ARTICLES

Publication and Reception of the Works of the Bakhtin Circle in Brazil: Consolidation of Dialogic Discourse Analysis / Publicação e recepção das obras do Círculo de Bakhtin no Brasil: a consolidação da análise dialógica do discurso

Débora Luciene Porto Boenavides*

ABSTRACT

In this article, we seek, based on the analysis of publications and receptions of works that comprise the referential of Dialogic Discourse Analysis (DDA) in Brazil and a resumption of the trajectory already traced by Brazilian researchers, discuss the path that led to the consolidation of DDA in the country. Thus, four phases of DDA in Brazil are listed. At the first reception phase, scattered readings were identified, based on publications of some works from the Bakhtin Circle in Russian, French, English, Spanish and Italian. The second phase, on its turn, was marked by the publication of the first Brazilian editions of the Circle's works. At the third phase, Brazilian scholars sought to systematize the concepts and methodologies present in the Circle's works. Finally, at the last phase, in which we currently are, we seek to consolidate and contextualize DDA more and more through, mainly, the publication of works translated by DDA's researchers, with critical and historical notes.

KEYWORDS: Dialogic Discourse Analysis; History of Linguistics; Periodization

RESUMO

Neste artigo, busca-se, a partir da análise das publicações e das recepções das obras que compõem o referencial da análise dialógica do discurso (ADD) no Brasil e de uma retomada da trajetória já traçada por pesquisadoras(es) brasileiras(os), discorrer sobre o percurso que levou à consolidação da ADD no país. Desse modo, listam-se quatro fases da ADD no Brasil. Na primeira fase da recepção, identificam-se leituras esparsas, realizadas a partir de publicações de algumas obras do Círculo de Bakhtin em russo, francês, inglês, espanhol e italiano. Já a segunda fase foi marcada pela publicação das primeiras edições brasileiras de obras do Círculo. Na terceira fase, procurou-se sistematizar os conceitos e metodologias presentes nas obras do Círculo. Por fim, na última fase, na qual nos encontramos atualmente, busca-se consolidar e contextualizar cada vez mais a ADD, através, principalmente, da publicação de obras traduzidas por pesquisadores da ADD, com notas críticas e históricas.

PALAVRAS-CHAVE: Análise Dialógica do Discurso; História da Linguística; Periodização

^{*} Pontifícia Universidade Católica do Rio Grande do Sul [Pontificate Catholic University of Rio Grande do Sul] - PUCRS, Escola de Humanidades, Programa de Pós-Graduação em Letras, Porto Alegre, Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil; CNPq, Proc. 140433/2018-0; http://orcid.org/0000-0002-4389-8784; professoradeboraporto@gmail.com

Initial Considerations

Dialogic Discourse Analysis, also called translinguistics (Todorov, 1984, p.24),¹ "(...) *metalinguistics, dialogic perspective,* or *dialogic discourse analysis* or, also, *Bakhtinian studies*" (Brait, 2020, p.42, emphasis added)² by the researchers who study it and use it in their analyses, was formulated from/in the writings of the members of the group named, currently, the Bakhtin Circle:³ Russian scholars Mikhail Bakhtin,⁴ Pável Medvedev⁵ and Valentin Vološinov.⁶ The writings of the Circle began to be read in Brazil

¹ TODOVOV, T. *Mikhail Bakhtin*. The Dialogical Principle. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1984.

² In Portuguese: "(...) metalinguística, perspectiva dialógica ou teoria/análise dialógica do discurso, ou, ainda, estudos bakhtinianos."

³ The expression "Bakhtin Circle" was created by the readers of the Dialogic Discourse Analysis to refer to the group of thinkers from different areas of knowledge who met with Mikhail Bakhtin between 1919 and 1929 to discuss issues of their contemporaneity. The existence of the Circle was confirmed by Mikhail Bakhtin in his interviews to Viktor Duvakin, in 1973 (Bakhtin; Duvakin, 2008). The Circle was formed by Mikhail Bakhtin, Pavel Medviedev, Valentin Volóchinov, Matvei I. Kagan, Liev. V. Pumpianski, Ivan I. Sollertinski, Maria Iudina, K. Vaguinov, Borís Zubakin e I. Kanaev. For our work, we considered the authors Mikhail Bakhtin, Pavel Medvedev and Valentin Vološinov, who had a close partnership that was reflected in the thinking on language, which is central to our research. We also consider the works produced before and after the end of the group meetings as production of the Circle, in view of the apparent dialogue between the conceptions throughout the productions of each author.

⁴ Mikhail Mikhailovich Bakhtin (1895-1975), according to *Oxford Bibliographies* (2018, intro): "was a literary theorist whose work remained obscure until the last decade of his life. Bakhtin's early published work emerged during the years of Stalinist censorship and repression (...). The group of scholars with which Bakhtin was associated began to meet in 1918 in Nevel, and then in Vitebsk on Bakhtin's move there in 1920. He was arrested in 1928, but intervention by associates saved him from being sent to a labor camp. He and his wife were sent instead to Kazakhstan. (...) Bakhtin was hired by the Mordovian Pedagogical Institute in Saransk, where he became Head of Russian and World Literature. Bakhtin moved back to Moscow in the late 1960s for medical treatment. (...) Many of the terms used by Bakhtin—carnivalesque, chronotope, dialogism, voice, monologism, genre, and addressivity—have entered the lexicon of fields in the arts, humanities, and social sciences." (Ladousa, Chaise. Mikhail Bakhtin. OBO. Retrieved from https://www.oxfordbibliographies.com/view/document/obo-9780199766567/obo-9780199766567-0186.xml?rskey=WGHOk8&result=2&q=Mikhail+Mikhailovich+Bakhtin+#firstMatch. Last Access: Apr. 19, 2022).

⁵ Pavel Nikolaevitch Medvedev (1891-1938), according to Grillo (2020, p.248), was "a theorist and historian of literature and an eminent critic. An active member of the "Cultural Renaissance" of Vitebsk, years 1910-1920, and of Bakhtin "scientific-philosophical Circle," he trained as a philologist and spent most of his life in St. Petersburg and Leningrad, where he had contact with many expressive cultural activists of the Silver Century." He is the author of *The Formal Method in Literary Scholarship* (2012 [1928]).

⁶ Valentin Vološinov (1895-1936) was one of the main members of the Bakhtin Circle. According to Sheilla Grillo and Ekaterina Volkova Américo (2017), Vološinov was accepted as a collaborating professor at the ILIAZV - *Institut Sravnítelnoi Istórii literatúr i iazykóv Západa i Vostóka*, in 1925, a position he held until 1922, when the Institute was reformulated. In that year, Vološinov "began to teach at the A. I. Guertsen Pedagogical Institute and at the Institute for the Elevation of the Qualification of Art Workers until 1934, when he had to stop working due to the worsening of his tuberculosis. He died on June 13, 1936." (Grillo; Volkova, 2017, p.278) He is the author of the books *Freudianism:* A Marxist Critique (1927) and *Marxism*

in the late 1960s (Brait, 2012b), and, within more than 50 years of reception, a great movement by researchers in the country has been observed. They sought to systematize, scrutinize and complement the theoretical and methodological issues present in the works of Bakhtin, Vološinov, and Medvedev, consolidating the Dialogic Discourse Analysis.

About the theory arising from the reading of the texts of the members of the Circle or in their own writings, two issues are worth explaining. The first issue concerns the nomenclature of the theory discussed here. In Brazil, according to Adail Sobral (2019), the nomenclature *Dialogic Discourse Analysis*⁷ was used for the first time by the researcher Beth Brait,⁸ being adopted by the Brazilian community of researchers of Bakhtinian studies, due to the need to highlight "that there was a proposal for the study of discourse of a dialogical nature that differed from all the others, therefore, a Dialogical Discourse Analysis" (Sobral, 2019, para. 6).

Luciane de Paula, a DDA scholar, in her article "Círculo de Bakhtin: uma Análise Dialógica de Discurso" ["Bakhtin Circle: a Dialogic Discourse Analysis"], states that currently, in research in the area, "Bakhtin is considered DDA precisely to distinguish him from other thinkers from other theoretical perspectives (such as Pêcheux, Foucault,

and the Philosophy of Language (1929), works sometimes attributed to Bakhtin and of essays such as "The Word in Life and the Word in Poetry" and "The Construction of the Utterance."

⁷ In Portuguese: "Análise Dialógica de Discurso."

⁸ We have not found in our search the exact date the term was first used. However, we have found, in the Preface written by Beth Brait for the book Introdução a teoria do enunciado concreto do Círculo Bakhtin/Volochinov/Medvedev [Introduction to the Theory of Concrete Utterance of the Bakhtin/Vološinov/Medvedev Circle], by Geraldo Tadeu de Souza, published in 1999, the result of his master's dissertation, supervised by Brait and argued in 1997, a mention to the Dialogic Discourse Analysis: "As a consequence of a theoretical pursuit, of a true detective work that can contribute so much to the discussion of works signed by Bakhtin and by other components of the Circle, the reflection on metalinguistics or translinguistics appears as a kind of dialogical discourse analysis, without this expression having been mentioned, neither by the scholars studied nor by Geraldo, to characterize the nature of the investigation and the construction of the conceptual principles that today, in the most different ways, have penetrated the studies on language" (Brait, 1999, p.12). In Portuguese: "Como conseqüência dessa perseguição teórica, desse verdadeiro trabalho de detetive que tanto pode colaborar para a discussão dos trabalhos assinados por Bakhtin e por outros componentes do círculo, a reflexão sobre a metalingüística ou translinguística aparece como uma espécie de análise dialógica do discurso, sem que essa expressão tenha sido mencionada, nem pelos pensadores estudados e nem por Geraldo, para caracterizar a natureza da investigação e a construção dos princípios conceituais que hoje, das mais diferentes maneiras, tem penetrado os estudos sobre a linguagem."

⁹ In Portuguese: "que havia uma proposta de estudo de discurso de cunho dialógico que se diferenciava de todas as outras, logo, uma Análise Dialógica do Discurso."

Maingueneau, Charaudeau, Amossy in the French DA, for example), without erasing the singularity of their theoretical positions" (2013, p.249).¹⁰

The nomenclatures *Dialogic Discourse Analysis* and *Dialogic Discourse Theory*, *Dialogic Perspective*, *Bakhtinian Studies* and *Bakhtinian Theory* arise, then, from the reading of the works of the Bakhtin Circle. Metalinguistics, on the other hand, was a nomination given by Bakhtin in the texts *O problema do texto na linguística, na filologia e em outras ciências humanas* [*The Problem of the Text in Linguistics, Philology and Other Human Sciences*] (2003b [1959-1961]) and *Problemas da poética de Dostoiévski* [*Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics*] (2002[1963]).¹¹

The second issue concerns the fact that the reception of the works of the Bakhtin Circle in Brazil had had, until then, four distinct phases, which certainly generated different readings of the work. ¹² As Beth Brait (2012b, p.216) depicts, the tendency we

¹⁰ In Portuguese: "Bakhtin como ADD exatamente para distingui-lo de outros pensadores de outras perspectivas teóricas (como Pêcheux, Foucault, Maingueneau, Charaudeau, Amossy na AD francesa, por exemplo), sem apagar a singularidade de suas posições teóricas."

