946:32). This observation seemed to point to the need to create a central planning body with a view on the outcomes and committed to a long-term vision, not only with the means and with the short term as Dasp seemed to do. In Furtado’s view (2014:54; italics in the original):

The Dasp symbolized, in the general opinion, the dictatorial spirit that had just ended: maximum concern with efficiency and minimal concern with the ultimate outcomes pursued. Protected by this institution, the bureaucratic machine had been pushed to the extremes of rationalization, within the criteria of the so-called scientific organization of labor […] This administrative engine, so well oiled, had no clear purpose.

In this way Furtado seemed to disagree with the principles of the scientific organization of labor, and opposed the “technical elite” that had come to dominate Dasp and maintained a “depoliticized position and administrative efficiency” (Rabelo, 2013:84). Brazil lived the moment of the redemocratization of the Dutra government (1946-1950) in which Dasp was commissioned to prepare the first development program known as Plano Salte, but which, precisely because of its concerns with the means, did not reach its outcomes (Furtado, 2014).

Furtado’s fourth article in the Revista do Serviço Público marked his final work analyzing theories of organizations. At the beginning of the year following his publication, in January 1947, he left for his doctorate in economics at the Sorbonne, France, returning in August 1948 to his position in the DSP. However, he was already determined to change things. Rosa Freire D’Aguiar summed up this period of Celso as a managerial technician (D’Aguiar, 2014:16):

Until he finished the doctorate in 1948, he reflected on the theory of administration, state and democracy, theories and literature coming from the United States, organization and programming in private and state-owned enterprises, and on the needs to create planning bodies. Upon returning from the war, he started an academic activity focused on planning and budgeting classes, both in the preparatory courses for public selection processes for the position of managerial and in external seminars. One of them, in Niterói, had a hundred students; Celso gave the first class, with his colleague Eutacílio Leal.

It is clear that Furtado’s theoretical reflections on the General Department of Administration found a practical materialization during his stay in France where he witnessed the implementation of the initial phase of the Marshall Plan and the creation of the Economic Commission for Europe. This commission was a UN body headed by the economist Gunnar Myrdal, “the most unorthodox and imaginative of the members of the great Swedish school”, who preached the introduction of planning in Eastern European countries (Furtado, 2014:56). However, on his return to Brazil, Furtado found a “suffocating” environment in both Dasp and Fundação Getúlio Vargas (FGV), where he also worked. FGV had an orthodox view of the economy led by Eugênio Gudin and Otávio Bulhões. It was the latter that told Furtado that the first secretary general of the Cepal, Martinez Cabañas, would be in Brazil to select a Brazilian economist (Furtado, 2014:56).
Furtado had no hesitation in accepting Cabañas’ formal invitation to join Eclac and went to Santiago, Chile, on 11 February 1949 (Furtado, 2014). As Rosa Freire D’Aguiar defined it: “The years of education ended, the years of affirmation began” (D’Aguiar, 2014:28).

Furtado started this first period as a Dasp managerial technician and finished holding a PhD in economics. He began as a member of the “technical elite” who took over the new agencies of the Brazilian public administration, read the main theorists of scientific management and the theory of the General Department of Administration, and analyzed their effects in the US and British public administration. However, Furtado chose another way to pursue his theoretical reflection on the directions that the State should take in the planning of economic development and the necessary structure to put it into practice.

4.2 DIRECTOR OF ECLAC FOR BRAZIL: 1949-1957

As soon as he arrived at Eclac, Furtado's first task was to prepare data on the Latin American economies that would be presented at the first conference of the entity, to be held in Cuba. It was at this conference that Raúl Prebisch, then an Eclac consultant, launched what would become known as the “Havana Manifesto”, which Furtado translated and published in Brazil in the same year (Prebisch, 1949). The Havana Manifesto brought Eclac’s main ideas of center-periphery and the consequent tendency to deteriorate the terms of trade to the detriment of the primary products exported by peripheral countries. This theoretical conception ran counter to the theory of comparative advantage in international trade, based on the principles of liberal economics, which preached that Brazil should pursue its agricultural vocation (Wanderley, 2015b).

