



Determination of some basic properties of traditional malatya cheese

Senol KOSE^{1*} , Mehmet Murat CEYLAN², Ibrahim ALTUN³, Yagmur ERIM KOSE¹

Abstract

Malatya cheese is generally produced and consumed in Malatya province of Turkey. The starter culture is not used in the production of this cheese. It is traditionally made from raw cow or sheep milk or a mixture of them. This study aims to determine some characteristics parameters (the antioxidant activity, mineral composition, chemical, biochemical and textural properties) of Malatya cheese and therefore, 25 samples purchased from retail markets in Malatya were analysed. The antioxidant capacity of the water-soluble extracts was detected using DPPH (2,2-diphenyl-1-picrylhydrazyl) and ABTS (2,2'-azino-bis(3-ethylbenzothiazoline-6-sulfonic acid)) methods, mineral composition of samples prepared by dry ash method were determined using Inductively Coupled Plasma-Optical Emission Spectrometer (ICP-OES). This samples were generally different from each other according to the chemical, biochemical and textural properties; however, some interesting similarities were identified. Besides, the mineral compositions and antioxidant activities in cheese samples were determined higher than expected. In conclusions, the production method and ripening conditions may play a decisive effect on some basic properties of the cheeses investigated.

Keywords: malatya cheese; mineral content; total phenolics; antioxidant activity; texture profile analysis (TPA).

Practical Application: Malatya cheese is a kind of traditional Turkish cheese manufactured from raw or pasteurized milk by scalding of curd in hot whey.

1 Introduction

Malatya cheese is traditionally produced from raw sheep's or cow's milk in the Malatya province of Turkey. If sheep or cow's milk is not available, their mixtures were used for the manufacturing of cheeses. Malatya cheese has an elastic and compact texture, salty taste and is manufactured in farms on a small scale and in villages. Nowadays, Malatya cheese has two general production methods: traditional and industrial. In industrial production, the cheese is made from pasteurized milk using starter culture in large enterprises (Hayaloglu & Brechany, 2007), however, there is no standard production method.

In the traditional method, milk was not pasteurized and the starter culture was not used (Hayaloglu et al., 2014). The raw milk is filtered through a cloth filter, heated to 32 °C and then coagulated for 45 min using commercial rennet. Subsequently, the curd is cut into small cubes, stirred for about 30 min and left to drain for 30 min without pressing. The curd was pressed with a wooden block for 2 h, scalded at 85 or 90 °C for 3-5 min using whey. Then, curds were re-pressed between the same wooden blocks for 3 min and quickly cooled to room temperature. The cooled blocks were immersed in brine and matured in plastic or metal packaging at 6-8 °C for at least 60 days (Hayaloglu et al., 2008).

There are only a few studies related to Malatya cheese. The effect of milk pasteurization and scalding temperature on proteolysis and peptide profiles of Malatya cheese was determined by Hayaloglu et al. (2010) and volatile profiles were investigated by Hayaloglu & Brechany (2007). The effects of different enzyme

concentrations on chemical, physical and biochemical properties of Malatya cheese were determined by Hayaloglu et al. (2014). The effect of some production parameters on functional and ripening properties of Malatya cheese was investigated by Karatekin (2014). To the authors' knowledge, no previous study was determined to chemical, biochemical, physical, mineral content, and antioxidant activity of Malatya cheese obtained from retail markets. Thus, this study aims to elucidate some characteristics of cheeses produced by the traditional method collected from Malatya retail markets.

2 Materials and methods

2.1 Materials

In this study, 25 different Malatya cheese produced in Malatya were obtained from the retail market and used as material. 300-400 g samples were taken to sterile jars, brought to the laboratory under refrigerator conditions, homogenized and stored in the refrigerator (4 ± 2 °C) until the analysis was completed.