¹¹ The titles correspond to the Brazilian version of the English texts, respectively: BAKHTIN, M. M. The Problem of the Text in Linguistics, Philology, and the Human Sciences: An Experiment in Philosophical Analysis. In: *Speech Genres and Other Late Essays*. Translated by Vern W. McGee. Edited by Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1986; BAKHTIN, M. *Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics*. 8th printing. Translated by Caryl Emerson. Minneapolis, MN, University of Minnesota Press, 1984.

¹² Researcher Luciane de Paula, in an interview to the magazine Consoante (2021, para. 3), shows that "The Circle had an impact, not only in Brazil, but throughout the world, in dribs and drabs and, somehow chaotically, because there was no access to their texts. The files had been opened after [the authors' death] and the Circle texts ended up reaching us according to the possibilities." In Portuguese: "O Círculo teve uma repercussão, não só no Brasil, mas no mundo todo, a conta-gotas e de certa forma caótica, porque não se tinha o acesso a seus textos. Os arquivos foram abertos depois [da morte dos autores] e os textos do Círculo acabaram chegando a nós conforme foi possível." In the interview, the scholar divides the reception into three phases, in a very organized way: the first reception phase, between the 1970s and 1990s, had as characteristics a) exchanged authorship, b) access to the material in a non-chronological way, c) indirect translations, d) access to the texts through some intellectuals who had access to what was being discussed in Europe, e) Military Dictatorship in Brazil, "a time when communication and expression were studied in schools, still far from reflecting on idiom and language." In Portuguese: "momento em que nas escolas estudava-se comunicação e expressão, ainda longe de se refletir sobre língua e linguagem"; the second reception phase, between 2000 and 2010, characterized by the "process of direct translations and authorship separations." In Portuguese: "processo de traduções diretas e separações de autorias," and the beginning "of what Beth Brait calls Dialogic Discourse Analysis as a way of marking our place, the way we look at discourse, since here Bakhtin's studies are part of the discursive field." In Portuguese: "daquilo que Beth Brait chama de Análise Dialógica de Discurso como uma forma de marcar o nosso lugar, o jeito que a gente olha o discurso, já que aqui os estudos de Bakhtin fazem parte da seara discursiva"; the third reception phase, from the years 2010 to 2020, in which we had greater access "to direct translations with reviews, for example, by Paulo Bezerra, Sheila Grillo and Ekaterina Vólkova Américo, who, in addition to being translators, are scholars who think critically about what they translate." In Portuguese: "a traduções diretas com críticas, por exemplo, de Paulo Bezerra, Sheila Grillo e Ekaterina Vólkova Américo, que além de tradutores, são estudiosos que pensam criticamente aquilo que traduzem." Although we agree with the

observe, of making new or different reflections on the works of the Circle "(...) is supported by the discoveries made from archives, from which the publication *Collected Works* (Botcharóv *et al.*, 1997, 2000, 2002, 2003, 2012; Popova, 2008) is an essential product." In addition, regarding the reception of the Circle's ideas in Brazil, Carlos Alberto Faraco in *Linguagem & diálogo: as ideias linguísticas do Círculo de Bakhtin [Language & Dialog: Linguistic Ideas of the Bakhtin Circle], states that*

In addition to the confusion surrounding the authorship of certain texts published in the 1920s, the reception of the Bakhtin Circle's work, as it re-entered the scene from the mid-1960s onwards, was, to say the least, quite tumultuous. (...)

In Brazil, the reception of the Circle's ideas also had its peculiarities. In addition to some important translation problems, the thought of the Circle, quite often and for many years, was identified almost exclusively with the book *Marximo e Filosofia da Linguagem* [*Marxism and the Philosophy of Language*], ¹⁴ the first to be published in Portuguese (in 1979) (Faraco, 2009, pp.14-15). ¹⁵

Thus, we understand that tracing a path for the reception of the works of the Bakhtin Circle in Brazil could be a step towards organizing the chaos about the reception of Bakhtinian thought in the country, although we defend the importance and validity of the readings carried out in all phases of development that we shall deal with here. This trajectory has been addressed by several researchers in Brazil, such as Beth Brait, Clara Ornellas, Carlos Alberto Faraco, Luciane de Paula, Adail Sobral, Sheila Grillo, among others. Thus, in this article, we seek to trace the Brazilian path of Dialogic Discourse Analysis (DDA), based on the analysis of publications and receptions of works that compose the DDA's reference in the country and from a resumption of the trajectory that has already been traced by Brazilian researchers.

Bakhtiniana, São Paulo, 17 (4): 109-142, Oct./Dec. 2022.

division made by the author, we add, to her analysis, one more phase, of the first contacts of Brazilian readers with the works, not yet translated in the country.

¹³ In Portuguese: "(...) está respaldada pelas descobertas feitas a partir de arquivos, dos quais as *Obras reunidas* (Botcharóv *et al.*, 1997, 2000, 2002, 2003, 2012; Popova, 2008) são produto essencial."

¹⁴ VOLOŠINOV, V. N. *Marxism and the Philosophy of Language*. Trad. Ladislav Matejka and R. Titunik. Translator's Preface.Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1973.

¹⁵ In Portuguese: "Além da confusão em torno da autoria de certos textos publicados nos anos 1920, a recepção da obra do Círculo de Bakhtin, quando de sua reentrada em cena de meados da década de 1960 em diante, foi, para dizer o menos, bastante tumultuada. (...) No Brasil, a recepção das ideias do Círculo teve também suas peculiaridades. Além de não poucos problemas de tradução, o pensamento do Círculo, com bastante frequência e durante muitos anos, foi identificado quase exclusivamente ao livro Marxismo e filosofia da linguagem, o primeiro a ser publicado em português (em 1979)."

In order to contextualize our readings and glimpse the path taken by researchers from our country, in this article, we seek to discuss the reception phases of the works of the Bakhtin Circle in Brazil, which, in our view, contributed to the consolidation of Dialogic Discourse Analysis in the country. We understand that historicizing the theory used by us is consistent with the proposal of the theory itself, since active dialogic understanding requires the insertion of the object to be understood in a dialogic context, which extends to the past and the future without limits (Bakhtin, 1986).¹⁶

The article is divided into four sections, in which we will approach the four reception phases of the works of the Bakhtin Circle in the country identified in our research. Namely: the first phase, between the years 1960 and 1978, in which sparse readings of the works were conducted, made from editions in Spanish, Italian, French and English; the second phase, which began with the publication of Marxism and the Philosophy of Language, ¹⁷ the Circle's first book translated in the country, in 1979, in which the first Brazilian editions of some works by Bakhtin and Vološinov were published; the third, started in 2001 with the publication of Freudismo [Freudianism], 18 in which we observe the increase of unpublished editions of the works of the Circle in Brazil, as well as in the works subsidized by the theory of the Circle, the outline of a Dialogic Discourse Analysis; and the fourth phase, in which we currently are, which started in 2012 with the publication of O método formal nos estudos literários [The Formal Method in Literary Scholarship],19 in which we perceive an attempt to consolidate and contextualize the Dialogic Discourse Analysis, either based on reviews of the works of the Circle, in which we perceive an effort to provide the readers with the context of production of the works and explanations about the translated terms, or theoretical studies, which seek to systematize, scrutinize and complement theoretical and methodological issues present in the writings of the authors of the Circle.

-

¹⁶ BAKHTIN, M. Toward a Methodology for the Human Sciences. In: *Speech Genres & Other Late Essays*. Translated by Vern W. McGee and Edited by Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1986. pp.159-177.

¹⁷ For reference, see footnote 14.

¹⁸ VOLOŠINOV, V.N. *Freudianism*. A Marxist Critique. Translated by I.R. Titunik and edited in collaboration with Neal H. Bruss. New York, San Francisco, London: Academic Press, 1976.

¹⁹ BAKHTIN, M. M./MEDVEDEV, P. N. *The Formal Method in Literary Scholarship*. A Critical Introduction to Sociological Poetics. Translated by Albert J. Wehrle. Baltimore and London: The John Hopkins University Press, 1978.

1 First Reception Phase: Sparse Readings

The first reception phase of the Bakhtinian work in Brazil is related to the initial reception of the work, still without translation in the country, in the 1960s. About this phase, in the article *Mikhail Bakhtin no Brasil: primeiras repercussões* [Mikhail Bakhtin in Brazil: First Repercussions], Ornellas (2010) states that the professor of Russian language and literature at the University of São Paulo (USP), Boris Schnaiderman, was one of the forerunners of Bakhtin's ideas in Brazil. According to Ornellas, Boris Schnaiderman "had his first contact with Bakhtinian thought through reading Problemas da poética de Dostoiévski [*Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics*]²⁰ in the Italian edition," ^{21;22} and began to use it as a reference in his courses, evidently after 1971, ²³ in his undergraduate and graduate literature classes.

Schnaiderman (1997, p.16) points out how difficult this first phase was, since Brazil was under a military regime: "In 1964, Russian bookstores in our country had all their books removed for 'examination,' in a true military operation, which would end up in pure and simple incineration."²⁴ According to Ornellas,

This passage attests to the difficulty of accessing the works of the Russian thinker in Brazil during the dictatorship and, ironically, the precursor of dialogism "arrives" in the country when the monologic-authoritarian discourse imposed the silence and subservience of the people to oppressive military commands. Bakhtin's ideas had an impact on researchers in dictatorial Brazil, insofar as his texts allowed them to perceive the importance of dialogism to understand not only the verbal text, but also the extra-verbal context and, thereafter, build a new vision of men as eminently social beings and, therefore, a product of their ideological relations (Ornellas, 2010, para. 4).²⁵

²⁰ For reference, see footnote 11.

²¹ According to Adriana Pucci Penteado de Faria e Silva (2011, p.10), "The book PDP, in its 1963 version, was translated into Italian by G. Garritano and published by Einaudi in 1968." In Portuguese: "O livro PPD, em sua versão de 1963, foi traduzido para o italiano por G. Garritano e publicado pela Einaudi em 1968."

²² In Portuguese: "teve seu primeiro contato com o pensamento bakhtiniano através da leitura de *Problemas da poética de Dostoiévski* na edição italiana."

²³ According to the syllabus of USP courses consulted by Clara Ávila Ornellas.

²⁴ In Portuguese: "Em 1964, as livrarias russas em nosso país tiveram todos os seus livros retirados para 'exame', numa verdadeira operação militar, que acabaria em incineração pura e simples."

²⁵ In Portuguese: "Atesta-se neste trecho a dificuldade de acesso às obras do pensador russo no Brasil da ditadura e, ironicamente, o precursor do dialogismo "chega" ao país quando o discurso monológico-autoritário impunha o silêncio e a subserviência do povo aos comandos militares opressores. As idéias de Bakhtin causaram impacto nos pesquisadores do Brasil ditatorial, na medida em que seus textos permitiram perceber a importância do dialogismo para entender não apenas o texto verbal, mas também o contexto

We emphasize, however, that in this first phase, the Bakhtinian readings focused mainly on the literary issues present in the works, such as, for example, the urge to consider, in the analyses, the historical conditions in which literary texts were written (Schnaiderman, 1983), even if aspects of language were perceived, such as the issue that every word presupposes an interlocutor. Theory was not used for the analysis of discourses of other kinds, as it is done today for media, academic, everyday discourses, etc. However, in this period, some studies were published in Brazil using Bakhtinian concepts, such as *Saudades do carnaval: introdução à crise da cultura* [Missing Carnival: An Introduction to the Cultural Crisis], published in 1972 by the literary critic and sociologist José Guilherme Merquior. In his preface to the work Problemas da Poética de Dostoiéviski [Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics], entitled "Uma obra à prova do tempo" ["A Work to the Test of Time"], Paulo Bezerra argues that the "first contributions to the dissemination of Bakhtin in the specific field of reflection on literature and culture came from José Guilherme Merquior and from Professor Boris Schnaiderman" (2013, p.XII). ²⁷

Considering the statements we have read, such as those by Boris Schnaiderman, Paulo Bezerra, Beth Brait, Carlos Alberto Faraco and Adail Sobral (2019, para. 3), who claims to have had the first contact "with the writings of the Bakhtin Circle while still in undergraduate studies, in the early 1970s, at the Federal University of Bahia, in a Sociolinguistics course," we verified that the works of the Circle were already present, even if in an indirect and little diffused way, in the Brazilian linguistic academic discussions. According to Sobral, his first contact was with the "book by Marcellesi and Gardin, *Introdução à sociolinguística* [*Introduction to Sociolinguístics*], Portuguese edition, which brought the idea of a social linguistics and mentioned Bakhtin."^{29;30}

-

extra-verbal e, a partir daí, construir uma nova visão do homem como ser eminentemente social e, portanto, produto de suas relações ideológicas."