Faced with this, Eclac proposed that the state, through planning, should persuade the private sector to promote industrialization. The drive to promote development would be the industrialization by substitution of import, and the state and public managers would have a central role (Bielschovsky, 1988). The Eclac proposals consolidated the new role of the state in Latin American countries and, consequently, emphasized the need for a new profile for the public manager (Wanderley, 2015b).

The publication of the Havana Manifesto in Brazil triggered an academic debate of which Furtado participated as a member of Eclac. This time, Furtado was backed by a new theorization to oppose FGV’s liberal economists. Seminars were held to discuss new development proposals (Wanderley and Faria, 2012). In this way, Furtado promoted the circulation of new ideas about the role of the state in promoting development in an environment in which it was considered “suffocating” a few years earlier (Furtado, 2014:56).

In 1951, Eclac was made a permanent UN body, with the important support of President Vargas (then in his mandate 1951-1954). As a form of recognition, Prebisch offered Furtado the post of Director of Development (Dosman, 2011), and Furtado returned to Brazil in 1953 as president of the Group Eclac-BNDE (1953-1955), whose mission was to produce a programming project for the entire Brazilian economy for the following years (BNDE, 1953). Furtado himself, in a testimony to BNDE’s memory, made it clear that his participation in the Group also represented support for the bank: “My collaboration with BNDE has two phases. The first phase ended at the end of 1955, and the second phase started in the middle of 1958, when I joined the BNDE as a director” (Melo and Costa, 2009:104).
It is important to note that the Group was established after three economic missions sent by the US to support Brazilian development that had the logic of the liberal economy, and the consequent vision of a minimal state (Wanderley, 2015a). In his short time at FGV, before leaving for Santiago, Furtado witnessed the work of the Abbink-Bulhões Mission — which was the second of the US missions. He did not have contact with the work but for him it represented the “strange division that was in the country [and] it was symbolized on the wall, thicker than the Wall of China, which separated us from the members of the Abbink Mission” (Furtado, 2014:56). Furtado now supported by the theoretical framework developed at Eclac had elements to break “the defense of a city we knew was besieged forever” (Furtado, 2014:56).

During this same period, Furtado (1954) published Economia brasileira (contribuição à análise do seu desenvolvimento) (Brazilian economy (contribution to the analysis of its development). In this book, which he dedicated to Raúl Prebisch, Furtado used, for the first time, the theoretical tool of Eclac to understand the Brazilian economy. Cleantho Paiva Leite, in the introduction to this book, indicated that Furtado’s analytical effort showed the “need for a complete reexamination of the instruments of analysis that have hitherto been used to interpret Brazil’s economic history” (Furtado, 1954:7). Cleantho was a member of the Vargas Economic Advisory Council (1951-1954), in which the laws for the creation of BNDE, Petrobras, Capes, Eletrobras and BNB, among others were drafted (Lima, 2013). Cleantho was also a member of the Brazilian Institute of Economics, Sociology and Politics (Ibesp), predecessor of Iseb, which taught courses for public managers where Furtado was one of the lecturers (Wanderley, 2015a). Cleantho was also a mentor to the creation of Ebap and one of the articulators of the UN support to establish it. The new role of the State in the economy required new training for public managers and, therefore, Ebap was created in 1952 with the intention of providing courses on public administration to prepare the cadres of government agencies (Fischer, 1984).

It is in this context of the Vargas government (1951-1954) that national-developmentalism emerged, inspired by the dissemination of Eclac’s ideas. In the second half of the 1950s, Iseb was responsible for enriching this theoretical framework in Brazil (Abreu, 1975). National-developmentalism expanded the state’s presence in the economy and fostered the emergence of a new type of public manager. Furtado, from his position as Eclac Development Director and president of Eclac-BNDE’s Group, was the main propagator of Eclac’s ideas, which were discussed in the main training centers of public administrators such as Ibesp and Ebap (Wanderley, 2015a). Thus, we can affirm that Furtado was one of the thinkers whose theoretical and practical reflection helped to consolidate the large state-owned companies of the country (Lima, 2013).

