ARTICLES

Interaction, Heteroglossia and Discourse in the #maternidadereal [realmaternity] / Interação, heteroglossia e discurso na #maternidadereal

Bárbara Luisa Martins Wieler*

ABSTRACT

This article is the result of a doctoral study about the maternal ethos in social networks and it aims to reflect on the expression *#maternidadereal* [real maternity], used in internet posts. In the light of Mikhail Bakhtin's concept of heteroglossia, this observation will start from the idea of interaction, a fundamental and constituent phenomenon in social networks. the meaning of "real" will be considered from Jacques Lacan's theory, to delineate the differences between the hegemonic discourse of traditional motherhood, of romanticization, and the contemporary and counter-hegemonic discourse, through which motherhood can be vented in its pains. Finally, in order to verify how these discourses intersect in the materiality of language, 5 posts with the tag *#maternidadereal* will be analyzed, determining, through their brands, which axiological axis they are affiliated with. As a result, it was noticed that the idea of "real" fluctuates according to the subject-position of the mother who appropriates it, evidencing the heteroglossia that underlies these statements.

KEYWORDS: Discourse analysis; Heteroglossia; Maternity; Social network

RESUMO

O presente artigo é fruto de um estudo de doutorado acerca do ethos materno em redes sociais e tem por objetivo refletir sobre a expressão #maternidadereal, empregada em postagens de internet. À luz do conceito de heteroglossia, de Mikhail Bakhtin, essa observação partirá da ideia de interação, fenômeno basilar e constituinte nas redes sociais. Além disso, o sentido de "real" será ponderado a partir da teoria de Jacques Lacan, para delinear as diferenças entre o discurso hegemônico da maternidade tradicional, de romantização, e o discurso contemporâneo e contra-hegemônico, por meio do qual a maternidade pode ser desabafada em suas dores. Por fim, para se verificar como esses discursos se cruzam na materialidade da língua, cinco posts com a tag #maternidadereal serão analisados, determinando, por meio de suas marcas, a que eixo axiológico eles se filiam. Como resultado, percebeu-se que a ideia de "real" flutua de acordo com a posição-sujeito da mãe que se apropria dela, evidenciando a heteroglossia fundamentadora desses enunciados.

PALAVRAS-CHAVE: Análise do discurso; Heteroglossia; Maternidade; Rede social

^{*} PhD Student in Letras at Universidade Federal do Paraná – UFPR, Curitiba, Paraná, Brazil; https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4862-2314; bazinhawieler@gmail.com

Bakhtiniana, São Paulo, 18 (2): 179-204, April/June 2023.

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

Introduction

"The word is born in a dialogue as a living rejoinder within it; the word is shaped in dialogic interaction with an alien word that is already in the object. A word forms a concept of its own object in a dialogic way" (Bakhtin, 1981, p.279).¹ This idea by Mikhail Bakhtin is essential to understand how discursive networks are built: every utterance is a response, and every utterance is part of a broader and more complex chain, flowing in a stream of many sayings that have already been produced, inserting itself in this context, whether to endorse or refute them, but indisputably getting involved in this broth, resignifying it and only gaining meaning from this perspective. Bakhtin also warns that these statements not only look to the past, but also look to the future:

The word in living conversation is directly, blatantly, oriented toward a future answer-word: it provokes an answer, anticipates it and structures itself in the answer's direction. Forming itself in an atmosphere of the already spoken, the word is at the same time determined by that which has not yet been said but which is needed and in fact anticipated by the answering word. Such is the situation in any living dialogue (Bakhtin, 1981, p.280).²

With these first statements in sight, one can begin to trace the aim of the present work. As the utterance consists of concrete and unique units of language use (Bakhtin, 1986)³ that "reflect the specific conditions and goals of each such area not only through their content (thematic) and linguistic style, that is, the selection of the lexical, phraseological, and grammatical resources of the language, but above all through their compositional structure" (Bakhtin, 1986, p.60),⁴ an utterance was selected that has the flavor of contemporaneity, although it is imbued with the indelible and sacralized dominant discourse on motherhood: the "#maternidadereal." This utterance comes from

¹ BAKHTIN, M. M. Discourse in the Novel. In: BAKHTIN, M. M. *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays*. Translated by Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1981. p.279. ² For reference, see footnote 2.

³BAKHTIN, M. The Problem of Speech Genres. In: BAKHTIN, M. *Speech Genres and Other Late Essays*. Translated into English by Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist. Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 1986.

⁴ For reference, see footnote 4.

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

social media posts, a genre as new as it is fertile, in which discourses crystallize and renew themselves and, above all, which reveals itself as another field of human activity and, as such, has interaction as a cornerstone of existence.

This article is the result of a doctoral research that analyzes the discourse related to motherhood, based on statements produced in social networks by mothers about the mothering itself. Its main focus is the identification of the *ethos* in these posts, that is, the image of themselves that these author-mothers intend to pass on to readers through linguistic materiality. This investigation is at the heart of an object of study that is currently fruitful, which already has works devoted to scrutinizing the discourses related to mothers. Researchers from different fields, such as Discourse Analysis itself, consider the academic pertinence of understanding how mothers have taken advantage of the networks to create a new ideology (or update the current one) about the craft of caring for children and already highlight a discursive movement towards the counter-discursive⁵ axiological axis. It is important to point out that trends, knowledge, beliefs and values from different fields, such as religious, feminist, medical and the internet itself flow from these statements, and it is from this rich and fertile field of content that the interest in unraveling the context arises in which these posts appear and how they can be signified in the light of Discourse Analysis. It is justified, therefore, to reflect on the usufruct of a hashtag in a social network both to identify which discourse is linked to it (or which discourses are linked to it - as will be seen, the possibilities of affiliation are plural) and to point out which meanings about being a mother and about mothering currently permeate the statements produced about motherhood – not by chance, these meanings are part of the heteroglossia discussed here.

The present article, then, will reflect on the production of 5 Instagram posts that contain the discourse linked to "real motherhood," illuminating it in the light of Bakhtinian wisdom from concepts such as interaction and heteroglossia, productive for the analysis of statements taken from social networks, and also from the Lacanian concept of the "real," after all, it is in search of this "real" that mothers reveal their experiences to the public.

⁵ It is worth mentioning as emblematic works in this clipping: OLIVEIRA-CRUZ, Milena Freire de; MENDONÇA, Maria Collier de (Org.). *Maternidade nas mídias*.1. ed. Santa Maria: Facos - UFSM, 2021 and LAUXEN, J., & QUADRADO, R. P. Maternidade sem romantismos: alguns olhares sobre as maternidades e os sujeitos-mãe na contemporaneidade. *RELACult - Revista Latino-Americana de Estudos em Cultura e Sociedade*, 4, 2018.

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

1 #maternidadereal

According to Trotta (2016, p.1),

Among the many hashtags that appear every day, the #DesafioDaMaternidade [Maternitychallenge] was launched, as well as the countless Facebook chains, the challenge was easy: women should publish 3 or 4 photos that demonstrate their happiness in being a mother, and tag other women who supposedly would do the same. The hashtag multiplied in perfect order until a post by a 23-year-old housewife surprised everyone by not accepting the challenge, and not talking about the consequent happiness of motherhood, but pointing out that such a current could be deceiving. other women, because being a mother would not be just an experience of contentment and satisfaction.⁶

This girl, by not acquiescing to the challenge, on 2/15/2016, made a post in which she explained her reasons for rejecting the challenge, stressing that perfect motherhood was a fallacy.