2.2 Methods

Chemical analysis

For pH measurements, a pH meter (Hanna Instrument pH 211; Microprocessor pH meter, Germany) was used. The samples were analyzed for protein content using micro Kjeldahl digestion and distillation units (Association of Official

Received 25 Jan., 2021

Accepted 18 June, 2021

¹Department of Food Engineering, Faculty of Engineering, Van Yuzuncu Yil University, Van, Turkey

²Department of Food Engineering, Faculty of Engineering, Iğdır University, Iğdır, Turkey

³Ozalp Vocational School, Food Business Department, Van Yuzuncu Yil University, Van, Turkey

*Corresponding author: senolkose28@gmail.com

Analytical Chemists, 1990). Titratable acidity (as a lactic acid percentage), dry matter, and fat content (Gerber method) were detected according to methods described by Case et al. (1985). The salt content was detected according to the Mohr method (Nielsen, 2003). The ash content was determined by dry ashing the cheeses in an ash oven at 550 °C for 16 h (International Dairy Federation, 1992). The L*, a*, and b* values of cheese samples were determined with Konica Minolta Chroma Meter CR-400 (Osaka, Japan). The L* value represents lightness value varying between 0 and 100, b* value represents the blue (-) to yellow (+) component and a* represents the green (-) to red (+) component (Akarca et al., 2015).

Biochemical analysis

Water-soluble extracts of the cheese samples were prepared as previously described (Kuchroo & Fox, 1982). These extracts were used in the determination of total phenolic compounds (TPC), antioxidant activity, water soluble nitrogen (WSN), 12% trichloroacetic acid soluble nitrogen (TCA-SN), and 5% phosphotungstic acid soluble nitrogen (PTA-SN). The lipolysis ratio was measured as ADV (Acid Degree Value) according to methods described by Case et al. (1985). WSN %, TCA-SN %, and PTA-SN % contents of cheese were analyzed as previously described (Butikofer et al., 1993).

Total Phenolic Compounds (TPC)

TPC content of water-soluble extracts of the cheese samples were determined using the Folin Ciocalteu method (Yemis et al., 2008). For this, 150 µL of a sample and 3 mL of Na₂CO₃ (2%) were taken in a test tube, and 150 µL of Folin-Ciocalteu's reagent (1:1, v/v in water) was added to the tube. Then the mixture was thoroughly mixed with vortex and was kept at room temperature in the dark. After 45 minutes, the absorbance was read at 765 nm in the spectrophotometer (UV Mini-1240, Shimadzu, Japan). The results are explained as gallic acid equivalent (mg GAE/kg).

Antioxidant activity

DPPH radical scavenging activity

The inhibition of DPPH was determined as described previously (Brand-Williams et al., 1995). Firstly, 100 mL of water-soluble extracts and 2.4 mL of DPPH solution prepared daily were added to a test tube. The mixture was incubated in darkness at room temperature. After 30 min, the absorbance was read at 520 nm in a spectrophotometer. The results were expressed as: Inhibition of DPPH (%) = $[1 - (A/A_0)] \times 100$, where A₀ is the absorbance of the blank and A is the absorbance of the test.

TEAC test

7.0 mM ABTS radical solution containing 2.45 mM potassium persulfate was prepared and was left in darkness at room temperature for at least 12-16 hours to form an ABTS⁺ radical solution. Then, this radical solution was diluted with 80% ethanol to give 0.700 ± 0.2 absorbances at 734 nm and 2.97 mL of the diluted radical solution transferred to a test tube and 30 µL of water-soluble extracts were added to the tube. The mixture

left for 6 min in the dark and the absorbance was read at 734 nm in a spectrophotometer. The same processes were repeated for Trolox and antioxidant activity value was expressed as mmol/g Trolox equivalent (Kirca & Özkan, 2007).

Texture Profile Analysis (TPA)

TPA analysis of the cheese samples was carried out at 25 °C using a texture analyzer equipped with a 50 kg load cell and a cylindrical probe (25.4 mm in diameters). TPA was determined by compressed twice using a probe to make 10-mm penetration with a speed of 1 mm/s. Hardness, adhesiveness, springiness, cohesiveness, gumminess, chewiness, and resilience were carried out from TPA by using software (Kahyaoglu et al., 2005).