The result of the Group’s work was a report with projections for the development of the Brazilian economy for the following seven years (Cepal, 1955). This report would be one of the bases for the Plan of Goals of president JK, which expanded the spread of Eclac’s ideas through Furtado’s work during the 1950s (Bielschowsky, 1988). Moreover, in addition to the roles of projecting Brazilian development and influencing the creation of entities to achieve this purpose, through Eclac Furtado supported teaching and research in public administration (Wanderley, 2015a).

Eclac promoted, prepared the content and sent professors to Brazil, being decisive to implement the Training Course on Problems of Economic Development (CTPDE), at the postgraduate level (Wanderley, 2015a). Now, BNDEs employees would not be the only ones to study the course, since the
main objective of the course was to “familiarize civil servants and scholars with the basic problems of economic development and with the modern methodological processes that can be used to solve them” (BNDE, 1957:57). These courses continued until 1967, with 1,111 postgraduate professionals (who worked mainly in regional development agencies) having participated in them (Wanderley, 2015a).

In addition to encouraging these courses, Furtado was also a professor: he taught a series of ten lectures in the 1957 edition of the course, which were published at the time in a book by Iseb, and later re-edited (D’Aguiar, 2012). This book was also launched by Dasp with the name Perspectiva da economia brasileira as n.15 of the series “Administration Essays” (Furtado, 1958). About the publication, Dasp stated (Furtado, 1958:1): “made with the collaboration of specialists in the various sectors of administration science and related fields, the essays aim to provide information to scholars in order to, as far as possible, overcome the lack of specialized bibliography in Portuguese language”.

In this book, Furtado aligned a development policy and designed “an idea of change that emphasized the role of technicians and the state in the elaboration of economic plans and monetary, fiscal and administrative policy” (D’Aguiar, 2012:10). This model of politics that followed the general lines of Eclac theories was contrary to what Furtado called “daunting liberalism, led by professor Eugênio Gudin” (Furtado, 2012:15). This was the “ideological battlefield” that prevailed in Rio de Janeiro, where “considerable forces were gathered in order to dominate the economic policy of JK’s future government” (Furtado, 2012:15).

Even after leaving Brazil, Furtado managed to remain influential through the creation of the “Club of Economists”, which edited the journal Econômica Brasileira, of which he became one of the directors. Through the club and the quarterly journal, Furtado maintained his influence over government agencies, since the vast majority of its participants “were economists who worked in institutions linked to the federal government, such as the BNDE, Sumoc, the Bank of Brazil, the Dasp, the IBGE, the Ministry of Finance […]” (Furtado, 2014:157).

Furtado’s activity as director of Eclac (where he could not be considered a public manager but he was actually working as if he were one) disseminating his and Eclac’s ideas around Brazil, was crucial to prepare him to take on an official position as public manager: director of BNDE. After the lectures on the Eclac’s course (Furtado, 2012), Furtado left for the post-doctoral program in Cambridge, where he finished his chef d’oeuvre: Formação Econômica do Brasil (The economic formation of Brazil) (Furtado, 2014), and from where he returned to take on the position of director of the BNDE. It was the second half of the year 1958.

4.3 DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC AGENCY: 1958-1964

With the nomination of the BNDE’s president, Lucas Lopes, for the position of Minister of Finance of the Brazilian President JK, Roberto Campos was appointed the new president of the Bank, leaving his position as director. Cleantho de Paiva Leite and Ewaldo Correia Lima — bank directors and professors at Iseb — invited Furtado to take over as director, which was accepted, with the condition that Furtado would carry out a development program in the Northeast of Brazil, which was one of Furtado’s old dream (Melo and Costa, 2009).

Furtado was working as BNDE director on a plan for the Northeast of Brazil when, in early 1959, he was invited by JK’s Chief of Staff, Ambassador Sette Câmara, to a meeting with the president and a
group of experts about that region. With the drought of 1958 and the loss of elections in the region, the government was pressed to launch a plan for the Northeast — to be run by a working group created by the government, but which never took off. It was Sette Câmara himself who urged Furtado to lead the group at the opening of the meeting. JK was so impressed by Furtado’s presentation that less than a month later he created and appointed Furtado director of the Northeast Development Council (Codeno). Furtado (Melo and Costa, 2009:113) was surprised by the president’s sudden decision: “I was a person unknown in Brazil, had studied abroad, lived abroad, had nine years of United Nations. He played all the cards at once”. Codeno, which was created specifically for this project, was the embryo of the creation of Sudene. Furtado would leave the BNDE during the Codeno administration, and he was subordinated directly to the Presidency until Congress approved the law establishing Sudene (Melo and Costa, 2009).