Challenge NOT accepted! I refuse to be another tool to deceive other women that motherhood is a bed of roses and that every woman was born to play this role. I'm going to launch another challenge, the REAL MATERNITY [REAL MATERNITY] challenge. From everything mothers go through and people don't appreciate it, as if every woman had already been programmed to live it. Post photos of discomfort with motherhood and report your biggest fears or your worst experiences so that more women know the reality we go through. They say that in the end everything always ends well, but the middle of the process is often slow and painful. First, I want to make it clear that I love my son but I hate being a mother. And I don't think it's going to get any better even when he's my current age (Trotta, 2016, p.1).⁷

⁶ In the original: "Em meio às muitas hashtags que surgem a cada dia foi lançado o #DesafioDaMaternidade, assim como as inúmeras correntes do Facebook o desafio era fácil: mulheres deveriam publicar 3 ou 4 fotos que demonstrassem a felicidade delas em ser mãe, e marcar outras mulheres que supostamente fariam o mesmo. A hashtag se multiplicava em perfeita ordem até que um post de uma dona de casa de 23 anos surpreendeu a todas(os) ao não aceitar o desafio, e não versar sobre a felicidade consequente da maternidade, e sim apontar que tal corrente poderia estar iludindo outras mulheres, pois ser mãe não seria uma experiência apenas de contentamentos e satisfações."

⁷ In the original: "Desafio NÃO aceito! Me recuso a ser mais uma ferramenta pra iludir outras mulheres de que a maternidade é um mar de rosas e que toda mulher nasceu pra desempenhar esse papel. Eu vou lançar outro desafio, o desafio da MATERNIDADE REAL. De tudo o que as mães passam e as pessoas não dão valor, como se toda mulher já tivesse sido programada pra viver isso. Postem fotos de desconforto com a maternidade e relatem seus maiores medos ou suas piores experiências pra que mais mulheres saibam da realidade que passamos. Dizem que no final sempre acaba tudo bem, mas o meio do processo por muitas

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

Trotta (2016) highlights the reprisals – including from the Facebook platform itself, where the text was posted and from which it was banned – received for this outburst. The author explains that this type of content seemed a threat to a socially established and accepted paradigm that motherhood is divine and free from complaints. Eventually, hundreds of women felt represented by the words of the housewife and thus the #maternidadereal movement was inaugurated. A synthesis of the tradition of studies on interaction, proposed by Faraco, speaks directly to this example: "This whole tradition has shown us, on the one hand, how we respond constitutively to immediate contextual conditions; and, on the other, how recurrent cultural practices shape our interactions" (Faraco, 2005, p.2015).⁸ By breaking with an ingrained cultural practice, in which the reproduction of a current discourse is what is expected, the report surprises, escaping from traditional (and even automated) interaction and launching the need for a new type of response.

At first, having already the understanding of #maternidadereal as a focus, it is necessary to consider the meaning of "real." Jacques Lacan, a psychoanalyst who focused on the human psychic constitution, brings multiple reflections on what is real, although all of them have a barely palpable meaning. As the specialist studies point out,

The real is "what is strictly unthinkable," it is the impossible to be symbolized; the real is, *par excellence*, the trauma, which is not capable of being assimilated by the psychic apparatus, which has no possible representation. Therefore, the real is also that which returns to the same place, since the symbolic cannot displace it, and the point of non-sense that it implies is repeated insistently as a radical lack of meaning (Jorge, 2010, p.11).⁹

vezes é lento e doloroso. Primeiramente eu quero deixar bem claro que eu amo meu filho mas to detestando ser mãe. E acho que isso não vai melhorar nem quando ele tiver a minha idade atual."

⁸ In the original, "Toda essa tradição nos tem mostrado, de um lado, como respondemos constitutivamente às condições contextuais imediatas; e, de outro, como práticas culturais recorrentes moldam nossas interações."

⁹ In the original, "O real é "o que é estritamente impensável", é o impossível de ser simbolizado; o real é, por excelência, o trauma, o que não é passível de ser assimilado pelo aparelho psíquico, o que não tem qualquer representação possível. Por isso, o real é também aquilo que retorna ao mesmo lugar, já que o simbólico não consegue deslocá-lo, e o ponto de não-senso que ele implica se repete insistentemente enquanto radical falta de sentido."

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

A fundamental distinction established by Lacan is between real and fantasy. Pleasure would reside in fantasy, while reality would be a kind of escort for the drive to achieve it: that is, between the realization of pleasure and the drive for it, there is reality, a protector against eventual ephemeris harmful to the flow of this drive. In a less metaphorical way, between the real and the fantasy there is language (Jorge, 2010), the symbolic bridge that allows man to transit between the real world and his heaven of enjoyment. Humans need tools to decipher the real: "Reality is what we see, what we imagine, therefore, given that it is the image with which we have to deal. The real, on the other hand, is what is seen, but which can be deduced, demonstrated as true" (Gorog, 2019, p.31).¹⁰

In the context in which this utterance is produced - by women who are mothers, in a virtual channel, on social networks, disseminated to several recipients -, the "real" is equivalent, in principle, to an antonym of "perfect" (as will be seen, this meaning is porous and re-signifies itself according to the author's intentions). Perfect motherhood would be a forged and impossible condition, in which there would be no mistakes and setbacks and everything would go as planned and desired – from the education of the children to the mother's routine. At the same time, this "perfect" motherhood can be represented (with a photo produced especially to denote an impeccable routine or with an articulated text to sweeten the difficulties inherent in raising a child), while the "real" would be unpublishable. The hashtag "*maternidade real*," thus, emerges in an attempt to overturn the illusion that permeates the profession of mothering.

The image of sacralized motherhood is present in all social circles, from mass culture products (such as soap operas and movies) to advertising, passing through common sense, and is perpetuated by everyday speech and popular proverbs that have found fertile cultivation in the social networks, a place where life is glamorized and where, from photos, one can make a cut of life, summarizing it in enchanting and pleasant moments - considering the aforementioned movement Maternity Challenge. If there is a #maternidadereal [real maternity], it is because there is another: docile, sugary motherhood, without conflicts. Under the aegis of "real maternity," then, stumbles, failure, everyday life would be found. But not just that:

¹⁰ In the original, "A realidade é aquela que vemos, a que imaginamos, portanto, dado que é a imagem com a qual temos de lidar. O real, por outro lado, é aquilo que se vê, mas que pode ser deduzido, ser demonstrado como verdadeiro."

Bakhtiniana, São Paulo, 18 (2): 179-204, April/June 2023.

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

The living utterance, having taken meaning and shape at a particular historical moment in a socially specific environment, cannot fail to brush up against thousands of living dialogic threads, woven by socio-ideological consciousness around the given object of an utterance; it cannot fail to become an active participant in social dialogue (Bakhtin, 1981, 276).¹¹

According to Bakhtinian knowledge, utterances are organic and permeable. As language cannot be dammed and the margins that delineate it escape us all the time, the same value of the real can be assigned to multiple situations - a moment of relief is "#maternidadereal," but a moment of tenderness and warmth is also true for it. The hashtag, then, migrates from a label of veracity (or even of verisimilitude) to encompass other situations, so plural that they lose the primary referential - as will be seen in the analysis section, it is already possible to find "#maternidadereal" in random posts, demonstrating the attractiveness of the hashtag, which is now used less as a cause slogan and more as a decoy for an audience interested in posts of this nature.