²⁶ For reference, see footnote 11.

²⁷ In Portuguese: "primeiras contribuições para a divulgação de Bakhtin para nós no campo específico da reflexão sobre literatura e cultura vieram de José Guilherme Merquior e do mestre Boris Schnaiderman."

²⁸ In Portuguese: "com os escritos do Círculo de Bakhtin ainda na graduação, no início da década de 1970, na Universidade Federal da Bahia, na disciplina Sociolinguística."

²⁹ In Portuguese: "livro de Marcellesi e Gardin, *Introdução à Sociolinguística*, edição portuguesa, que trazia a ideia de uma linguística social e mencionava Bakhtin."

³⁰ We emphasize, however, that the Portuguese edition of the work *Introdução à Sociolinguística* [Introduction to Sociolinguistics] dates from 1975, and that, therefore, the contact of Professor Adail Sobral must have taken place in the late 1970s, which is possible, as he had taken his graduation between 1974

Regarding the arrival of Vološinov and Bakhtin in Brazil in the 1970s, Brait (2012b, p.219) states that "(...) three texts arrived in Brazil at that time, motivating readings and discussions in courses and meetings"³¹: the 1968 Italian edition of *Dostoievsk: poética e stilística* [*Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics*], ³² the French edition of the same work, from 1970, *Problèmes de la poétique de Dostoïevski* and *La poétique de Dostoïevski* and also the 1970 French edition of *L'ouvre de François Rabelais et le culture populaire au Moyen Age et sous la Renaissance* [Rabelais and his World]. ³⁴ According to Brait, "(...) before the decade was over, *Esthétique et Théorie du Roman* arrived in Brazil,"³⁵ the 1978 French edition of *Speech Genres and Other Late Essays*. ³⁶

Beth Brait marks the arrival in Brazil, in 1976, of Valentin N. Vološinov's work *El signo ideológico y la filosofia del linguaje* [*Marxism and the Philosophy of Language*],³⁷ of "one of the epistemological frameworks for the (future) emergence of what is now conventionally called, as previously stated, *Metalinguistics*, *Dialogic Perspective* or *Dialogic Theory/Discourse Analysis*, or even *Bakhtinian Studies*" (2020, p.42).³⁸ According to Brait (2020), among the first readers of this work were Carlos Alberto Faraco, Carlos Vogt, João Wanderley Geraldi and Sírio Possenti. She also points out that Faraco, based on the reading of this work and of *Produzione linguistica e ideologia sociale* [*Linguistic Production and Social Ideology*], by Augusto Ponzio (1973), presented, in 1978, at the Federal University of Paraná (UFPR), one of his first works on the Bakhtinian theory.

and 1977, which does not invalidate the importance of the information given by the professor for our systematization. We also emphasize that the cited work mentions only Vološinov, attributing to him the work *Marxism and Philosophy of Language*, which was an unusual fact at the time that may have led Professor Adail Sobral to believe that the authors were referring to Bakhtin. Marcellesi and Gardin reference the English edition: VOLOŠINOV, V. N. *Marxism and the Philosophy of Language*; Seminar Press Inc. Berkley Square House, London, 1973; (Trad. de *Markizm i filosofija jazyka*, Leningrad, 1930). ³¹ In Portuguese: "(...) três textos chegaram ao Brasil naquele momento, motivando leituras e discussões em cursos e encontros."

³² For reference, see footnote 11.

³³ For reference, see footnote 11.

³⁴ BAKHTIN, M. *Rabelais and His World*. Translated by Helene Iswolsky. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1984.

³⁵ In Portuguese: "(...) antes que a década acabasse, chegava ao Brasil Esthétique et théorie du roman."

³⁶ BAKHTIN, M. *Speech Genres & Other Late Essays*. Translated by Vern W. McGee and Edited by Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1986.

³⁷ For reference, see footnote 14.

³⁸ In Portuguese: "um dos marcos epistemológicos para o surgimento (futuro) do que hoje se convencionou denominar, como afirmado anteriormente, *metalinguística*, *perspectiva dialógica* ou *teoria/análise dialógica do discurso* ou, ainda, *estudos bakhtinianos*."

Through the reports found, we observed that the readings in this first phase of reception were done in a restricted and sparse way, mainly from translations into Italian, French, Spanish and English, being proposed in undergraduate and graduate courses only in a few courses in Brazilian universities, such as those taught by Professor Boris Schnaiderman and other disciplines at the University of São Paulo (USP), such as that of Prof. Dr. Terezinha A. P.A. Lopes' (Ornellas, 2010). However, even considering the few readings carried out at the time, Clara Ávila Ornellas' expositions about the fact that Bakhtin's ideas had caused an impact on researchers in dictatorial Brazil seem legitimate to us. Even under the military dictatorship, the first translations and editions of Bakthin's works were carried out in the country, which, in our view, marked the beginning of the second phase of reception of the works of the Bakhtin Circle.

2 Second Phase: The First Brazilian Editions

In the *second reception phase* of the Bakhtin Circle's work in Brazil, we have the Brazilian edition of some works. ³⁹ The first work to be published in Brazil was *Marxismo e filosofia da linguagem* [*Marxism and the Philosophy of Language*] ⁴⁰ (*MFL*), in 1979, by Hucitec, in the collection *Linguagem* [*Language*], organized by Carlos Vogt. The work was translated from the French edition of 1977 and supplemented from the American translation of 1973. ⁴¹ According to professor Adriana Pucci Penteado de Faria e Silva (2011), in her article "0,5 mm: a nova edição brasileira de Problemas da poética de Dostoiévski" ["0.5 mm: the New Brazilian Edition of Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics"], published in the *Bakhtiniana: a Journal of Discourse Studies*, the fact that the publication of *MFL* took place in Brazil before the publication of the other works of the Circle, which reverses the order of publications in the rest of the West, "makes Bakhtin (Vološinov) known [in Brazil] first as a philosopher of language" (Silva, 2011, p.10). ⁴²

In their article "Marxismo e filosofia da linguagem: a recepção de Bakhtin e o Círculo no Brasil" ["Marxism and the Philosophy of Language: the Reception of Bakhtin

³⁹ All the first editions of the Circle's works published in Brazil in this and in the next phases presented here can be observed in the summary table present in Appendix 1 of this article.

⁴⁰ For reference, see footnote 14.

⁴¹ Cf. "Translator's note."

⁴² In Portuguese: "faz com que Bakhtin (Volochinov) seja conhecido [no Brasil] antes como filósofo da linguagem."

and the Circle in Brazil"], the researchers Beth Brait and Maria Helena Cruz Pistori present the aforementioned study by Ornellas, which, according to the authors, reveals that "the mentions of Bakhtin – to him solely -, in the courses taught at USP at the time, happened in literature, comparative literature and literary theory." (Brait; Pistori, 2020, p.38)⁴³ In the subjects taught at PUC-SP, according to the researchers, "references to Bakhtin and Vološinov appear especially in the bibliography of disciplines in the area of Communication and Semiotics, expanding the scope of interest in the work of the Circle at the time of the first translation" (Brait; Pistori, 2020, p.39).⁴⁴

The fact that there were mentions of Bakhtin in courses in the literary field before the first Brazilian editions the Circle's works, that is, at the time we defend being the first phase of reception of the work, according to the researchers Brait and Pistori, "may indicate the genesis of a certain imaginary that Bakhtin only dealt with literature, an aspect that, to a certain extent, remains until today in some media." (Brait; Pistori, 2020, p.38)⁴⁵ However, the fact that, right at the beginning of the second reception phase, MFL appears in the bibliography of courses in the area of Communication and Semiotics at PUC-SP may be an indication of what Adriana Pucci Penteado de Faria e Silva pointed out, that the order of the Brazilian editions of the Circle's works was different from those of the rest of the West. This fact that may have given rise to the relevance we now attribute to the works of Bakhtin, Vološinov and Medvedev in the linguistic and discursive fields. This relevance has even motivated the creation/definition of a new theory, based on the theoretical-methodological set present in the Circle's texts, currently named Dialogic Discourse Analysis/Theory.

Regarding the context of the time of *MFL*'s first edition in Brazil, the authors emphasize that

From a political point of view, radically simplified here, in 1979 Brazil was governed by João Figueiredo, the 30th president of Brazil and the last one of the military era. His hallmark was the continuity of the

Bakhtiniana, São Paulo, 17 (4): 109-142, Oct./Dec. 2022.

⁴³ In Portuguese: "as menções a Bakhtin - unicamente a ele -, nas disciplinas ministradas na USP, à época, aconteciam na literatura, literatura comparada e na teoria literária."

⁴⁴ In Portuguese: "as referências a Bakhtin e Volochínov aparecem especialmente na bibliografia de disciplinas da área de Comunicação e Semiótica, ampliando o escopo de interesse pela obra do Círculo no momento da primeira tradução."

⁴⁵ In Portuguese: "pode indiciar a gênese de certo imaginário de que Bakhtin só tratou da literatura, aspecto que, em certa medida, permanece até hoje em alguns meios."

"slow, gradual and safe" political opening of the previous government, evidenced in some events: foundation of the National Association of Newspapers, with the objective of defending the freedom of the press; sanction of the General and Unrestricted Amnesty law for all those who had committed political crimes and had had their political rights revoked during the dictatorship; return of political exiles; severe political and economic crisis (Brait; Pistori, 2020, pp.37-38).⁴⁶

Thus, Brazil at the time was marked by an *expansion* of freedom of thought, a fact that justifies the publication of the Russian work even during a period of military dictatorship (1964-1985).

The edition of *Marxismo e Filosofia da Linguagem* [*Marxism and the Philosophy of Language*]⁴⁷ had a translators' note of a paragraph, in which the translators informed about the text from which the translation was verted and thanked Lucy Seki, for helping to consult the work in Russian, and Modesto Carone Netto, for helping with the passages in German. The book has a brief preface by the Russian linguist Roman Jakobson and a presentation by the French linguist Marina Yaguello, who, although recognized in the European context, due to her work *Les mots et les femmes* [*The words and the Women*] (1978), was still little known in Brazil (Brait; Pistori, 2020). The cover of this first edition depicts an image of an open hand, pierced in white, over a green circle, which, in later editions of the same publisher, has been de-configured, as Brait and Pistori (2020) point out.