Mineral analysis

By adding 5 ml of nitric acid to the ash obtained in the ash determination, the ash was thoroughly dissolved on the heating plate and then the dissolved ash-acid mixture was filtered with Whatman no: 41. Subsequently, the solution was diluted with 1 N HNO₃ and completed in 50 ml with 1 N HNO₃. The Ca, Mg, K, P, Zn, Fe, Mn and Cu concentrations of the cheese samples were determined by ICP-OES (Thermo Scientific ICAP 6300 DUO, England) at 317.93, 279.55, 766.49, 177.50, 213.86, 259.94, 257.61, and 324.75 nm, respectively. Also, blank samples were prepared by subjecting to the above procedures (International Dairy Federation, 1992).

Statistical analysis

SPSS for Windows statistical software (SPSS, 1999) was used for all statistical analysis in this study. All data are showed as mean ± standard deviation of means. Correlations between the chemical, biochemical, textural and antioxidant properties and mineral content were determined using Pearson correlation method with SPSS package program.

3 Results and discussions

3.1 Chemical and biochemical properties

The dry matter (DM), ash, pH, titratable acidity (lactic acid), salt, protein, fat, and color properties of the cheese samples were presented in Table 1. It was determined that % dry matter, % fat, % ash, % protein, % salt, % lactic acid (l.a) and pH content of Malatya cheese samples varied between 49.01 to 64.09, 24.50 to 31.00, 4.77 to 10.54, 16.59 to 23.54, 2.46 to 6.14, 0.13 to 0.73 and 5.50 to 6.76, respectively. The pH, titratable acidity (%), salt (%), total protein (%), and lower fat (%) values were similar to results of Hayaloglu et al. (2014). Salt (%) and protein (%) values were higher than the values determined by Hayaloglu & Brechany (2007). The differences in protein and salt contents between the cheeses might be related to the type of milk, heat treatment, and production methods.

Color values were determined as CEILAB color space L*, a*, and b*. There was no significant difference between cheese samples in terms of L*, a*, and b* values. The L* values of samples were determined between 88.08 and 93.21. The parameter L* of the samples generally indicates lightness. It was determined that

Table 1. Some chemical parameters of malatya cheeses.

Sample no	Dry matter (%)	Ash (%)	pH	l.a (%)	Salt (%)	Protein (%)	Fat (%)	L*	a*	b*
1	58.19	9.53	6.39	0.18	5.73	20.89	27.75	91.93	-2.80	13.06
2	61.72	10.54	6.41	0.18	5.85	21.36	29.5	90.83	-2.94	14.17
3	59.98	10.15	6.44	0.18	5.59	21.61	28	91.43	-2.90	15.23
4	59.79	9.16	6.46	0.18	5.62	21.78	27.5	90.61	-3.01	13.88
5	57.27	10.23	6.42	0.19	5.91	20.29	31	92.12	-2.87	13.43
6	50.05	5.00	5.93	0.47	2.75	19.64	26.75	93.19	-2.02	12.81
7	49.01	4.81	5.50	0.68	2.49	18.52	29.5	92.04	-1.96	12.22
8	50.85	4.77	5.55	0.73	2.60	18.78	28	92.25	-2.21	13.78
9	49.66	5.62	5.82	0.47	2.87	17.57	24.5	92.54	-2.42	13.45
10	50.06	5.09	5.78	0.47	2.46	21.13	27	92.50	-2.18	14.29
11	49.27	6.71	5.78	0.34	4.42	18.99	26.5	92.91	-1.55	12.06
12	51.92	5.45	5.99	0.35	3.07	18.66	26.75	93.21	-1.83	11.78
13	49.88	6.16	5.85	0.25	3.36	16.59	27.25	92.99	-1.91	12.72
14	53.27	6.22	6.07	0.31	3.69	18.48	25.5	92.08	-1.88	13.07
15	52.11	5.29	5.92	0.36	2.87	18.65	28.5	92.54	-1.87	12.25
16	49.60	6.24	6	0.29	3.39	18.70	24.5	92.65	-1.77	12.66
17	49.10	4.87	5.57	0.56	2.52	17.62	26	91.52	-2.18	12.63
18	50.84	5.61	5.77	0.57	3.25	18.41	26.5	93.14	-1.94	12.97
19	49.44	4.95	5.65	0.55	2.49	17.33	26.5	91.83	-1.96	13.02
20	51.85	6.04	6.20	0.37	3.51	19.77	25.75	92.23	-2.14	13.58
21	62.22	9.43	6.30	0.16	5.47	20.75	30.5	89.87	-2.95	13.99
22	64.09	8.81	6.38	0.14	4.88	23.54	29.25	88.08	-3.41	15.67
23	62.13	9.31	6.38	0.13	5.53	21.87	28.5	91.48	-2.86	14.19
24	59.54	9.31	6.43	0.16	6.14	20.55	29.25	90.62	-1.07	14.30
25	61.12	9.58	6.42	0.14	5.94	22.35	29	89.50	-1.12	15.09
Min.	49.01	4.77	5.50	0.13	2.46	16.59	24.50	88.08	-1.07	11.78
Max.	64.09	10.54	6.46	0.73	6.14	23.54	31.00	93.21	-3.41	15.67
Mean ± S.D	54.52 ± 5.32	7.15 ± 2.12	6.05 ± 0.33	0.34 ± 0.18	4.11 ± 1.39	19.78 ± 1.78	27.60 ± 1.73	91.68 ± 1.26	-2.23 ± 0.60	13.47 ± 1.01