Apart from this marketing use, #maternidadereal, therefore, is a response to a social demand (tacit or explicit) regarding a behavior expected of mothers. Such a response can be both contesting, refracting a status quo that requires a type of posture and an ideal of a mother, as well as appeasing, showing that the woman is doing well in the role of mother or delighted to be one. And if the #maternidadereal emerged to delineate an axiological position and was, in fact, an identity marking of a group of mothers who refused to adhere to a modular maternity, this boundary was corrupted, as will be seen.

2 Interaction and Heteroglossia

The simple act of having this type of post already deserves a reflection. To live is to interact, as Bakhtin teaches. And according to what Feuerbach postulates, resumed by Faraco (2005), interaction is a transcendental condition of existence: the I is impossible without YOU, therefore, I only exist when there is a YOU, and it is this to whom I will forge my existence. And because we become ME from the OTHER, this "I" needs to

Bakhtiniana, São Paulo, 18 (2): 179-204, April/June 2023.

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

¹¹ For reference, see footnote 2.

show oneself and take a position (Bakhtin, 1986).¹² In a *locus* where exposure and opinion are privileged, such as social networks, the I only exists as a content producer. The utterances are the result of exchanges and sharing in a movement like "I want to show who I am, but I need the other to validate it." In addition, social networks encompass a very specific space for the construction of the SELF, since their *raison d'être* is interaction – it is the primary reason they exist, and they only exist for that reason. As Silva reflects,

I have the impression that if Bakhtin were alive he would be tireless in analyzing the discourses that social networks produce. There are countless statements being (re)constructed at every moment, by countless subjects, each with their reality of life, values, needs and among other things; in a dialogical and polyphonic flow (Silva, p.98, 2015).¹³

The researcher also provides a good definition of interactions in social networks, in the light of Bakhtinian assumptions:

Therefore, it can be said that social networks are configured as another space where individuals have the opportunity to produce their statements or try to establish dialogues (laden with values, ideologies, intentions, intonations...), and these are received by others on the network, differently for each one, and even not responding or "enjoying" what was read, this will produce an image, even if mentally, of the author, of the situation of what was written (Silva, p.99, 2015).¹⁴

Faraco (2005, p.219) launches set a statement that enlightens this perception about the motivations for taking a stand: "How much pain, how much suffering, how many subjective fragilities, how much psychic death due to the absence or refusal of

¹² For reference, see footnote 4

¹³ In the original, "Tenho a impressão de que se Bakhtin fosse vivo ele seria incansável na análise dos discursos que as redes sociais produzem. São inúmeros enunciados sendo (re)construídos a cada momento, por inúmeros sujeitos, cada qual com sua realidade de vida, valores, necessidades e entre outras coisas; num fluxo dialógico e polifônico."

¹⁴ In the original, "Portanto, pode-se dizer que as redes sociais se configuram por ser mais um espaço onde os indivíduos têm a oportunidade de produzir seus enunciados ou tentar estabelecer diálogos (carregados de valores, ideologias, intenções, entonações...), e estes são recebidos pelos outros da rede, de forma diferente para cada um, e mesmo não respondendo ou "curtindo" o que foi lido, isso produzirá uma imagem, mesmo que mentalmente, do autor, da situação daquilo que foi escrito."

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

recognition!"¹⁵ We need this exchange so that our existence (and here, on and offline merge) is consummated. A post not liked, not "loved," not commented, that is, a post like this being ignored is equivalent to silencing, to a lack of visibility, and this generates an irreparable narcissistic fissure in the subject. In the field of virtual relationships, tools are used to reinforce and guide interactions. By linking the text to a hashtag, the possibility of this damage decreases when the post is related to a feature that makes it more noticeable on the platform as a whole through search engines, and not just for that segment of followers. In short: by inserting the tag, users looking for it can find it, which reinforces the bonds of identification and approval of the exposed content.

By escaping the clippings of this brief study, we will not dwell at length on the condition of being a mother in our contemporary Brazilian society, but, in summary, it can be said: after decades or even centuries of silenced or muffled voice, mothers find a stronghold to re-exist as human beings, beyond motherhood. The internet has become, at the same time, a refuge and stage for pregnant women or women with already born children - in posts, blogs, forums and social networks they meet, listen and talk about themselves and about motherhood. In this sharing, when enunciating their own motherhood, they manage to appropriate it, making the object more palpable, with clearer contours. And if language is unavoidable (Heidegger *apud* Faraco), it is only through it that the subject can recognize oneself. Thus, writing and publishing about motherhood is meant to exist, for the other to see it, admire it, envy it or even welcome it in its imperfection and identify with it. "I am not alone," some utterances seem to say, while others whisper "look at me."

And it is through language that they will materialize these feelings, it is through language that mothers communicate pain and discomfort, and it is also through language that they praise the maternal practice. The feeling gains colors, textures and layers when verbalized. Language is ideologically fulfilled. As the philosopher explains, "At any given moment of its evolution, language is stratified (...) into languages that are socio-ideological" (Bakhtin, 1981, pp.271-2).¹⁶ The creation and appropriation of meanings and the sliding of others form a group identity:

¹⁵ In the original, "Quanta dor, quanto sofrimento, quantas fragilidades subjetivas, quanta morte psíquica pela ausência ou pela recusa do reconhecimento!"

¹⁶ For reference, see footnote 2.

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

And this stratification and heteroglossia, once realized, is not only a static invariant of linguistic life, but also what insures its dynamics: stratification and heteroglossia widen and deepen as long as language is alive and developing. Alongside the centripetal forces, the centrifugal forces of language carry on their uninterrupted work; alongside verbal-ideological centralization and unification, the uninterrupted process of decentralization and desunification go forward (Bakhtin, 1981, p.272).¹⁷

Each axiological position materializes an utterance. The same language that crystallized the utterance "unconditional love" as a maternal axiom, and, step by step, as an expression intrinsic to the experience of mothers, also gave vitality to the neologism "mothering," a verb that in its semantic root reveals a special purpose of educating children - not just raising them, but reflecting, politically, ideologically and consciously on this act -, linked to a well-marked axiological position. "Unconditional love" and "mothering" can be uttered by the same mother, however, while one expression takes up a Christian ideology, which advocates maternal love as divine, the greatest and only real, the other is contemporary and combative, that establishes an empowered positioning of women.

And as Bakthin also postulates, we are not the origin of words - everything has already been said, everything has already been stated. We endorse, refute and recreate the speech of others. It is in this fuss, in what came before and in what antagonizes, that the discourse is forged, using several others, absorbing and repelling, in a continuous and inescapable process, from which *heteroglossia* emerges, another concept coined and discussed by the philosopher and for reflection on the #maternidadereal.

Heteroglossia is the presupposition of the construction of this statement. Heteroglossia is "the internal stratification of any single national language into social dialects, characteristic group behavior, professional jargons, generic languages" (Bakhtin, 1981, p.262),¹⁸ and the philosopher continues listing different instances in which language can be broken, or, on the other hand, citing differences at different levels (social, cultural) and scopes (age group, sex) that crystallize a way of speaking, a tone, a voice. As Faraco (2005, p.219) explains, heteroglossia is

¹⁷ For reference, see footnote 2.

¹⁸ For reference, see footnote 2.

Bakhtiniana, São Paulo, 18 (2): 179-204, April/June 2023.