The Circle's second work published in Brazil was *Problemas da poética de Dostoiévski* [*Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics*]⁴⁸ (*PPD*), in 1981, by Forense Universitária, "translated from the third Russian edition [...] by Paulo Bezerra, without a preface or presentation of the editors or the translator in the body of the book" (Silva, 2011, p.13).⁴⁹ However, although it did not have a preface or presentation, the edition had

⁴⁶ In Portuguese: "De um ponto de vista político, aqui radicalmente simplificado, em 1979 o Brasil era governado por João Figueiredo, 30° presidente do Brasil e último da era militar. Sua marca foi a continuidade da abertura política "lenta, gradual e segura" do governo anterior, evidenciada em alguns acontecimentos: fundação da Associação Nacional de Jornais, com o objetivo de defender a liberdade de imprensa; sanção da lei da anistia geral e irrestrita para todos os que cometeram crimes políticos e tiveram seus direitos políticos cassados durante a ditadura; volta de exilados políticos; forte crise política e econômica."

⁴⁷ For reference, see footnote 14.

⁴⁸ For reference, see footnote 11.

⁴⁹ In Portuguese: "traduzida da terceira edição russa [...] com tradução de Paulo Bezerra, sem prefácio ou apresentação dos editores ou do tradutor no corpo de livro."

a flap written by Paulo Bezerra, functioning, according to Beth Brait (2021), as a kind of frame-text for the work, which, in addition to its direct translation from Russian, marks its differentiation from the *MFL* edition, translated from French, which had reviews by foreign authors.

In the same year (1981), *MFL* had its second edition published. In 1987, *Cultura popular na Idade Média e no Renascimento:* o contexto de François Rabelais [*Rabelais and his World*] (*CPIMR*),⁵⁰ by Mikhail Bakhtin (translated from French) was published and, in 1988, *Questões de literatura e de estética*: a teoria do romance [*The Dialogical Imagination: Four Essays*]⁵¹ (*OLE*) (translated from Russian).

The work *Estética da Criação Verbal* [Speech Genres and Other Late Essays]⁵² (ECV), by Mikhail Bakhtin, also had its first edition in this phase, in 1992, translated by Maria Ermantina Galvão Gomes Pereira from French. The work was edited by Martins Fontes.

We emphasize that the Circle's works published in this phase still had few (or no) translation notes and lacked substantive critical prefaces, perhaps due to the fact that there was still no in-depth study of the theory by the translators, which justifies the fact that some passages are translated differently from the translations that exist today and that, for example, the authorship of *Marxism and the Philosophy of Language* was attributed to Mikhail Bakhtin and not to Valentin Vološinov, ⁵³ following the notes made by Roman Jakobson, a researcher who prefaces the first Brazilian edition.

The works were also published out of the original writing order. Namely: *Marximo e filosofia da linguagem [Marxism and the Philosophy of Language*],⁵⁴ the first work of the Circle with a Brazilian edition, was originally published in 1929. The second work, *Problemas da poética de Dostoiévski [Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics*],⁵⁵ dates from 1963. The third, *Cultura popular na Idade Média e no Renascimento:* o contexto de

⁵⁰ For reference, see footnote 34.

⁵¹ BAKHTIN, M. M. *The Dialogic Imagination*: Four Essays. Translated by Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1981.

⁵² For reference, see footnote 36.

⁵³ The authorship of V. Vološinov is currently almost indisputable, so much so that, in the last edition of the work, released in 2017 by Editora 34, we observe the attribution of authorship exclusively to Valentin Vološinov.

⁵⁴ For reference, see footnote 14.

⁵⁵ For reference, see footnote 11.

François Rabelais [Rabelais and his World],⁵⁶ from 1965. The fourth, Questões de literatura e de estética: a teoria do romance [The Dialogical Imagination: Four Essays],⁵⁷ gathers texts from 1924 to 1975. Estética da criação verbal [Speech Genres and Other Late Essays],⁵⁸ on the other hand, gathers texts from 1919 to 1971 and O freudismo [Freudianism: A Marxist Critique]⁵⁹ was written in 1927.

In this phase, theses and dissertations were written and many reviews or works based on the thought of the Circle were published. The first events on Bakhtinian thought were also organized, the first being held at the Federal University of Paraná, in Curitiba, 60 in 1987 (ORNELLAS, 2010). As a result of the meeting, according to Clara Ávila Ornellas, the book *Uma introdução a Bakhtin* [*An Introduction to Bakhtin*] was published in 1988, with texts by Carlos Alberto Faraco, Cristovão Tezza, Beth Brait, Luiz Dagobert de Aguirra Roncari and Rosse Marye Bernardi.

Cristovão Tezza, in the article "Bakhtin - uma memória pessoal" ["Bakhtin - a Personal Memory"] (2021, pp.37-38), argues that

at the turn of the 1970s to 1980s, the Brazilian academic horizon in the area of Modern Languages, under the influence of the modernization of linguistic studies, was positively immersing itself in formal theories of language, generally based on highly prestigious structuralist assumptions, in a broad confluence of many strands.⁶¹

Thus, research in Brazil at the time, according to the author, was marked, in Literature, by the proposals of Russian Formalism and, in Linguistics, by the consolidation as a cutting-edge science, finding "a fertile and receptive territory, coinciding with the great expansion of our higher education, and to a large extent updating our critical repertoire well before the country itself was structurally modernized, which

⁵⁶ For reference, see footnote 34.

⁵⁷ For reference, see footnote 51.

⁵⁸ For reference, see footnote 36.

⁵⁹ For reference, see footnote 18.

⁶⁰ In our searches, we did not find the name of the event. However, we know that it was organized by renowned researchers in Bakhtinian studies, such as Beth Brait, Carlos Alberto Faraco, Cristóvão Tezza, Luís Roncari and Rosse Marye Bernardi.

⁶¹ In Portuguese: "na passagem dos anos 1970 para 1980, o horizonte acadêmico brasileiro da área de Letras, sob o influxo da modernização dos estudos linguísticos, estava positivamente imergindo nas teorias formais da linguagem, em geral fundamentadas em pressupostos estruturalistas de grande prestígio, numa ampla confluência de muitas vertentes."

has been our rule until today" (Tezza, 2021, p.39).⁶² According to the author, it was in this scenario that he has received a copy of a French edition of Bakhtin's *O discurso na poesia e o discurso no romance* [Discourse in Life and Discourse in Art].⁶³

Tezza shows how, at the time of his first readings, which took place in the phase that we call here the second reception phase, there was an attempt to define Bakhtin: to what extent he was a Marxist, to what extent he was a formalist. This attempt served, in the academy, both to exalt the work of Mikhail Bakhtin and to demonize him.

We understand that both the interest in the texts and the curiosity arising from the lack of definition of the author's writing context (and the other authors of the Circle) and the lack of access to manuscripts and to many texts, still pending translation, made Brazilian researchers increasingly seek to understand the works, organizing their assumptions, outlining the paths for a Dialogic Discourse Analysis. Thus, we move on to the third reception phase of the Bakhtin Circle's works in Brazil.

3 Third Phase: The Outline of DDA

In the third reception phase of the Bakhtin Circle's work in Brazil, discourse studies using the Circle's works as theoretical basis and the systematic translations and publications of the works of the Bakhtin Circle in the country increased, in the years 2002 to 2011, with an increase in the prevalence of prefaces and translation notes written by *national* researchers in the field. At the Department of Linguistics at USP, for example, Geraldo Tadeu Souza had his master's dissertation supervised by Beth Brait. The dissertation originated the work *Introdução à teoria do enunciado concreto do círculo Bakhtin/Volochinov/Medevedev* [Introduction to the Theory of the Concrete Utterance of the Bakhtin/Vološinov/Medvedev Circle], published by Humanitas in 1999. The work seeks to systematize and organize, theoretically and methodologically, what Geraldo Tadeu Souza calls the Theory of the Concrete Utterance. In her preface to the work, Beth Brait points out that

⁶² In Portuguese: "um território fértil e receptivo, coincidente com a grande expansão do nosso ensino superior, e em boa medida atualizando o nosso repertório crítico bem antes que o próprio país estruturalmente se modernizasse, o que vem sendo até hoje a nossa regra."

⁶³ BAKHTIN, M. VOLOSHINOV, V. Discourse in Life and Discourse in Art. Concerning Sociological Poetics. *In: Freudianism:* A Marxist Critique. Transl. by Irwin R. Titunik, New York: Academic Press, 1976.

As a consequence of this theoretical pursuit, of this true detective work that can contribute so much to the discussion of the works signed by Bakhtin and by other members of the Circle, the reflection on metalinguistics or translinguistics appears as a kind of *dialogic discourse analysis*, without this expression having been mentioned, either by the studied thinkers or by Geraldo, to characterize the nature of the investigation and the construction of the conceptual principles that today, in many different ways, have penetrated the studies on language (Brait, 1999, p.12, emphasis added).⁶⁴

Based on Brait's (1999) considerations, the nomenclature Dialogic Discourse Analysis was already in use in research carried out at USP, which sought to outline DDA.

Also in the Postgraduate Studies Program in Applied Linguistics and Language Studies at PUC-SP, many researches were conducting theories based on works from the Circle, including using the denominations Dialogic Discourse Analysis/Theory, as seen, for example, in the doctoral theses supervised by Maria Cecilia Pérez de Souza-e-Silva, at the Pontificate Catholic University of São Paulo (PUC-SP), such as the one by Marcos A. Moura-Vieira, entitled *A atividade, o discurso e a clínica: uma análise dialógica do trabalho médico [Activity, discourse and clinic: a Dialogic Analysis of Medical Work]*, argued in 2002, which contained in its title the expression *dialogic analysis*, and that of Maria da Glória Corrêa di Fanti, entitled *Discurso, Trabalho & Dialogismo: a atividade jurídica e o conflito trabalhador/patrão [Discourse, Work & Dialogism: the legal activity and the labourer/boss conflict]*, argued in 2004, in which, in the first chapter of part III, the author presents "Theoretical-methodological notations: for a dialogic analysis of work/discourse" (Di Fanti, 2004, p.127).⁶⁵

The systematic publication of the works of the Bakhtin Circle in this period can be seen in Appendix 1. However, we will try to show how, in the third reception phase, access to the Circle's works in the country increased significantly, mainly through Brazilian editions, published in Portuguese (many still indirectly translated from European and American editions).

⁶⁴ In Portuguese: "Como conseqüência dessa perseguição teórica, desse verdadeiro trabalho de detetive que tanto pode colaborar para a discussão dos trabalhos assinados por Bakhtin e por outros componentes do círculo, a reflexão sobre a metalingüística ou translinguística aparece como uma espécie de *análise dialógica do discurso*, sem que essa expressão tenha sido mencionada, nem pelos pensadores estudados e nem por Geraldo, para caracterizar a natureza da investigação e a construção dos princípios conceituais que hoje, das mais diferentes maneiras, tem penetrado os estudos sobre a linguagem."

⁶⁵ In Portuguese: "Notações teórico-metodológicas: para uma análise dialógica do trabalho/discurso."