In order to provide Sudene with trained personnel, Furtado took to Recife the course that Eclac promoted in Rio de Janeiro (Wanderley, 2015a). The students of this course would preferably be hired to work in Sudene’s new structure: “the course is intended for candidates officially nominated by the state governments of the Northeast Region (two each state) and economists, engineers, agronomists or technicians of state entities or parastatals, appointed by their respective departments, approved in selection examinations” (Capes, 1959:16). Furtado’s inauguration speech in Sudene on January 8, 1960, showed his goals for the new institution (D’Aguiar, 2009:168; emphasis added):

Finally, it is worth noting the nature of the administrative reform in the law that established Sudene. This is the first body of the direct administration in Brazil that, in its large cadre of technicians, will barely have civil servants and the personnel will work full time […] I recognize that Sudene is not an agency of the traditional state that render services, but of a modern state that promotes development […] Sudene […] by the end of this year, will have more than one hundred well prepared technicians.

It is possible to observe that Furtado wanted to use Sudene as a vehicle to transform the role of the state, turning it into a promoter of development. These “well prepared technicians” are, in part, the graduates of the Eclac course. This is what Furtado described in a lecture at the Iseb in 1959, for officers of the army, explaining the administrative reform represented by the establishment of Sudene (D’Aguiar, 2009:35): “Sudene intends to be a renewing body with the dual objective of giving the government an instrument that will enable it to formulate a development policy for the Northeast region of Brazil and, at the same time, enable it to modify the administrative structure according to the new objectives”.

Moreover, Sudene was created in accordance with the standards issued by Eclac and disseminated in Brazil, mainly by Furtado, with personnel formed by technicians who graduated in Eclac’s training course — and this is one of Furtado’s contributions to public management.

In addition to the Eclac course, Sudene organized a number of others and spread its influence. The agency promoted courses, such as ‘municipal administration’ and ‘budget programming’, aimed at “improving the technical level of state administrations”, and more than 1,000 students were benefited (Furtado, 2014:363). Considering that Eclac’s course was at the postgraduate level, Sudene technicians had access to a better education than their peers did in private organizations (Wanderley, 2015a). Thus,
both the creation of business schools and the emergence of Eclac's and Iseb's post-graduation courses, from the 1950s onwards, are the result of the same process of linking the science of administration with economic and social development, and the consequent need for training of technicians and managers (Wanderley, Celano and Oliveira, 2018).

Furtado's goal of setting up Sudene as an “agency with a fresh new nature” was achieved, according to historian Francisco Iglesias (Furtado, 2014:14): “In the history of civil services in Brazil, Sudene is an exceptional case and an example of the lucidity of the project and the seriousness of the executive agents in the first moment […] Celso Furtado's leadership in Sudene is perhaps the most expressive page of an administrative body among us”.

Although quite busy in Sudene, Furtado did not neglect his academic production. In that period, he launched Desenvolvimento e subdesenvolvimento (Development and underdevelopment) (Furtado, 1961) in which he matured over a decade of reflections on the phenomenon of dependent development of Brazil. It is in this book that Furtado points out clearly that underdevelopment is not a stage for development (Furtado, 1961) — as argued the modernization theory created in the United States (Rostow, 1960) — but that both are part of the same phenomenon and provide feedback to each other, always to the detriment of the periphery. Hence, according to Furtado, it was necessary to analyze the phenomenon of underdevelopment with its own lenses and, consequently, the possible solutions lacked a particular analysis (Furtado, 1961).