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

a multiple and heterogeneous set of voices or social languages and (...) the continuous process of encounters and disagreements, of acceptance and refusal, of absorption and transmutation of social voices - a phenomenon that he [Bakhtin] calls dialogized heteroglossia.¹⁹

Heteroglossia, then, is this coexistence between multiple voices - they all speak the same language, but each one dissolves, in its semantics, in its syntax, the particularities, ideologies, sociocultural diversities that surround that particular group that acquiesces to that discourse. This dissonance is identified in the discourses related to motherhood. If talking about motherhood that is linked to a more Christian tradition has a sweeter taste, with words that inspire docility and romanticize the stories (the use of diminutives or a childish vocabulary are, therefore, instrumental to give this sweeter tone), the statements affiliated to this "real maternity" are more arid, more assertive, more cutting. And it is not only in this vocality that they are distinguished - the content, of course, is the great guarantor of the matter: the same language and the same object can be treated with different approaches - on the one hand, a rosy experience and passionate expressed by some mothers; on the other, a deeper and more intimate dive, from which pain and relief emerge. In the dialogized heteroglossia, the ideas about being a mother are woven by different voices, from the one that ratifies the sacralization of the function to the voice that rebels against this dogma. There is, therefore, a hegemonic discourse, in which the aforementioned crystallized and romanticized discourse is perpetuated, and a counter-hegemonic discourse, which now emerges and which opposes this romanticization. As will be seen, the statements analyzed here are examples of heteroglossia because they belong to different women, who are subject to different contexts, and sometimes they are affiliated with the hegemonic discourse, sometimes with the counter-hegemonic. Age, social class, number of children, presence or absence of a partner, moment of life are some of the elements that modalize the voice of the enunciators and engender the language according to the experiences and intentions of that post - and this plural set of posts, although quite restricted, according to the limits of this

¹⁹ In the original, "um conjunto de múltiplo e heterogêneo de vozes ou línguas sociais e (...) o contínuo processo de encontros e desencontros, de aceitação e recusa, de absorção e transmutação das vozes sociais - fenômeno que ele [Bakhtin] designa de heteroglossia dialogizada."

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

article, already raises some notes about what these mothers consider the "real" of motherhood.

3 Analysis of Statements

On a quick search on Instagram more than 7 million entries could be found tagged with "#maternidadereal." This number is representative, as it shows how the expression is productive and has been widely used - as can be seen, its use is directed to any theme related to motherhood, from posts with little content in the caption to longer and more complex texts, in which there is a report of some pain or epiphany by the author of that speech. As Bakhtin teaches, "it is precisely in the process of living interaction with this specific environment that the word may be individualized and given stylistic shape" (Bakhtin, 1981, p.276).²⁰ That is, each utterance will have the tone and flavor of its author, making it unique, even if made by all these sayings associated with maternal discourses. There is no "pure" speech, all of them are tainted by the words of others.

The word, directed toward its object, enters a dialogically agitated and tension-filled environment of alien words, value judgments and accents, weaves in and out of complex interrelationships, merges with some, recoils from others, intersects with yet a third group: and all this may crucially shape discourse, may leave a trace in all its semantic layers, may complicate its expression and influence its entire stylistic profile (Bakhtin, 1981, p.277).²¹

And at the same time that these utterances are permeated with the speech of others, in this interaction game, users act with and on the language, and nuance the language to raise their own flags, privileging certain words and expressions that direct the discourse to certain axiological positions. There is always the double movement of activity (Humboldbt *apud* Faraco) of something that remains, of visions and ideas that perpetuate, solidify and branch out through time and generations, and something transitory, intellectually elaborated, an individual mental work, of creativity and renewal. This is how the meanings emerge: "(...) in this complex *chiaroscuro* game enters the discourse that is permeated by it, which in it cuts its own semantic contours" (Faraco, 2005,

²⁰ For reference, see footnote 2.

²¹ For reference, see footnote 2.

Bakhtiniana, São Paulo, 18 (2): 179-204, April/June 2023.

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

p.220).²² As determined by Gadet and Pêcheux (apud Faraco, 2005, p.220), ²³ "meaning does not pre-exist its constitution in discursive processes,"²⁴ that is, meaning is subordinated to the subject who enunciates it, which, in turn, points to the utterance for a discourse with which it dialogues and to which it is affiliated. The "#maternidadereal" can go beyond a position and become a defense cry, an attempt at psychic appeasement or even a maneuver of belonging. As will be evidenced in the posts, each author will mobilize her own senses when enjoying the expression. Furthermore, as Faraco (2009, p.7) teaches, "every cultural act (including any and all concrete utterances, every and each manifestation of situated verbal language) is primarily a responsive act,"²⁵ and this act assumes a position axiological, evidencing values with which it agrees. The meaning of #maternidadereal will be one that agrees with the author's repertoire of experiences and beliefs, which can either belong to practices linked to the traditional discourse about being a mother or contest it. Furthermore, just as the language is alive, the utterances, even the crystallized ones, that constitute it are also alive. If #maternidadereal was conceived in a moment of confrontation, to mark the dissonance to a hegemonic discourse and indicate an antagonistic position to the romanticized view of motherhood, now its use does not necessarily obey such a rule, but comes to life, colors and layers. "Language enters life through concrete utterances (which manifes language) and life enters language through concrete utterances as well" (Bakhtin, 1986, p.63):²⁶ the primary function with which the hashtag was conceived is not lost, but meanings are incorporated to it as its use is disseminated to different mothers.

Next, 5 posts with such tag were selected, which will be analyzed in the light of the precepts discussed herein. The choice of these posts was carried out randomly throughout the first half of March 2021 from the search, in the Instagram tool, for #maternidadereal. There was, at the time, no other filter to guide the selection, only attention to encompass different profiles of mothers, in order to capture the live use of the

²² In the original, "(...) nesse complexo jogo claro-escuro entra o discurso que dele se impregna, que nele lapida seus próprios contornos semânticos."

²³ GADET, F. e PÊCHEUX, M. A língua inatingível: o discurso na história da linguística. Campinas: Pontes, 2004.

²⁴ In the original, "o sentido não preexiste à sua constituição nos processos discursivos."

²⁵ In the original, "Todo ato cultural (aí incluído todo e qualquer enunciado concreto, toda e qualquer manifestação da linguagem verbal situada) é, primordialmente, um ato responsivo."

²⁶ For reference, see footnote 4

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

hashtag. To maintain the authors' privacy, the names of the users of the accounts as well as their children were omitted.

Post 1- #maternidadereal [realmaternity] with Advertising Dialogue

In the account of user 1, in a post dated April 21, 2021, the following caption appears:

Eccee mom, 24 weeks, everyone already notices that you are not walking alone 💬 💽

<u>#gravida</u> <u>#gestante</u> <u>#maedemenina</u> <u>#gravidez</u> <u>#maedemenino</u> <u>#materni</u> <u>dade</u> <u>#bebe</u> <u>#baby</u> <u>#maededuas</u> <u>#love</u> <u>#maternidadereal</u> <u>#photography</u> <u>#familia</u> <u>#modagestante</u> <u>#mamae</u> <u>#gestação</u> <u>#mom</u> <u>#momlife</u>²⁷