The first work to be published in this phase was O freudismo [Freudianism: A Marxist Critique],⁶⁶ in 2001, by the publisher Perspectiva. The work was translated by Paulo Bezerra, and features, on its cover, a photograph by Mikhail Bakhtin and Sigmund Freud blending into a single face. Authorship is conferred to Mikhail Bakhtin, although, nowadays, the authorship of Valentin Vološinov is almost indisputable. In 2002, the work Questões de literatura e de estética: a teoria do romance [The Dialogical Imagination: Four Essays 67 by Mikhail Bakhtin, was on its 5th edition. It was published by Unesp and by Hucitec. In 2010, by the end of the reception period, the 6th edition was published. In 2002, the 3rd edition of *Problemas da poética de Dotoiévski* [*Problems of Dostoevsky*'s Poetics | 68 [1963], also by Mikhail Bakhtin, was published by Forense Universitária. The revised translation of this edition was made by Paulo Bezerra from Russian. In 2008, the same publisher released the 4th edition of the work. The work Estética da criação verbal [Speech Genres and Other Late Essays]⁶⁹ [1919-1971], by Mikhail Bakhtin, in 2003, was in its 4th edition, by Martins Fontes. The translation was performed by Paulo Bezerra from Russian. In 2010, the work was in its 5th edition. Also in 2010, the work Cultura popular na idade média e no renascimento: o context de François Rabelais [Rabelais and his World]⁷⁰ [1965], by Mikhail Bakhtin had its 7th edition published, by Hucitec. All these editions and re-editions corroborate our defense that at this stage discourse studies using the Circle's works as a theoretical basis increased, a fact that can be observed by the demand for new editions and for larger print runs of books written by the authors of the Circle.

In 2006, *Marxismo e filosofia da linguagem* [*Marxism and the Philosophy of Language*]⁷¹ [1929] was already in its 12th edition by Hucitec. The translation was made by Michel Lahud and Yara Frateschi, still from the French edition (Paris, Les Editions de Minuit, 1977). As in previous editions, the authorship was attributed to Mikhail Bakhtin and, in parentheses, Vološinov. In 2010, the 14th edition was published.

⁶⁶ For reference, see footnote 14.

⁶⁷ For reference, see footnote 51.

⁶⁸ For reference, see footnote 11.

⁶⁹ For reference, see footnote 36.

⁷⁰ For reference, see footnote 34.

⁷¹ For reference, see footnote 14.

The only three works whose first editions were published in the third phase were *O freudismo* [Freudianism: A Marxist Critique]⁷² and Para uma filosofia do ato responsável [Toward a Philosophy of the Act]⁷³ (PFA). In 2001, O freudismo [Freudianism: A Marxist Critique]⁷⁴ was published by the Perspectiva. The work was translated by Paulo Bezerra. Mikhail Bakhtin em diálogo: conversas de 1973 com Viktor Duvakin [Mikhail Bakhtin. The Duvakin Interviews, 1973],⁷⁵ was published in 2008 by Pedro & João Editores, translated by Daniela Miotello Mondardo, from the Italian edition. In 2010, the 1st edition of Para uma filosofia do ato responsável [Toward a Philosophy of the Act]⁷⁶ [1920-1924], by Mikhail Bakhtin, was published by Pedro & João Editores. The translation was supervised by Valdemir Miotello and Carlos Alberto Faraco, from the Italian edition Per una filosofia dell'atto responsabile. Pensa Multimedia, Lecce, 2010).

In this phase, critical studies based on the Bakhtin Circle multiplied across the country. Researchers began to discuss, for example, whether the theory used here for discourse analysis was proposed by the Bakhtin Circle or if the theoretical assumptions only motivated the creation of a Dialogic Discourse Analysis. Thus, on the one hand, we have the arguments of Beth Brait in the chapter Discourse Analysis and Theory, present in the work organized by her *Bakhtin: outros conceitos-chave* [*Bakhtin: Other Key Concepts*], which proposes "to sustain that the set of the Circle's works motivated the birth of a Dialogical Discourse Analysis/Theory" (Brait, 2006, p.9). According to the author,

No one in their right mind could say that Bakhtin *formally* proposed a discourse theory and/or analysis, in the sense in which we use the expression to refer, for example, to French Discourse Analysis. However, it cannot be denied that Bakhtinian thought represents, today, one of the greatest contributions to the studies of language, observed

⁷² For reference, see footnote 18.

⁷³ BAKHTIN, M. M. *Toward a Philosophy of the Act*. Translation and notes by Vadim Liapunov. Edited by Vadim Liapunov and Michael Holquist. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1995.

⁷⁴ For reference, see footnote 18.

⁷⁵ BAKHTIN, M. *The Duvakin Interviews*, *1973*. Edited by Slav N Gratchev and Margarita Marinova. Translated by Margarita Marinova. Lewisburg: Bucknell University Press, 2019.

⁷⁶ For reference, see footnote 73.

⁷⁷ However, we will not cite the published works, so as not to incur in any injustice, by forgetting any.

⁷⁸ In Portuguese: "a sustentar que o conjunto das obras do *Círculo* motivou o nascimento de uma análise/teoria dialógica do discurso."

both in its artistic manifestations and in the diversity of its daily richness (Brait, 2006, p.9).⁷⁹

On the other hand, we have the arguments of the researcher Sheila Grillo, in her article *A metalingüística: por uma ciência dialógica da linguagem* [Metalinguistics: for a Dialogic Science of Language], in which the author states that "Bakhtin formulated, in the texts of his last phase, a discipline of language study with its own object, method of analysis and the outline of a set of phenomena to be researched" (2006, p.121). ⁸⁰ Thus, in agreement with Grillo, based on the readings we carried out on metalinguistics in the writings of Mikhail Bakhtin, we deem it unfair not to emphasize that the author formally proposed a borderline discipline, ⁸¹ understood as a theoretical-methodological set, which would analyze the dialogic relationships between discourses, since the author himself named and delimited it, appearing for the first time, as the author indicates, in O problema do texto na linguística, na filologia e em outras ciências humanas [*The Problem of the Text in Linguistics, Philology, and the Human Sciences: An Experiment in Philosophical Analysis*], ⁸² written by Bakhtin between 1959 and 1961.

_

⁷⁹ In Portuguese: "Ninguém, em sã consciência, poderia dizer que Bakhtin tenha proposto *formalmente* uma teoria e/ou análise do discurso, no sentido em que usamos a expressão para fazer referência, por exemplo, à Análise do Discurso Francesa. Entretanto, também não se pode negar que o pensamento bakhtiniano representa, hoje, uma das maiores contribuições para os estudos da linguagem, observada tanto em suas manifestações artísticas como na diversidade de sua riqueza cotidiana."

⁸⁰ In Portuguese: "Bakhtin formulou, nos textos de sua última fase, uma disciplina de estudo da linguagem com objeto próprio, método de análise e o esboço de um conjunto de fenômenos a pesquisar."

⁸¹ We use the term *discipline*, based on the article written by Sheila Grillo, already mentioned, and on the arguments of Paulo Bezerra, in the preface of Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics: "As Bakhtin cherished the project of creating, on the borders of linguistics, philosophical anthropology and literary studies (or theory), a new discipline of the human sciences with the name of metalinguistics (and not translinguistics, an inadequate translation that Kristeva makes of Bakhtin's concept with the undisguised purpose of reducing its thought to another current of linguistics), and this would be a dialogic interaction of those disciplines, literary discourse, with the dialogic relations that sediment it, would be the object of study of a new theory of culture, based on interdisciplinary foundations and capable of contemplating a wide range of human ways of thinking and acting. Such a theory would be an antidote to the reductionisms to which Bakhtin's own thinking has fallen victim" (2013, p.XV). In Portuguese: "Como Bakhtin acalentava o projeto de criar, nas fronteiras da linguística, da antropologia filosófica e dos estudos literários (ou teoria) uma nova disciplina das ciências humanas com a denominação de metalinguística (e não translinguística, tradução inadequada que Kristeva faz do conceito de Bakhtin com a finalidade nada disfarçada de reduzirlhe o pensamento a mais uma corrente da linguística), e esta seria uma interação dialógica daquelas disciplinas, o discurso literário, com as relações dialógicas que o sedimentam, seria objeto de estudo de uma nova teoria da cultura, assentada em fundamentos interdisciplinares e capaz de contemplar um vasto leque de formas humanas de pensar e agir. Tal teoria seria um antídoto aos reducionismos de que tem sido vítima o pensamento do próprio Bakhtin."

⁸² For reference, see footnote 11.

Thus, according to the author, "metalinguistics, as a different discipline from linguistics, has its own object and method for approaching it. The object is dialogic relations" (Grillo, 2006, p.122).⁸³ Mikhail Bakhtin claims, in *O problema do texto na linguística, na filologia e em outras ciências humanas* [The Problem of the Text in Linguistics, Philology, and the Human Sciences: An Experiment in Philosophical Analysis],⁸⁴ that "dialogical relations among utterances that also pervade individual utterances from within fall into the realm of metalinguistics" (1986, p.114).^{85;86}

Perhaps Bakhtin's propositions on metalinguistics are not responsible for the use of the many concepts of the Circle by the Brazilian DDA. However, but we cannot fail to consider them when delimiting/presenting our field of study, since there are, in Mikhail Bakhtin's texts, theoretical and methodological notes on metalinguistics, as well as converging theoretical and methodological issues in Valentin Vološinov's and Pavel Medvedev's texts. So much so that the researcher Beth Brait, in her essay "Perspectiva dialógica" ["Dialogic Perspective"], present in the book *Texto ou discurso?* [*Text or Discourse?*], organized by Brait and Maria Cecília Souza-e-Silva (2012), considers that there are, in the Circle's writings, and, mainly, in Mikhail Bakhtin's *Problemas da poética de Dostoiévski* [*Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics*], 87 "a series of definitions and characterizations of *metalinguistics* and *dialogic relations*." (p.15, emphasis in the original) 88

However, we consider that not highlighting the efforts of Brazilian researchers to systematize the concepts of the so-called Bakhtin Circle, having had, especially in the first receptions of the works, a fragmented, discontinuous, and decontextualized access to the texts is as unfair as to fail in stressing that Bakhtin formally proposed a borderline

⁸³ In Portuguese: "metalingüística, enquanto disciplina diversa da lingüística, tem objeto e método próprio para abordá-lo. O objeto são as relações dialógicas."

⁸⁴ For reference, see footnote 11.

⁸⁵ For reference, see footnote 11.

⁸⁶ In a previous translation, published in Brazil in *O problema do texto* [*The Problem of the Text in Linguistics, Philology, and the Human Sciences: An Experiment in Philosophical Analysis* (for reference, see footnote 11)]: "Dialogic relations among utterances, whose path also pervades the utterance considered in isolation, fall into the realm of metalinguistics." In Portuguese: "A relação dialógica entre os enunciados, cujo percurso também passa por dentro do enunciado considerado isoladamente, compete à metalingüística" (Bakhtin, 2003b [1959-1961], p.342). We consulted the quoted passage in the work *Speech Genres and Other Late Essays*, published in the United States, edited by Emerson and Holquist (1986). However, the English translation does not have the same issue as the previous Portuguese translation.

⁸⁷ For reference, see footnote 11.

⁸⁸ In Portuguese: "uma série de definições e caracterizações de metalinguística e de relações dialógicas."

discipline. For this reason, we defend here that the readings carried out by scholars are also an important part of the basic theoretical and methodological formulations of DDA in the Brazilian trajectory.

In the third reception phase of Bakhtin Circle's works in the country, we also have the translation of important reviews, such as *Mikhail Bakhtin*, ⁸⁹ by Katerina Clark and Michael Holquist (1998), *Os cem primeiros anos de Mikhail Bakhtin* [*The First Hundred Years of Mikhail Bakhtin*], ⁹⁰ by Caryl Emerson (2003) and *Mikhail Bakhtin: Criação de uma prosaística* [*Mikhail Bakhtin:* Creation of a Prosaics], by Gary Morson and Caryl Emerson (2008). ⁹¹ The first two works deal with the debate over the authorship of the works of the Bakhtin Circle, namely, Clark and Holquist argue that Mikhail Bakhtin was the author of all of the Circle's works while Morson and Emerson believed in the dialogue between the authors of the Circle.