Furtado's book also marked the beginning of Eclac's self-criticism that saw the effectiveness of industrialization substituting imports to lose momentum in Latin America. Moreover, criticisms of Eclac's theories have led to the emergence of the different currents of dependency studies and, in particular, to the Marxist theory of dependence that has been its strongest criticism. Even if Eclac's proposals represented a counterpoint to liberal theories, the proposal was still that countries should remain within the capitalist system. For Marxist theory of dependency, the only possible way out of underdevelopment was the immediate transition to a socialist regime (Wanderley, 2015b).

This was a time when all of Latin America was inclined to left wing ideologies. In Brazil João Goulart (1961-1964) came to power after the resignation of Jânio Quadros and the establishment of the parliamentary regime. As superintendent of Sudene, Furtado was invited by Goulart, at the end of 1962 to take office in a ministry without a specific designation with the mission of presenting a general plan for the country’s economy. Goulart's ultimate goal was to win the plebiscite that would restore his presidential powers (Furtado, 2014). It is noteworthy a continuity in relation to the previous period of analysis: nine years before Furtado had arrived in Brazil with the mission of elaborating a plan for the country’s economy, Goulart's mission was to win the plebiscite that would restore his presidential powers (Furtado, 2014). It is noteworthy a continuity in relation to the previous period of analysis: nine years before Furtado had arrived in Brazil with the mission of elaborating a plan for the country’s development, then as director of Eclac, which would serve as the basis for the JK’s Plan of Goals. This time, as minister, Furtado's plan would directly support the government’s action.

Furtado accepted the mission and, in only four months, and thanks to the support of his friends at BNDE, with whom he had no direct connection, he presented the “Triennial Plan for Economic and Social Development” (D’Aguiar, 2011) and, in his own words: “The BNDE was the agency with a national vision. It was within the BNDE that the general plan was made, evidently not related with the Bank's institutional vision, because I did not make any direct agreement” (Melo and Costa, 2009:119). The plan was announced on the last day of the year and the president won the plebiscite. Furtado thought that he had fulfilled his mission and that he could return to Sudene, but a few days
after the plebiscite the president created the new Ministry of Planning and invited him to lead it (D'Aguiar, 2011).

Thus, Furtado, who had begun his career as a civil servant at Dasp in 1943, in the position of assistant to the organization, exactly twenty years later became the first Ministry of Planning. However, he did not stay long in this position, for in a ministerial reform in June of that year the president exonerated him. The government had lost the political support needed to implement the Triennial Plan. However, he would later contribute again to the public administration by structuring the Ministry of Planning, a ministry that is historically connected with the figure of Celso Furtado (D'Aguiar, 2011).

The Triennial Plan became a milestone in the history of Brazilian economic thought and aimed, from two axes, to tackle the immediate problems of the country's economy, especially inflation, but without neglecting long-term development. However, the passage by the Ministry of Planning, and his support of João Goulart, reinforced the idea that Furtado was 'communist', which would serve as a pretext for the military to persecute him through an Institutional Act (AI-1), published in 1964. It is curious to note that, in this same period, acting as Superintendent of Sudene, Furtado was accused by the left wing groups to have received resources from President Kennedy's Alliance for Progress for investments in the Northeast Region, against national interest. This accusation became even stronger after Furtado was received by Kennedy in Washington (Furtado, 2014).

Furtado presided over Sudene until the military coup of 1964, which represented his contribution as a public manager. It must be clear that “there is a Sudene that was idealized by Celso Furtado until the beginning of 1964, and another, resulting from the seize of power by the military and the conservative and oligarchic groups that supported it” (Lima, 2009:223). The Sudene’s Deliberative Council, which was a political body structured by Furtado, had the presence of all the governors and representatives of the states of the Northeast. Due to the causes Sudene advocated, such as the end of the industry based on drought, Sudene was pressured by different sectors of society (Lima, 2009).

Furtado was in Recife, headquarters of Sudene, on the day of the military-business coup and, a few days later, managed to get to the airport to leave the city before the siege was announced. In exile, Furtado taught for more than twenty years at the Sorbonne in Paris. When he returned definitively to Brazil in the 1980s, he returned to serve the government as Minister of Culture. Furtado never worked in the private sector.