As already suggested, "#maternidadereal" can only be a public decoy, without, in fact, linking a reflection on a mothering with (and of) truth. In the linguistic materiality of the utterance, there is no indication of what "real motherhood" would be or what the author means with it – the marking, therefore, as well as the others that accompany it, such as "#mamãe" (mommy) or "#gestação" (pregnancy) are not intended to report an episode in the life of this mother or a specific report, but to link this post to a search engine that can be activated by other users in search of this type of content. Advertising posts, for example, use this strategy without the material having traces of the report that one would expect to find with such a hashtag. This is an example of a post that only reproduces the expression to echo a trend, given the other tags that came with the publication. The "real" here, therefore, is emptied of Lacanian interpretation. The photo that illustrates the post shows a pregnant woman showing off a red dress. It cannot, however, be said that this is a neutral statement, given the advertising content that permeates it. Transparency is a fallacy, as Faraco (2005) ponders. Meaning is not a mere decoding of the sign, but the result of deeper layers that can escape the individual's own rationalization. In this case, the meaning is only grasped when reflecting on the context - the desire to sell and the intention to talk to women who might look for that hashtag. The enunciating voice of this post, in addition to being a salesperson (or influencer, in cybernetic language), is a

²⁷ In the original: "Éeeee mamãe, 24 semanas, todo mundo já vê que você não anda sozinha 🐺 🏠 <u>#gravida #gestante #maedemenina #gravidez #maedemenino #maternidade #bebe #baby #maededuas #lo</u> <u>ve #maternidadereal #photography #familia #modagestante #mamae #gestação #mom #momlife</u>"

Bakhtiniana, São Paulo, 18 (2): 179-204, April/June 2023.

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

solo mother who earns income from the internet, that is, in addition to wanting to promote products, there is a kind of authority of this subject to talk about motherhood.

Post 2- #maternidadereal [realmaternity] with Love in Evidence

In a post by user 2, on March 10, 2021, the following caption reads:

MONTH BIRTHDAY OF MY PRINCESS! 🕮

9 months ago the best of me was born, my sweet little X. The greatest love of my life, my dream in the form of people, the little piece of heaven that God sent with the purpose of completely changing my life, starting from within out of me. Nine months that I could feel the greatest blessing of my entire life, conceived for me, for my daughter, for my light, this little piece of Mom outside her body. I still feel the feeling of being close together feeling your every little move, my little doll. Since you were born, my X, I've known my best side, my best version, my most potent weapon, LOVE! A mother was born with you, a true woman. I never imagined that I would be as strong as I am today. Motherhood is not easy, but it is without a doubt the best school in life. I know that since I saw you and smelled you for the first time, I left behind an innocent and silly girl and I could see life as it really is. Fairy tales do not exist. But without a doubt, being a mother goes far beyond that. God has a very big purpose for our lives, both of us, me for you and you for me, my beautiful girl. God, thank you for the greatest gift I could ever get, my daughter, my little girl, my sweet X. I am fulfilled for having you, all the love in the world I have to give you! I love you more than anyone else in this world. Without you my life would be meaningless. I love you unconditionally, daughter.

•#amordemae #mae #maternidadereal #maternidade #amorverdadeiro #amorpuro²⁸

²⁸ In the original: "MESVERSÁRIO DA MINHA PRINCESA! 2 Há 9 meses nasceu o melhor de mim, minha pequena e doce X. O maior amor da minha vida, o meu sonho em forma de gente, o pedacinho de céu que Deus mandou com o propósito de mudar completamente a minha vida, começando de dentro pra fora de mim. Nove meses que pude sentir a maior benção de toda minha vida a mim concebida, a minha filha, a minha luz, esse pedacinho da mamãe fora do corpo dela. Ainda sinto a sensação de estar bem juntinha sentindo cada pequeno movimento teu, minha bonequinha. Desde que você nasceu, minha X, eu conheci o meu melhor lado, a minha melhor versão, a minha mais potente arma, O AMOR! Nasceu junto de ti uma mãe, uma verdadeira mulher. Jamais imaginei que seria tão forte o quanto hoje sou. Maternidade não é fácil, mas sem dúvidas é a melhor escola da vida. Sei que desde que eu te vi e senti teu cheirinho pela primeira vez, eu deixei para trás uma menina inocente e boba e pude enxergar a vida como realmente é. Contos de fadas não existem. Mas sem dúvidas ser mãe vai muito além disso. Deus tem um propósito muito grande para a nossa vida, nós duas, eu por você e você por mim, minha menina linda. Deus, obrigado pelo maior presente que eu poderia ganhar, minha filha, minha menininha, minha doce X. Eu sou realizada por ter você, todo amor do mundo eu tenho pra te dar! Te amo muito além do que qualquer outra pessoa nesse mundo. Sem você minha vida não teria sentido. Te amo incondicionalmente, filha. •#amordemae #mae #maternidadereal #maternidade #amorverdadeiro #amorpuro"

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

In this example, in the very first words, the passion with which the mother describes motherhood is latent, demonstrating that she is intoxicated with the feeling of having a child. Already said and even expressions of current use are found in this excerpt, such as "best of me," "greatest love of my life," "little piece of heaven," "better side," "greatest gift," "I love you unconditionally."

The language is loaded with adjectives, superlatives and diminutives, which brings a sweeter tone and exalts both the assumed role of mother and the presence of the baby in her life. This is a sensitive point, by the way: the complimentary tone is not only for motherhood, but also for herself as a mother.

The reservations have no force and disappear amidst the romantic outpouring, as they are not developed and, again, seem to echo what has already been said, in an almost automated act of organizing the discourses of others about difficulties just to mention that they exist, without the author herself to guarantee them. In this post, the structuring axiological axis is the hegemonic one, while the super addressee is managed precisely to reinforce this hegemony, and it is both the religious discourse (with direct mention of God) and common sense (with the clichés), that unite and complete each other in the mission of cementing the immaculate ideals of motherhood. As Bakhtin (1981, p.276)²⁹ resumes it,

The living utterance, having taken meaning and shape at a particular historical moment in a socially specific environment, cannot fail to brush up against thousands of living dialogic threads, woven by socioideological consciousness around the given object [or referent] of an utterance; it cannot fail to become an active participant in social dialogue.

Excerpts such as "Motherhood is not easy, but without a doubt it is the best school in life" symbolize this, as the author does not write in what sense it is not easy and what learning is gained since becoming a mother. Already in the excerpt: "I know that since I saw you and smelled you for the first time, I left behind an innocent and silly girl and was able to see life as it really is. Fairy tales do not exist. But without a doubt, being a mother goes far beyond that." perhaps it refers to the idea of #maternidadereal (real maternity) with which the post is marked, but despite this statement, the whole construction and

²⁹ For reference, see footnote 2.

Bakhtiniana, São Paulo, 18 (2): 179-204, April/June 2023.

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

language allude to a fairy tale, there is a "pink cadence," which rocks the maternal love almost like a diaphanous feeling, so great and powerful that it obliterates any difficulty which even exists, but is so tiny that it doesn't even deserve to be commented on. The "real" here, forged through words, symbolizes a motherhood that takes up an ideal of sacredness and perfection, that is, the "real motherhood" of this author is virtuous, supported by loving and transforming experiences. The "real," therefore, portrayed here is the "real" of passion, mixed with fantasy and enhanced through language.