We understand that these works were crucial for the understanding of the biography and authorship of the works of Dialogic Discourse Analysis, so that, in the fourth phase of reception, which we are currently experiencing, many studies have been realizing the importance of the context in which the writings have been produced, the biographies of the authors and the authorship of each work for the adequate understanding of the theory. This conception is what makes us currently better understand the existing relationships between life and scientific knowledge, sometimes pointed out by the Circle's authors (Bakhtin, 1986; 921995). 93

4 Fourth Phase: Contextualizing DDA

In the *fourth reception phase* of the Circle's work in Brazil, which we are currently experiencing, we have "direct translations with reviews, for example, by Paulo Bezerra, Sheila Grillo and Ekaterina Vólkova Américo, who in addition to being translators, are

⁸⁹ CLARK, Katerina; HOLQUIST, Michael. Mikhail Bakhtin. Boston. Harvard College, 1984.

⁹⁰ EMERSON, C. *The First Hundred Years of Mikhail Bakhtin*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1997.

⁹¹ MORSON, G. S.; EMERSON, C. *Mikhail Bakhtin:* Creation of a Prosaics. California: Stanford University Press, 1990.

⁹² For reference, see footnote 36.

⁹³ For reference, see footnote 73.

scholars" (Paula, 2021, para. 2),⁹⁴ the consolidation of theoretical-methodological assumptions for studies in the area, based both on translated works and on theoretical studies and reviews and the contextualization of the works of the Bakhtin Circle, both in their production context and in their reception.

Such consolidation means that, theoretically, we have already established, for example, the differences between concepts that were often confused or presented in an erroneous way, such as heterodiscourse, polyphony, ideology, among others. It also allows one to observe, in the researches based on DDA, the use of theoretical and methodological assumptions present in the Circle's works, in an increasingly organized and perceptible way, which has guaranteed the scientific rigor of the works based on Dialogic Discourse Analysis.

An important milestone for this phase is the publication, in 2012, by the publisher Contexto, of *O método formal nos estudos literários* [*The Formal Method in Literary Scholarship*] (1928),⁹⁵ by Pável Nikoláievitch Medvedev, with translation by the researchers Sheila Grillo and Ekaterina Vólkova Américo. The edition contains an extensive introduction, written by Beth Brait and a detailed preface, written by Grillo, in which she contextualizes of the work and gives details of the original, in addition to translators' notes.

We also had, in 2013, the first publication of *A construção do enunciado e outros ensaios* [*Bakhtin School Papers*]⁹⁶ (1925-1930), by Valentin Nikolaevich Vološinov, with organization, translation and notes by the researcher João Wanderley Geraldi and editing and supervision of the translation by Valdemir Miotello. The translation was conducted from Italian, English and Spanish (works listed on pages 25-26 of the book). The edition was made by Pedro & João Editores.

Editora 34 has been publishing several unpublished editions of works by the authors of the Circle, as well as retranslations of works previously translated indirectly, from European and American editions. The covers of the books emphasize the authorship. The first work, published in 2013, was *Questões de estilística no ensino de línguas*

⁹⁴ In Portuguese: "traduções diretas com críticas, por exemplo, de Paulo Bezerra, Sheila Grillo e Ekaterina Vólkova Américo, que além de tradutores, são estudiosos."

⁹⁵ For reference, see footnote 19.

⁹⁶ SHUKMAN, A. Bakhtin School Papers. New York: RPT Publications, 1983.

[Stylistics in Teaching Russian Language in Secondary School]⁹⁷ (1940), by Mikhail Bakhtin, translated from the Russian original, by Sheila Grillo and Ekaterina Vólkova Américo. The edition of Editora 34 has an afterword and translators' notes, who are also researchers of the Circle's works, and a presentation by researcher Beth Brait. In 2015, by Mikhail Bakhtin, the work Teoria do romance I: A estilística [Theory of the Novel I: Stylistics]⁹⁸ (1930-1936 and 1972) was published, with a translation from Russian, preface, notes and glossary by Paulo Bezerra. In 2016, also by Mikhail Bakhtin, Gêneros do discurso [The Problem of Speech Genres]⁹⁹ (1952-1953) was published, with organization, translation from Russian, afterword and notes by Paulo Bezerra.

In 2017, Editora 34 published, by Valentin Vološinov, *Marxismo e filosofia da linguagem: Problemas do método sociológico na ciência da linguagem* [*Marxism and the Philosophy of Language*]¹⁰⁰ (1929), translated by Sheila Grillo and Ekaterina Vólkova Américo from the Russian original. That same year, Mikhail Bakhtin's work, Notas sobre literatura, cultura e ciências humanas [Notes on Literature, Culture and Human Sciences]¹⁰¹ (1970-1975) was published, with organization, translation, afterword and notes by Paulo Bezerra.

In 2018, by Mikhail Bakhtin, *Teoria do romance II: As formas do tempo e do cronotopo* [*Theory of the Novel II:* The Forms of Time and of the Chronotope]¹⁰² (1937-1939) was published, with translation, afterword and notes by Paulo Bezerra. In 2019, also by Mikhail Bakhtin, the book *Teoria do romance III: O romance com gênero*

⁹⁷ BAKHTIN, M. Dialogic Origin and Dialogic Pedagogy of Grammar. Stylistics in Teaching Russian Language in Secondary School. Translated by Lydia Razran Stone. *Journal of Russian and East European Psychology*, vol. 42, no. 6, November–December 2004. pp.12–49.

⁹⁸ BAKHTIN, M. M. Discourse in the Novel. In: *The Dialogic Imagination*: Four Essays. Translated by Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1981. pp.259-422.

⁹⁹ BAKHTIN, M. The Problem of Speech Genres. In: *Speech Genres & Other Late Essays*. Translated by Vern W. McGee and Edited by Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1986. pp.60-102.

¹⁰⁰ For reference, see footnote 14.

¹⁰¹ BAKHTIN, M. From Notes Made in 1970; Response to a Question from the Novy Mir Editorial Staff; Toward a Methodology for the Human Sciences. In: *Speech Genres & Other Late Essays*. Translated by Vern W. McGee and Edited by Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1986.

¹⁰² BAKHTIN, M. Forms of Time and of the Chronotope in the Novel. In: *The Dialogic Imagination*: Four Essays. Translated by Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1981. pp.84-258.

literário [Theory of the Novel III: The Novel as a Literary Genre]¹⁰³ (1965-1975) was published, also translated by Paulo Bezerra, by Editora 34 and *O homem ao espelho* [The man at the Mirror], by Pedro & João Editores. Also in 2019, by Valentin Vološinov, the work *A palavra na vida e a palavra na poesia* [Discourse in Life and Discourse in Art. Concerning Sociological Poetics]¹⁰⁴ was published, translated by Sheila Grillo and Ekaterina Vólkova Américo directly from Russian, by Editora 34.

Works which had already been published continued to be reedited. In 2013, we have the 5th edition of *Problemas da poética de Dostoiévski* [*Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics*]¹⁰⁵ (1963), by Mikhail Bakhtin, by Forense Universitária. In 2014, *MFL* had its 16th edition published by Hucitec, still indicating authorship as by Mikhail Bakhtin (Vološinov), translated by Michel Lahud and Yara Frateschi from the French edition.

Editora 34 plans to release¹⁰⁶ *Problemas da obra de Dostoévski* [*Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics*],¹⁰⁷ the first version of *Problemas da poética de Dostoiévski*, by Mikhail Bakhtin, translated by Sheila Grillo and Ekaterina Vólkova Américo. According to information from the publisher, the work will have review notes and introductory texts written by the researchers. According to information from the translators, they are currently also re-translating the work *Cultura popular na idade média e no renascimento: o contexto de François Rabelais* [*Rabelais and his World*].¹⁰⁸

In this context, we realize the importance of retranslations and translations of unpublished manuscripts for the consolidation of the dialogical analysis of discourse in Brazil, as the researcher Beth Brait points out in the flap copy of the new edition of *Marxismo e filosofia da linguagem* [Marxism and the Philosophy of Language]:¹⁰⁹

In the current stage of Bakhtinian studies, retranslations, in Brazil and abroad, are due to the awareness that dialogic thinking requires knowledge of the contexts of production and reproduction, in order to

Bakhtiniana, São Paulo, 17 (4): 109-142, Oct./Dec. 2022.

¹⁰³ BAKHTIN, M. Epic and Novel; From the Prehistory of Novelistic Discourse. In: *The Dialogic Imagination*: Four Essays. Translated by Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1981. pp.3-83.

¹⁰⁴ BAKHTIN, M. VOLOŠINOV, V. Discourse in Life and Discourse in Art. Concerning Sociological Poetics. *In: Freudianism:* A Marxist Critique. Transl. by Irwin R. Titunik, New York: Academic Press, 1976.

¹⁰⁵ For reference, see footnote 11.

¹⁰⁶ The information was received from the publisher via email in 2020. There is no information as to when the work will be released.

¹⁰⁷ For reference, see footnote 11.

¹⁰⁸ For reference, see footnote 34.

¹⁰⁹ For reference, see foonote 14.

better situate the works, their originality, their polemic dialogue or not with other aspects of knowledge. In this search, the accessibility of Russian sources, archives and libraries, makes it possible to discover first editions, unpublished works, preparatory sketches, documents that attest to the professional and academic life of the authors. At the confluence of these two elements is the fact that today translators are specialists who focus on primary sources not only to disseminate works and authors, but to clarify the genesis and scope of thought. And the readings expand, embarking on new paths (Brait, 2017, in the flap of the book).

Thus, without detracting from the first editions of the Bakhtin Circle's works in Brazil, it is possible to note that three factors of the new translations should possibly influence the reading of Dialogic Discourse Analysis works currently: a) that the translation was carried out from the source language, whether from manuscripts or Russian editions, or that the translation, even if indirect, is always a new voice, a new reading of the Bakhtin Circle's works, b) the translation notes, which allow the reader to better understand the concepts used and c) the reviews contained in the works, which are able to guide the reading and/or contextualize the works.

In order to better visualize the period between the original publication (or production, in the case of manuscripts) (OP) of the works and the publication in Brazil (BP) and of the translators, we present, in the Appendix 1, a summary table of the survey carried out (Appendix 1).

We emphasize that, in the current reception phase, with new editions in Portuguese, which brought a more organized and contextualized view of the Circle's work, the theoretical-methodological issues of DDA have become increasingly observable, since various works of the Circle are available, translated with great rigor, as well as review works. We observed the publication of several works that aim to organize the methodology and theory used by Dialogic Discourse Analysis, such as the one present in the work *Pensadores da Análise do Discurso* [*Discourse Analysis Scholars*], by Anderson Salvaterra Magalhães and João Kogawa (2019), which has even a chapter on how to analyze discourses based on DDA.

It is, therefore, from this theoretical space-time that we situate ourselves and can situate our research.

Final Considerations

Throughout this article, we argue that the reception of the Bakhtin Circle's works in Brazil had four distinct phases. We comprehend that the first reception phase is related to the initial reception of some works from the Circle, still without translation in the country, in the 1960s. We understand that this phase was crucial to arouse theoretical interest around the Circle. However, despite such interest, at that first moment, when sparse readings of some works were carried out in Brazil, based on translations into Italian, French, Spanish and English, researchers still had not ventured to base in-depth research in the Dialogic Theory.