5. FINAL CONSIDERATIONS

This article aimed to show Celso Furtado's career as a public manager. In the period 1943-1964, it was possible to show that Furtado climbed the hierarchy of public service, reaching the position of minister of state. Also, it was possible to observe that Furtado began his academic and learner career on organizational theories. Furtado's work in the public sector occurred at a time when the country sought modernization of the State and in which the role of public organizations as well as civil servants were re-discussed. As the main disseminator of Eclac's ideas in Brazil in the 1950s and 1960s, Furtado contributed to a vision of centrality of the State and its managers in the planning and development of the country. These conceptions questioned the universality of foreign knowledge and were based on the investigation of the local reality for the construction of theoretical frameworks. Based on local reality, the role of the State and state-run organizations is recognized as a normality
of the organizational phenomenon, just as the public manager can be as (or more) important than the manager working in the private sector in the pursuit of national development.

The dissemination of Eclac’s ideas from the beginning of the 1950s came at a time when the main schools of business education were created, and thus, Furtado influenced the first wave of trained managers in Brazil. Furtado’s concern focused on training the technicians to take on the new roles that the state should play, which led him to support and teach in the postgraduate courses that Eclac promoted and help to develop in Brazil. These courses trained civil servants who worked mainly in regional development agencies.

Eclac’s conceptions were contrary to development theories emanating from the USA, which had strong advocates in Brazil. Eclac’s proposal of industrialization substituting import in order to overcome underdevelopment was countered by the defense of the so-called agricultural vocation that Brazil should pursue in order to achieve development. Underdevelopment, according to modernization theory, was considered a mere stage of development, not part of the same phenomenon that condemned Latin America to a permanent state of underdevelopment, as Celso Furtado theorized. It is clear that behind the debate on the role of the state in the economy is the dialogue between economic development and development management, which in the 1950s, led to the overlapping of economic development to the development of the technique and art of administration.

These theories supported national-developmentalism in the period investigated in this study, which led to the creation of state-controlled organizations that remain active such as BNDES, Banco do Nordeste, Petrobras, Eletrobras, Capes, among others. We can suggest that it was the theoretical clash that took place during this period — with Eclac/Furtado on the one hand and the “triumphant liberalism” on the other — that led Brazil to resist the wave of privatizations sweeping the world in the 1980s and 1990s from of the Washington Consensus. Yes, there were privatizations in Brazil, but the organizations mentioned remain under state control, while in countries like Argentina, Chile and Mexico, organizations created in that period were all privatized.

Furtado was one of the thinkers whose theoretical and practical reflection helped to consolidate the great state-owned companies in Brazil. In addition, his role as the founder and first superintendent of Sudene is one of the richest administrative experiences in the country. However, Furtado’s belief in the assertiveness of planning and the ability of the technician to promote development from the plan are subject to criticism. One could even say utopian. Furtado himself would acknowledge in the book *O mito do desenvolvimento* (The myth of development) that his quest was in fact unattainable. Thus, to show Furtado’s career as a public manager is fundamental at this moment in which we go through a redefinition of the role of the state in the economy, and in which the temptation to do the easiest — but not necessarily the best — option for a minimal state seems to gain space in the public debate. Thus, perhaps, in the future we do not need to repeat Furtado’s observation of the end of the last century: “We have never been so far from the country of which we dream of having someday”.
REFERENCES


BRASIL. Exposição de Motivos nº 2.487, de 30 de dezembro de 1939.


ANDERLEY, Sergio Eduardo P. *Desenvolvimento: ism*, descolonialidade e a geo-


WANDERLEY, Sergio Eduardo P.; CELANO, Ana; OLIVEIRA, Fátima B. Ebap e Iseb na busca por uma administração brasileira: uma imersão nos anos 1950 para iluminar o século XXI. Cadernos EBAPE.BR, no prelo, 2018.


Fernando Tenório
Professor at the Brazilian School of Public and Business Administration/FGV. E-mail: fernando.tenorio@fgv.br.

Sergio Wanderley
PhD in Administration from the Brazilian School of Public and Business Administration/FGV. E-mail: sergiow.gaz@terra.com.br.