Post 3 - #maternidadereal [real maternity]: the Mother is Still a Person

In a post by user 3, on March 14, 2021, the following caption reads:

You are a mother, but you are still Ana. You are a mother, but you are still Bia. You are a mother, but you are still Joana, Renata, Carol, Letícia... You are a mother, not a machine. You are made of bones, blood, skin, not iron. You are human in the first place. Do you feel tired, often unwell and sometimes discouraged, and you know what? It's OK! Because let's face it, being a mother is one of the most amazing things in the world, but in real maternity, we feel that way a lot of times. So don't feel guilty about asking someone to stay with your child for a few minutes so you can take a shower, eat, walk, do something just for you... You deserve more than everything to take a day off for that long bath, for making up, for that hydration in your hair and for that outfit that may make you feel wonderful and take beautiful pictures. You not only deserve it, you NEED it. Put it in your mind that you NEED to take care of yourself. That you MUST love yourself and pay attention to yourself too. That you are a HUMAN, with feelings, thoughts and emotions, just like anyone else. Many people put on in our minds that after we become mothers we are just mothers, NO! Before being a mother you were already a woman, you were already a daughter, you were already a girlfriend/wife, you were already a friend, you were already YOU. \heartsuit

<u>#autocuidado</u> <u>#makeup</u> <u>#mulher</u> <u>#saudemental</u> <u>#maternidadereal</u> <u>#bele</u> <u>za</u> <u>#maeadolescente</u> <u>#mãe</u>³⁰

³⁰ In the original: "Você é mãe, mas ainda é a Ana. Você é mãe, mas ainda é a Bia. Você é mãe, mas ainda é a Joana, Renata, Carol, Letícia... Você é mãe, não uma máquina. Você é feita de ossos, sangue, pele, não ferro. Você, antes de tudo, é humana. Você se sente cansada, indisposta muitas vezes e desanimada algumas vezes, e quer saber? Tá tudo bem! Porque vamos ser bem sinceros, ser mãe é uma das coisas mais incríveis do mundo, mas na maternidade real, nos sentimos assim muitas vezes. Então não se sinta culpada por pedir pra alguém ficar com o seu filho(a) uns minutos pra você poder tomar um banho, comer, caminhar, fazer algo só pra você... Você mais do que merece tirar um dia pra tomar aquele banho bem demorado, se maquiar, fazer aquela hidratação no cabelo e por aquela roupa que você se sente maravilhosa e tirar lindas fotos. Você não só merece, como PRECISA disso. Ponha na sua cabeça que você PRECISA cuidar de si mesma. Que você DEVE se amar e dar atenção a você também. Que você é um HUMANO, com sentimentos, pensamentos e emoções, como qualquer outra pessoa. Muitas pessoas gostam de por nas nossas cabeças que depois que nos tornamos mães somos apenas mãe, NÃO! Antes de ser mãe você já era

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

If in the previous post the author exulted herself as a mother, here #maternidadereal operates in another sense: despite being a mother, you are a person. Your life cannot be summed up in motherhood. The author-mother ponders: "being a mother is one of the most incredible things in the world," but, unlike the previous post, this positive statement is diluted throughout the text, in which vicissitudes arising from the maternal condition are revealed. The "real," in this context, operates as a caveat: despite being a mother, the mother remains an individual, a subject independent of the being to whom she gave life. As already mentioned, since the "real is impossible to be symbolized," this "real" mother is seeking, through language (and this post), to represent how she sees herself in this role and groping, in verbal materiality, her own identity, diluted between the subject he is and the mother subject he has become.

In addition, there is a work to humanize the mother - while Post 2 talks about God, here the word HUMAN is even highlighted, in capital letters, remembering that feelings, thoughts and emotions (not always elevated and beautiful) are common to everyone. Even at the beginning, the author reinforces: mothers are made of blood, skin and bones, they are not diaphanous beings and immune to sadness, disappointments and boredom.

Here, it is noted that the #maternidadereal is linked to an idea of demystifying the sacralized aura of motherhood. In this real maternity, the mother does not cancel herself and does not cease to exist as a subject, in all the complexity of roles and even social masks that this individual incorporates just because she had children. The author of this post, it is worth noting, is a teenage mother, who had her daughter at age 18, is not married.

It is interesting to note that the voice of the other is evoked here (which would be, precisely, the hegemonic axiological axis) – "Many people put on in our minds that after we become mothers we are just mothers, NO!" –, in a responsive and refractory gesture of a socially sedimented discourse, which in this work we are assuming as the current and traditional discourse. Here, the two opposing axiological positions are visualized: while one is a supporter of a pacified and selfless motherhood, in which the mother's life is totally turned to the child, a new position, antagonistic to this one, emerges, contesting

uma mulher, você já era filha, você já era namorada/esposa, você já era amiga, você já era VOCÊ. 🛠 🛇 <u>#autocuidado</u> <u>#makeup #mulher</u> <u>#saudemental</u> <u>#maternidadereal</u> <u>#beleza</u> <u>#maeadolescente</u> <u>#mãe</u>

this common sense that it determined (and still determines) social practices and stereotypes. It is in this vast network, in which discourses confront, complete and disperse each other that the hetero-discourse on motherhood is forged.

Post 4- #maternidadereal [realmaternity]: between Fatigue and Love

In a post by user 4, on March 12th, 2021, the following caption is read: "The reason for my white hair! But looking at this picture I feel like the strongest woman in the world! In the same way that they take away my strength, they strengthen me! How do you feel looking at your children?"³¹

This post, although short, is emblematic for proving the inescapable duality in which motherhood finds itself: children are the mother's strength and they take away the strength of the woman. They are the reason for the white hair, but they are the reason for the smile (in the photo that accompanies the text, the author is with her four children around a birthday table, clearly happy with the children's presence). Heteroglossia is the basis of this discourse: we have someone here – a mother of four children, that is, with experience in this profession – who already feels comfortable confessing that motherhood is not only wonderful, but also constituted by difficulties and exhaustion, but, at the same time, he still sees romanticism and is happy in this role. Maybe this is an example of #maternidadereal (real maternity), in which a mixture of feelings are interspersed, and the Manichaeism of "unconditional love" is exchanged for the honesty of a love that exists and resists, however, it also tires. The axiological axis, therefore, is a point of balance between the hegemonic and the counter-hegemonic discourse, while the "real" is not a confrontation between fantasy and routine, but the meeting of the two.

Post 5 - #maternidadereal [real maternity]- Vicissitude and Publicity

In a post by user 5, on March 10th, 2021, the following caption reads:

Those who follow me here know about my fight against X reflux! Thank God Gabi is better and I am calmer too. You know how fragile and scared I was after the choking she had. What has saved and helped me daily is the anti-reflux mattress from @(store) n It has greatly

³¹ In the original, "Motivo dos meus cabelos brancos! Mas ao olhar essa foto eu me sinto a mulher mais forte desse mundo! Da mesma forma que me tiram as forças eles me fortalecem! Como você se sente ao olhar seus filhos?"

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

improved her sleep quality and consequently mom and dad's too! This mattress, in addition to being very comfortable, was designed to combat the negative effects of reflux. The supine position and the elevation of 45° positively influence the digestive process, preventing the milk from "coming back" and the baby regurgitating, improving heartburn and abdominal pain, allowing the baby to suffer less and sleep much better.