The second reception phase, as we have seen, comprises the first translations made into Brazilian Portuguese, firstly, from other translations (from Italian, French, Spanish, English), after the first translation, carried out in 1979, of *Marxism and the Philosophy of Language*, from French. In this second phase, we verified the writing and publication of articles, dissertations and theses based on the Circle's works, as well as the holding of the first academic events aimed at discussing the theory.

The third reception phase concerns the increase in discourse studies with a theoretical basis in the Circle's works and the retranslations and re-editions (with revised translations and with a greater number of translation notes) of the works of the Bakhtin Circle in the country, from 2002 to 2010. We understand that at this stage attempts to systematize, name and detail the theoretical-methodological framework of a Dialogic Discourse Analysis in the country began, turning this into one of the main phases of the reception of Bakhtinian works in the country.

In the fourth phase, which we are currently experiencing, we have the "direct translations with reviews, for example, by Paulo Bezerra, Sheila Grillo and Ekaterina Vólkova Américo, who are not only translators but scholars." (Paula, 2021, para. 2)¹¹⁰ In the current reception phase the Bakhtin Circle's thoughts in Brazil, there are numerous researches and works available, which offer important subsidies to understand the theoretical-methodological conceptions of DDA in a contextualized and organized way.

¹¹⁰ In Portuguese: "traduções diretas com críticas, por exemplo, de Paulo Bezerra, Sheila Grillo e Ekaterina Vólkova Américo, que além de tradutores, são estudiosos."

Bakhtiniana, São Paulo, 17 (4): 109-142, Oct./Dec. 2022.

From the analysis of this path, composed of four distinct phases, we observe the movement that led to the consolidation of theoretical-methodological assumptions for studies in the area, to a Dialogic Discourse Analysis, based both on translated works and on theoretical and review studies. This movement was marked by the fragmented reception of the work, but also by the search of Brazilian researchers for the works of the Circle, for its production context and for the consolidation of the theory in Brazilian linguistic and discursive studies.

This trajectory, however, does not end with this article. There are still texts that need to be translated, there are still readings to be done. With Bakhtin, we can say that this article is just one link in the great dialogue about the Brazilian path of Dialogic Discourse Analysis.

REFERENCES

BAKHTIN, M. *Problemas da poética de Dostoiévski*. Trad. Paulo Bezerra. 3. ed. Rio de Janeiro: Forense Universitária, 2002a. [1963]

BAKHTIN, M. O discurso em Dostoiévski. *In:* BAKHTIN, M. *Problemas da poética de Dostoiévski*. Trad. Paulo Bezerra. 3. ed. Rio de Janeiro: Forense Universitária, 2002b. p.181-272. [1963]

BAKHTIN, M. Metodologia das ciências humanas [1974]. *In:* BAKHTIN, M. *Estética da criação verbal*. Trad. Paulo Bezerra. 4. ed. São Paulo: Martins Fontes, 2003a. p.393-410. [1979]

BAKHTIN, M. O problema do texto na linguística, na filologia e em outras ciências humanas. [1959-1961] *In:* BAKHTIN, M. *Estética da criação verbal* Trad. Paulo Bezerra. 4. ed. São Paulo: Martins Fontes, 2003b. p.307-336. [1979].

BAKHTIN, M. *Para uma filosofia do ato responsável*. Tradução aos cuidados de Valdemir Miotello e Carlos Alberto Faraco. São Carlos: Pedro & João Editores, 2010a. [1920-1924].

BAKHTIN, M. *A cultura popular na Idade Média e no Renascimento*: o contexto de François Rabelais. Trad. Yara Frateschi Vieira. 7. ed. São Paulo: Hucitec, 2010b.

BAKHTIN, M. *Estética da criação verbal*. Trad. Paulo Bezerra. 5. ed. São Paulo: Martins Fontes, 2010c. [1979].

BAKHTIN, M. (V. N. Volochínov). *Marxismo e filosofia da linguagem*: problemas fundamentais do método sociológico da linguagem [1929]. Prefácio Roman Jakobson; Apresentação de Marina Yaguello. Trad. Michel Lahud e Yara Frateschi Vieira. 14. ed. São Paulo: Hucitec, 2010d.

BAKHTIN, M. *Questões de literatura e de estética*: a teoria do romance. Trad. Aurora Fornoni Bernardini *et al.* 6. ed. São Paulo: Hucitec, 2010e.

- BAKHTIN, M. *Problemas da poética de Dostoiévski*. Trad. Paulo Bezerra. 5. ed. Rio de Janeiro: Forense Universitária, 2013. [1963].
- BAKHTIN, M. O discurso no romance *In:* BAKHTIN, M. *Teoria do Romance I:* A estilística. Tradução, prefácio e notas de Paulo Bezerra. Organização da edição russa de Serguei Botcharov e Vadim Kójinov. São Paulo: Editora 34, 2015.
- BAKHTIN, M. *Os gêneros do discurso*. Organização, tradução e notas de Paulo Bezerra; Notas da edição russa de Serguei Botcharov. São Paulo: Editora 34, 2016.
- BAKHTIN, M. O texto na linguística, na filologia e em outras ciências humanas. [1959-1961] *In:* BAKHTIN, M. *Os gêneros do discurso*. Organização, tradução e notas de Paulo Bezerra; Notas da edição russa de Serguei Botcharov. São Paulo: Editora 34, 2016. p.71-110.
- BAKHTIN, M. *Notas sobre literatura, cultura e ciências humanas* [1970-1975]. Organização, tradução e notas de Paulo Bezerra; Notas da edição russa de Serguei Botcharov. São Paulo: Editora 34, 2017a.
- BAKHTIN, M. Por uma metodologia das ciências humanas [1975]. *In:* BAKHTIN, M. *Notas sobre literatura, cultura e ciências humanas* [1970-1975]. Organização, tradução e notas de Paulo Bezerra; Notas da edição russa de Serguei Botcharov. São Paulo: Editora 34, 2017b.
- BAKHTIN, M. M. [Valentin Volóchinov]. *O freudismo:* um esboço crítico [1927]. Trad. Paulo Bezerra. São Paulo: Editora Perspectiva, 2017c.
- BRAIT, B. Prefácio. *In:* SOUZA, G. T. *Introdução a teoria do enunciado concreto do Círculo Bakhtin/Volochinov/Medevedev*. São Paulo: Humanitas/FFLCH/USP, 1999.
- BRAIT, B. Linguagem e identidade: um constante trabalho de estilo. *Revista Trabalho*, Educação e Saúde (Online), Rio de Janeiro, v. 2, n.1, p.15-32, 2004. Disponível em: https://doi.org/10.1590/S1981-77462004000100003. Acesso em: 01 fev. 2022.
- BRAIT, B. Análise e teoria do discurso. *In:* BRAIT, B. (org.) *Bakhtin:* outros conceitoschave. São Paulo: Contexto, 2006. p.9-31.
- BRAIT, B. Perspectiva dialógica. *In:* BRAIT, B; SOUZA-e-SILVA, M. C. (orgs.). *Texto ou discurso?* São Paulo: Contexto, 2012a. p.9-29.
- BRAIT, B. A chegada de Voloshinov/Bakhtin ao Brasil na década de 1970. *In*: ZANDWAIS, A. (org.). *História das ideias*: diálogos entre linguagem, cultura e história. Passo Fundo: Universidade de Passo Fundo, 2012b. p.216-243.
- BRAIT, B. Orelha do livro. *In*: VOLÓCHINOV, Valentin. *Marxismo e filosofia da linguagem*. Problemas fundamentais do método sociológico na ciência da linguagem. Tradução, notas e glossário de Sheila Grillo e Ekaterina Vólkova Américo. Ensaio introdutório de Sheila Grillo. São Paulo: Editora 34, 2017.
- BRAIT, B. Perspectiva dialógica: um percurso brasileiro. *In:* BAGNO, Marcos; VIEIRA, Francisco Eduardo (orgs.). *História das línguas, história da linguística*: homenagem a Carlos Alberto Faraco. São Paulo: Parábola, 2020. p.41-60.
- BRAIT, B.; PISTORI, M. H. C. Marxismo e filosofia da linguagem: a recepção de Bakhtin e o Círculo no Brasil. *Bakhtiniana*, Rev. Estud. Discurso, São Paulo, v. 15, n. 2, p.33-63, jun. 2020. Disponível em:

- http://www.scielo.br/scielo.php?script=sci_arttext&pid=S2176-45732020000200033&lng=en&nrm=iso . Acesso em: 03 maio 2021.
- BRAIT, B. *Problemas da poética de Dostoiévski*: a recepção brasileira. *Bakhtiniana*: Revista de Estudos do Discurso [online], São Paulo, v. 16, n. 2, pp.70-89, 2021. Disponível em: https://revistas.pucsp.br/index.php/bakhtiniana/article/view/48770/35074. Acesso em: 01 fev. 2022.
- DI FANTI, M. G. C. *Discurso*, *trabalho & dialogismo*: a atividade jurídica e o conflito trabalhador / patrão. 2004. 385 f. Tese (Doutorado em Linguística Aplicada e Estudos da Linguagem) LAEL, Pontifícia Universidade Católica de São Paulo, São Paulo, 2004.
- EMERSON, C. *Os cem primeiros anos de Mikhail Bakhtin*. Trad. Pedro Jorgensen Jr. Rio de Janeiro: DIFEL, 2003.
- FARACO, C. A.; TEZZA, C.; BRAIT, B.; RONCARI, L. D. A.; BERNARDI, R. M. *Uma introdução a Bakhtin*. Curitiba: Hatier, 1988.
- FARACO, C. A. *Linguagem & diálogo*: as ideias linguísticas do Círculo de Bakhtin. São Paulo: Parábola Editorial, 2009.
- GRILLO, S. V. C. A metalinguística: por uma ciência dialógica da linguagem. *Horizontes*, v. 24, n. 2, p.121-128, jul./dez. 2006.
- GRILLO, S. V. C.; AMÉRICO, E. V. Valentín Nikoláievitch Volóchinov: detalhes da vida e da obra encontrados em arquivos. *Alfa*, rev. linguista. (São José Rio Preto), São Paulo, v. 61, n. 2, pág. 255-281, agosto de 2017. Disponível em: http://old.scielo.br/scielo.php?script=sci arttext&pid=S1981-57942017000200255&lng=en&nrm=iso. Acesso em 09 abr. 2022.
- GRILLO, S. MEDVEDEV, P. N. *Coбрание сочинений в 2 х томах* [P.N. MEDVIÉDEV. *Obras reunidas em dois volumes*. São Petersburgo: Rostok, 2018]. *Bakhtiniana*, Revista de Estudos do Discurso, v. 15, n. 2, 2020. p.248-249. Disponível em: https://revistas.pucsp.br/index.php/bakhtiniana/article/view/44412. Acesso em: 1 jun. 2021.
- MAGALHÃES, A. S.; KOGAWA, J. *Pensadores da análise do discurso*: uma introdução. São Paulo: Paco Editorial, 2019.
- MEDVIÉDEV, P. N. *O método formal nos estudos literários*. Tradução de Sheilla Camargo Grillo e Ekaterina Vólkova Américo. Apresentação Beth Brait. São Paulo: Contexto, 2012. [1928].
- MIKHAIL BAKHTIN. *In: Oxford bibliographies in Anthropology*, 2018. Disponível em: https://www.oxfordbibliographies.com/view/document/obo-9780199766567/obo-9780199766567-0186.xml. Acesso em: 1 Jun. 2021.
- ORNELLAS, C. A. Mikhail Bakhtin no Brasil: primeiras repercussões. *Espéculo*. Revista de estudios literarios. Universidad Complutense de Madrid. Madri, n. 43, nov. 2009- fev. 2010. Disponível em: https://webs.ucm.es/info/especulo/numero43/brabaj.html. Acesso em: 03 maio 2021.
- PAULA, L. de. Círculo de Bakhtin: uma análise dialógica de discurso. *Revista de Estudos da Linguagem*, v. 21, n. 1, p.239-257, 2013. Disponível em: http://hdl.handle.net/11449/125169. Acesso em: 09 set. 2020.