I'm sharing it with you, because I'm sure this tip can help many families. After all, we are together in this beautiful mission that is motherhood. \bigotimes

<u>#maternidadereal</u> <u>#maedemenina</u> <u>#refluxoembebes</u> <u>#refluxo</u> <u>#mamaep</u> <u>rimeiraviagem</u>³²

This is a peculiar post and that's why it was selected for this analysis: at the same time that the mother reports a health problem with her daughter (that is, there is, yes, a serious issue that involves the well-being of the child, it compromises the quality of life and generates legitimate concerns), takes advantage of it to promote a brand, in an advertising campaign (in this case, discreet and almost disguised) to promote the mattress store. As this debate is beyond the scope of this essay, we will not go into further detail, but the fact is that the career of maternal influencer proves to be fruitful on social networks: influencers are mothers who use their voluminous network of followers to dictate trends and fashions, in addition to instilling certain consumption ideas and promote products and brands. It is a common practice to combine an advertisement with a post with an agenda of that mother's reality, with some fact of her life and experience to give more credibility to what is published. This mother, by the way, assumes this subject-position of influencer: she is a 30-year-old woman, upper-middle class, businesswoman with more than 30 thousand followers. Differently from Post 1, there is a discourse that supports this sale - the medical/scientific tone even overlaps the maternal tone, and it is he who assumes the dominant axiological axis to give credibility to the

<u>#maternidadereal #maedemenina #refluxoembebes #refluxo #mamaeprimeiraviagem</u>"

³² In the original: "Quem me acompanha aqui sabe da minha luta contra o refluxo da X! Graças a Deus Gabi está melhor e eu mais tranquila também. Vocês sabem o quanto fiquei fragilizada e com medo depois dos engasgos que ela teve. O que salvou e tem me ajudado diariamente é o colchão anti-refluxo da @(loja) melhorou muito a qualidade de sono dela e consequentemente da mamãe e do papai também! Esse colchão além de ser muito confortável, foi projetado para combater os efeitos negativos do refluxo. A posição supina e a elevação de 45° influem positivamente no processo digestivo, impedindo que o leite "volte" e o bebê regurgite, melhorando azia e dores abdominais, possibilitando que o bebê sofra menos e durma muito melhor.

Estou compartilhando com vocês, por que eu tenho certeza que essa dica pode ajudar muitas famílias. Afinal estamos juntas nessa missão tão linda que é a maternidade. 🗇 🙇

Bakhtiniana, São Paulo, 18 (2): 179-204, April/June 2023.

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

proposed product and that motivates the publication. The first lines announce that the mother fights against the baby's reflux, a moment in which the "real" is underlined, that is, motherhood is not only made of joys, but also of practical battles, and it is for these battles that make use of special artifacts. The "real," still, signals that not only emotional adversities, but also practical ones, are natural to motherhood: a baby with reflux, a condition that needs treatment, is not the calm and smiling baby who stars in social networks, but a being with demands that escape fantasy and become practical, concrete. At the end, the author still talks about a "tip," reinforcing the idea that motherhood is a support network and that sharing knowledge strengthens everyone involved in it. This statement is more oriented to the hegemonic axis of the discourse, because despite being linked to the #maternidadereal, it does not bring ruptures nor is it directed to confront the romanticized ideas, but to help other mothers in a more objective way.

Final Considerations

The internet provided access to a particular writing: maternal outbursts. Immersed in exchanges favored by social networks, mothers with multiple experiences and biographies can now express how they feel about their own motherhood – and they largely enjoy this tool. This opening also shed light on an aspect that until then had been little talked about and publicized about the job: the pain, the problems, and the bad days.

In this brief article, we sought to illustrate how heteroglossia is materialized in statements with divergent views - ideologically, the conception of being a "mother" and "maternity" is not univocal, with each author having a subject-position in relation to these objects, sometimes hegemonic in relation to the dominant discourse (that is, a romanticized view, which associates motherhood with sacredness), sometimes counterhegemonic (which takes a more critical stance in relation to motherhood, also revealing the natural vicissitudes of the function). In this context, the hashtag #maternidadereal emerges. This multiplicity of positions is addressed in the statements themselves, directly or indirectly, to corroborate or to safeguard the point of view (regardless of the axiomatic position assumed by each one), which characterizes the presence of heteroglossia in these discourses in living matter. The "real," thus, is also cut in particular ways: while the real for one mother is the loss of identity, for another it can be, precisely, the joy of having a

Bakhtiniana, São Paulo, 18 (2): 179-204, April/June 2023.

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

child. This understanding is crucial to scrutinize the ideas about motherhood that are being promoted today: even though there is a moment of ruptures and intense sociopolitical and cultural transformations, in which the role of the mother is debated and rethought, the existence of different "reals" ratifies that discourses do not die or are replaced, but rather are revitalized, in a continuous flow of responses to statements on the same axiological axis.

What can be deduced from this study is that the voice of the other (whether it comes from common sense or from institutional instances, such as the religious one) is not only evoked, but also fundamental in the construction of the discourse itself. It is from this interaction that the authors signify their own motherhood and seek a balance between romanticization and criticality – but both are undoubtedly real.

REFERENCES

BAKHTIN, M. O discurso no romance. *In:* BAKHTIN, M. *Questões de literatura e de estética*. A teoria do romance. 5 ed. Tradução de Aurora F. Bernadini *et al.* São Paulo: Editora Hucitec, 2002. p.71-164.

BAKHTIN, M. Os gêneros do discurso. *In:* BAKHTIN, M. *Estética da criação verbal.* 5 ed. Traduzido diretamente do russo por Paulo Bezerra. São Paulo: Martins Fontes, 2010. p.261-306.

BAKHTIN, M. *Teoria do romance I:* a estilística. Tradução, prefácio, notas e glossário de Paulo Bezerra; organização da edição russa de Serguei Botcharov e Vadim Kójinov. São Paulo: Editora 34, 2015.

FARACO, C. A. Interação e linguagem: balanço e perspectivas. Calidoscópio, v. 3, n. 1,p.214-221,2005.Disponívelem:https://revistas.unisinos.br/index.php/calidoscopio/article/view/6244.Acessoem:18mar. 2023.2023.Rest of the second seco

FARACO, C. O problema do conteúdo, do material e da forma na arte verbal. *In:* BRAIT, B. (org.) *Bakhtin: dialogismo e polifonia*. São Paulo: Contexto, 2009. p.95-111.

GOROG, J. O que é real para Lacan? *Stylus Revista da Psicanálise*, Rio de Janeiro, n. 38, p.23-33, jul. 2019. Disponível em: http://stylus.emnuvens.com.br/cs/article/view/444/268. Acesso em: 15 ago. 2021.

JORGE, M. A. C. Fundamentos da Psicanálise de Freud a Lacan. Volume 2: A *Clínica da Fantasia*. Rio de Janeiro: Zahar, 2010.

LAUXEN, J., & QUADRADO, R. P. Maternidade sem romantismos: alguns olhares sobre as maternidades e os sujeitos-mãe na contemporaneidade. *RELACult - Revista Latino-Americana de Estudos em Cultura e Sociedade*, n. 4, 2018. Disponível em:

Bakhtiniana, São Paulo, 18 (2): 179-204, April/June 2023.

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

https://periodicos.claec.org/index.php/relacult/article/view/775. Acesso em: 12 fev. 2021.

OLIVEIRA-CRUZ, M. F.; MENDONÇA, M. C. (org.). *Maternidade nas mídias*. Santa Maria: Facos - UFSM, 2021. Disponível em: <u>https://www.ufsm.br/editoras/facos/maternidade-nas-midias-2</u>. Acesso em: 14 dez. 2022.

SILVA, G. C. Linguagens digitais: um passeio pelas redes sociais e sua relação com a comunicação no contemporâneo à luz de Martino, Bakhtin e outros autores. *In:* CUNHA, A. P. A.; ROSTAS, M. H. S. G.; FREITAS, L. A. de A. (org.). *Muitos caminhos, um destino:* Conversas sobre educação. Pelotas: IFSul, 2015. Disponível em: <u>https://periodicos.ufmg.br/index.php/textolivre/article/view/16729</u>. Acesso em: 20 dez. 2022.