PAULA, L. de. Entrevista especial XI – Luciane de Paula (Unesp). Entrevistada por Larissa Rodrigues, Bruno Barra, Edson Romualdo (part. especial), Geysa Barbosa, Jennifer Marinho, Laís Mikeyla, Neil Franco e Thaís Schoffen. *O Consoante*, 17 mar. 2021. Disponível em: http://oconsoante.com.br/2021/03/14/entrevista-especial-xi/. Acesso em: 29 mar. 2021.

SCHNAIDERMAN, B. *Turbilhão e semente:* ensaios sobre Dostoiévski e Bakhtin. São Paulo: Duas Cidades, 1983.

SCHNAIDERMAN, B. *Os escombros e o mito:* a cultura e o fim da União Soviética. São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 1997.

SILVA, A. P. P. de F e. 0,5 mm: a nova edição brasileira de problemas da poética de Dostoiévski. Bakhtiniana, *Rev. Estud. Discurso*, São Paulo, v. 6, n. 1, p.7-23, dez. 2011. Disponível em: http://www.scielo.br/scielo.php?script=sci_arttext&pid=S2176-45732011000200002&lng=en&nrm=iso. Acesso em: 03 maio 2021.

SOBRAL, A. Entrevista especial VI – Adail Sobral (FURG). Entrevistado por Flaviane Moraes, Neil Franco, Rafael Alves e Tiago Guimarães. *O Consoante*, 9 de abr. de 2019. Disponível em: http://oconsoante.com.br/2019/04/09/entrevista-especial-vi/. Acesso em: 29 mar. 2021.

TODOROV, T. Os gêneros do discurso. Trad. Ana M. Leite. Lisboa: Edições 70, 1981.

VIEIRA, M. *A atividade, o discurso e a clínica*: uma análise dialógica do trabalho médico. 2002. Tese (Doutorado em Linguística Aplicada e Estudos da Linguagem) – LAEL, Pontifícia Universidade Católica de São Paulo, São Paulo, 2002.

VOLÓCHINOV, V. (Círculo de Bakhtin). *Marxismo e filosofia da linguagem*. Problemas fundamentais do método sociológico na ciência da linguagem. Tradução de Sheila Grillo e Ekaterina Vólkova Américo. Ensaio introdutório de Sheila Grillo. São Paulo: Editora 34, 2017.

VOLÓCHINOV, V. (Círculo de Bakhtin). *A palavra na vida e a palavra na poesia*. Tradução de Sheila Grillo e Ekaterina Vólkova Américo. São Paulo: Editora 34, 2019.

VOLOCHÍNOV, V. N. A construção da enunciação e outros ensaios. Organização, tradução e notas de João Wanderley Geraldi. São Carlos: Pedro & João Editores, 2013.

VOLOCHÍNOV, V. (M. M. BAKHTIN). A palavra na vida e na poesia. Introdução aos problemas da poética sociológica. *In.*: BAKHTIN, M. *Palavra própria e palavra outra na sintaxe da enunciação*. Trad. Allan Tadeu Pugliese *et al.* São Carlos: Pedro e João Editores, 2011, p.147-181.

Acknowledgement

I thank the National Council for Scientific and Technological Development (CNPq) for the doctoral scholarship granted during the period of this research.

Translated by Renata Santos de Morales - re.morales@icloud.com

Received November 16, 2021

Accepted August 29, 2022

Reviews

Due to the commitment assumed by *Bakhtiniana*. Revista de Estudos do Discurso [Bakhtiniana. Journal of Discourse Studies] to Open Science, this journal only publishes reviews that have been authorized by all involved.

Research Data and Other Materials Availability

The contents underlying the research text are included in the manuscript.

Appendix

Summary table of Bakhtin Circle's works published in Brazil¹¹¹

FP	BP/ Publisher	Author	Work	Translation
1929	1979 Hucitec	Mikhail Bakhtin (Volochínov)	Marxism and the Philosophy of Language: Problems of Sociological Method in the Science of Language [Marxismo e filosofia da linguagem: problemas do método sociológico na ciência da linguagem]	Michel Lahud and Yara Frateschi, from the French Edition.
1963	1981 Forense Universitária	Mikhail Bakhtin	Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics [Problemas da poética de Dostoiévski]	Paulo Bezerra, from the Russian original.
1965	1987 Hucitec	Mikhail Bakhtin	Rabelais and his World [A cultura popular na Idade Média e no Renascimento: o contexto de François Rabelais]	Yara Frateschi and others, from the French edition.
1924 [1975]	1988 Unesp/ Hucitec	Mikhail Bakhtin	The Dialogical Imagination: Four Essays [Questões de literatura e de estética: a teoria do romance]	Aurora Fornoni Bernadini and others, from Russian.
1919 [1979]	1992 Martins Fontes	Mikhail Bakhtin	Speech Genres and Other Late Essays [Estética da criação verbal]	Maria Ermantina Galvão Gomes Pereira, from French. As of 2003, the editions were translated by Paulo Bezerra, from the Russian original.
1927	2001 Perspectiva	Mikhail Bakhtin [Volóchinov]	Freudianism [O Freudismo]	Paulo Bezerra, from the Russian original.
1973 ¹¹²	2008 Pedro & João Editores	Mikhail Bakhtin	Mikahil Bakhtin: The Duvakin Interviews, 1973 [Mikhail Bakhtin em diálogo: conversas de 1973 com Viktor Duvakin]	Daniela Miotello Mondardo, from the Italian edition.

Abbreviations – BP: Year of first publication in Brazil; FP: year of first publication or production of manuscripts. The titles of the works have been translated to English according to their titles in Portuguese.

It is a book of interviews made by Viktor Duvakin to Mikhail Bakhtin, in 1973. Although the work was not written by Bakhtin, it was included in the summary, as we understand that the text of the interview is part of the Bakhtinian bibliography published in Brazil.

1920-1924 [1986]	2010 Pedro & João Editores	Mikhail Bakhtin	Toward a Philosophy of the Act [Para uma filosofia do ato responsável]	Valdemir Miotello and Carlos Alberto Faraco, from Italian.
1928	2012 Contexto	Pável Medviédev	The Formal Method in Literary Scholarship: A Critical Introduction to Sociological Poetics [O método formal nos estudos literários: Introdução crítica a uma poética sociológica]	Sheila Grillo and Ekaterina Vólkova Américo, from the Russian original.
1940	2013 Editora 34	Mikhail Bakhtin	Stylistics in Teaching Russian Language in Secondary School [Questões de estilística no ensino da língua]	Sheila Grillo and Ekaterina Vólkova Américo, from the Russian original.
1925-1930	2013 Pedro & João Editores	Valentin Nikolaevich Volochínov	The Construction of the Utterance and Other Essays [A construção da Enunciação e outros ensaios]	João Wanderley Geraldi, from English, Spanish and Italian, supervised by Valdemir Miotello.
1930-1936 [1972]	2015 Editora 34	Mikhail Bakhtin	Theory of the Novel I: Stylistics [Teoria do romance I: A estilística]	Paulo Bezerra, from the Russian Original.
1950-1961 [1976- 1997] ¹¹³	2016 Editora 34	Mikhail Bakhtin	Speech Genres [Os gêneros do discurso]	Paulo Bezerra, from the Russian Original.
1929	2017 Editora 34	Valentin Volóchinov	Marxism and the Philosophy of Language: Problems of Sociological Method in the Science of Language [Marxismo e filosofia da linguagem: problemas do método sociológico na ciência da linguagem]	Sheila Grillo and Ekaterina Vólkova Américo, from the Russian original.
1930-1971 [1970- 1979] ¹¹⁴	2017 Editora 34	Mikhail Bakhtin	Notes on Literature, Culture and Human Sciences [Notas sobre literatura, cultura e ciências humanas]	Paulo Bezerra. Notes from the Russian original.

_

¹¹³ The work is an unprecedented organization, which contains the following texts: *Speech Genres*, written between 1952 and 1953, and published for the first time in 1978; *The Text in Linguistics, Philology and Other Human Sciences*, written between 1959 and 1961 and published in 1976 and *Dialogue I. The Issue of the Dialogical Discourse* and *Dialogue II*, written respectively in 1950 and 1952 and published for the first time in 1997. See Note to the Brazilian edition.

The work is also an unprecedented organization, bringing together the texts *The Science of Literature Today* (Answer to a question from the magazine *Novi Mir*), written in 1970 and published in the same year, *Fragments of the years 1970-1971*, written between 1970 and 1970 and published in 1979, and *For a Methodology of the Human Sciences*, drafted between 1930 and 1940 and published in 1975. See Note to the Brazilian edition.

1937-1939	2018 Editora 34	Mikhail Bakhtin	Theory of the Novel II: The Forms of Time and of the Chronotope [Teoria do romance II: As formas do tempo e do cronotopo]	Paulo Bezerra, from the Russian original.
1940-1941 (1965, 1970, 1975)	2019 Editora 34	Mikhail Bakhtin	Theory of the Novel III: The Novel as a Literary Genre [Teoria do romance III: O romance como gênero literário]	Paulo Bezerra, from the Russian original.
1921- 1930 ¹¹⁵	2019 Editora 34	Valentin Volóchinov	The Word in Life and the Word in Poetry: Essays, Articles, Reviews and Poems [A palavra na vida e a palavra na poesia]	Sheila Grillo and Ekaterina Vólkova Américo, from the Russian original.
1943- 194? ¹¹⁶	2019 Pedro & João Editores	Mikhail Bakhtin	A Person at the Mirror [O homem ao espelho: apontamentos dos anos 1940]	Marisol Barenco Mello and Maria Letícia Miranda, from Italian.
1920- 1924 ¹¹⁷	2021 Pedro & João Editores	Mikhail Bakhtin	Reading Pushkin's Razlúka: The Voice of the Other in Lyrical Poetry [Lendo Razlúka de Púchkin: a voz do outro na poesia lírica]	Marisol Barenco Mello from Italian.

Source: The author.

142

¹¹⁵ The work is an unprecedented organization, and "brings together essays, articles, reviews and poems" (Grillo; Américo, 2017, p.7) written between 1921 and 1930, published in the same period. In Portuguese: "reúne ensaios, artigos, resenhas e poemas."

¹¹⁶ The work also comprises the texts *The Violence of The Word and the Image in Absence*, *A Person at the Mirror* and *On Issues of Self-awareness and Self-assessment*. According to Marisol Barenco de Mello and Maria Letícia Miranda, the three texts "do not make up a sequential text, but were written at the same approximate time, which we deduce to be the end of 1943, since one of them is thus dated" (2019, p.17). In Portuguese: "não compõem um texto sequencial, mas foram escritos na mesma época aproximada, que deduzimos ser o final de 1943, já que um deles vem assim datado."

¹¹⁷ This is an unpublished translation in Brazil.