TROTTA, C. #MaternidadeReal: conteúdo impróprio. *In*: 30ª Reunião Brasileira de Antropologia, agosto de 2016, João Pessoa/PB. *Anais da 30ª Reunião Brasileira de Antropologia*. Disponível em: <u>http://www.30rba.abant.org.br/arquivo/downloadpublic?q=YToyOntzOjY6InBhcmFtcy</u><u>I7czozNToiYToxOntzOjEwOiJJRF9BUIFVSVZPIjtzOjQ6IjMwOTEiO30iO3M6MToi</u><u>aCI7czozMjoiNGVIMmFkNGYyMTFjYTJiNDAyMDJiN2VmODVIMmIyMWUiO30</u> %3D. Acesso em: 18 fev. 2021.

Translated by Beatrice Elaine dos Santos beatriceesantos@hotmail.com

Received July 20, 2022 Accepted March 20, 2023

Research Data and Other Materials Availability

The contents underlying the research text are included in the manuscript.

Reviews

Due to the commitment assumed by Bakhtiniana. *Revista de Estudos do Discurso* [*Bakhtiniana*. Journal of Discourse Studies] to Open Science, this journal only publishes reviews that have been authorized by all involved.

Review I

The article addresses a very contemporary theme, with a lot of plasticity to grammar Bakhtinian (social networks and real maternity) and potentially innovative if they are rephrased the following questions:

1- The ethical perspective involved in dialogism requires a positioning of the authors on the topic in question. Otherwise, writing ends up becoming just a kind of application of philosophical notions to the theme of real maternity. Would be interesting to elaborate in

201

which the article adds both to the perspective and to the debate of the theme in the world of life;

2- How the Bakhtinian allegory of carnivalization dialogues with the conceptual debate proposed? The new uses of #maternidadereal (real maternity) would not be a way of subverting the curious narrative reconstruction of expression? The criterion for the choice is not explicit in the article of the notions undertaken in the interpretive work. Also the dialectic, the force transforming data, as a social expressive field, does not raise questions or challenges to the chosen philosophical vocabulary;

3- It is important to clarify the criteria for choosing posts, their representation for the topic. I also consider it necessary to expand or deepening of dialogism in the very way of understanding/reading the utterances – the ambiguities and responsiveness to possible otherness at play in such constructions enunciative. I think that without these adjustments, the article's argument loses its innovative and contribution to the Bakhtinian approach. APPROVED WITH RESTRICTIONS [REVISION]

Marina Assis Pinheiro - Universidade Federal de Pernambuco – UFPE, Recife, Pernambuco, Brazil; <u>https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4019-0502; marina.pinheiro@ufpe.br</u>

Reviewed on July 27, 2022.

Review II

It is a very well written text, of course, and that gradually builds its argumentation, leading the reader to follow the proposal of the article, from the title. It is a original work, as little explored with regard to the theme (#real motherhood), the light of a Bakhtinian vision, and, more than that, current, since it brings as a basis for its discussions the discourses that circulate on social networks, therefore, equally relevant to the point of view of a dialogue with society. The author manages to show how the posts of some mothers can be analyzed and understood in a clear articulation with the theoretical concepts on which it is based. There is, therefore, a major contribution to the Bakhtinian studies and, in a general way, for the area of the Discourse. However, I emphasize some points that need to be adapted for the publication of the text. The first concerns the fact that the objectives proposed in the abstract are not the same proposed in the body of the article. Here, I return to the author's words:

Summary (p.1)

"1) reflect on the expression #maternidadereal, used in internet posts.

a) In the light of Mikhail Bakhtin's concept of heteroglossia, this observation will start from the idea of interaction, basic behavioral and linguistic gesture in social networks.

b) In addition, the meaning of "real" will be considered from the theory of Jacques Lacan, to delineate the differences between the hegemonic discourse of traditional motherhood, of romanticization, and the contemporary and counter-hegemonic discourse, through which motherhood can be vented in its pains.

c) Finally, to verify how these discourses intersect in the materiality of language, 5 posts with the tag #maternidadereal will be analyzed, determining, through their brands, to which axiological axis they are affiliated."

Article (p.2)

"The present article, then, will reflect on the production of 5 Instagram posts that contain the discourse linked to "real motherhood," illuminating it under the light of Bakhtinian based on concepts such as interaction, real, discourse genre and heteroglossia."

In the summary, therefore, there is a proposal to explore the notions of "interaction," "heteroglossia," "real," "behavioral gesture" and at the beginning of the article presents itself as reflection on the concepts of "interaction," "real," "discourse genre" and "heteroglossia."

Thus, at first, it is necessary to make changes so that the objectives are the same both in the abstract and in the body of the text.

Furthermore, the notion of "behavioral gesture" is not resumed throughout the text, nor is it in the analyses. Thus, if the author chooses to keep it, he must return to it throughout the text, and especially in the analyses.

The concept of "real" is in fact explored in the theoretical part of the text, but it is not resumed. in the analyzes and, considering the importance of this notion, I believe that it should be included in the post discussions.

As far as the notion of "discourse genre" is concerned, it appears only once more throughout the of the text, not being explored either from the theoretical point of view or from the analysis. Furthermore, it must be evaluated whether this notion is useful for the proposal of the text and, if so, it must be the fact discussed in both spheres.

There is another point that seems relevant to be brought up, this time in the introduction of the work: a survey was carried out (exhaustive or not) on the existence of other works (in addition to the above) on this topic? About posts? In light of the same theory? What they say these jobs? How does the author's work contribute to what has already been done? There are two moments in the text that seem to me to need rewording for clarity: P.2: "The utterance being concrete and unique units of language use (...)"; suggestion: Since the utterance consists of concrete units (...)

Finally, I call attention to the part of the final considerations that must be a locus resumption of the proposed objectives and should also point out limitations of the study, as well as prospective reflections based on what was observed in the text. In that sense, this item also needs development on the part of the author, one has the impression of an abrupt closing of the text, without the due aspects having been contemplated. P.4: "Less metaphorically, between the real and the fantasy there is language (JORGE, 2010), the symbolic bridge in which man transits between the real world and his refuge of enjoyment." Suggestion: (...) the symbolic bridge that allows man to transit between the world (...)" APPROVED WITH RESTRICTIONS [REVISION]

Alessandra Del Ré - Universidade Estadual Paulista "Júlio de Mesquita Filho" – UNESP, Araraquara, São Paulo, Brazil - <u>https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6740-9631; del.re@unesp.br</u>

Reviewed on August 08, 2022.

Review III

The author of the article made all the necessary modifications for the publication of the article.

There are only 3 adjustments to be made, as I see it, for the final version:

203

P.9: "acceptance and refusal, absorption and transmutation of social voices – phenomenon what he [Bakhtin] calls dialogized heteroglossia." (missing an "o" in "heteroglossia")

P.12: "hegemonic and indicate an antagonistic position to the romanticized vision of ..." (agreement: "antagonistic positioning" and not "antagonistic")

P.19: "a baby with reflux, a condition that needs treatment, is not the baby calm and smiling person who stars in social networks, but a being with demands that escape fantasy and turn into a factual order." (clarity: "and turn from a factual order" is not very clear.). APPROVED

Alessandra Del Ré - Universidade Estadual Paulista "Júlio de Mesquita Filho" – UNESP, Araraquara, São Paulo, Brazil - <u>https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6740-9631</u>; <u>del.re@unesp.br</u>

Reviewed on September 14, 2022.