the obtained L* values were lower than the values determined by Tarakci & Devenci (2019) in white cheeses. The lightness values of Malatya cheese samples were lower due to scalding of curd in whey at 85-90°C for 3-5 min. Likewise, Deshwal et al. (2020) determined that the lightness values of Halloumi type cheese were significantly lower due to the scalding of curd in whey at 90 °C for 30 min. The scalding of cheese curd leads to the interaction of amino acids and lactose, which forms Maillard reaction compounds that darken the cheese (Kaminarides et al., 2015).

The values of samples were detected between -1.07 and 3.41. As can be seen, the parameter a* of the samples generally has negative values, which means that the green color dominant in most of the samples. The b values of samples were ranged between 11.78 and 15.67. The parameter b* of the samples generally has positive values, which means that the yellow color dominant in most of the samples.

The lipolysis values of Malatya cheese samples ranged from 0.34 to 4.31 ADV. These values were similar to findings obtained by Tarakci & Kucukoner (2006) and Andiç et al. (2011) and lower than the value determined by Guler & Uraz (2004) for Kashar cheese. The observed differences in lipolysis values between the cheeses might be related to the type of milk, production methods, and ripening conditions. Lipolytic agents in cheese usually originate from the milk, the cheese microflora (starter, nonstarter, and adjunct microorganism) and the coagulant (in the case of rennet paste). Milk contains a potent indigenous lipase, lipoprotein lipase. Lipoprotein lipase activity is important in raw milk cheeses because the enzyme is largely inactivated by pasteurization, but 85 °C × 10 s is required to fully inactivate the enzyme (McSweeney, 2004; Andiç et al., 2011).

The WSN contains small molecules of proteins, peptides, and free amino acids, and it is generally used as an index of ripening (Guinee & Fox, 1993). The WSN values of cheeses changed from 3.75% to 28.30%. The formation of WSN compounds during ripening is an index of the rate and extent of proteolysis, which is an indicator of casein hydrolysis brought about by the action of the residual rennet and indigenous plasmin present at the beginning of ripening (Andiç et al., 2011). The WSN values were similar to those reported by Hayaloglu et al. (2014) for Malatya cheeses and were higher than those reported by Altun & Kose (2016) for Kelle cheeses. The lowest, highest, and average TCA-SN levels of Malatya cheese samples were found to be 1.40, 9.55, and 5.42%. TCA-SN level is regarded as the ripening depth index and known to be an indication of the number of amino acids and small peptides present in cheese. These peptides and amino acids are mainly formed by the action of microbial enzymes on the peptides obtained through the action of plasmin and rennet from casein (Tarakci & Kucukoner, 2006; Andiç et al., 2011). The TCA content was higher than those reported by Hayaloglu et al. (2014) for Malatya cheeses and Altun & Kose (2016) for Kelle cheeses. The PTA-SN values of cheeses changed between 0.64 and 2.10%. Tri and dipeptides and free amino acids are soluble in the PTA-SN fraction. These free amino acids and small peptides are mainly produced by the effect of starter culture and non-starter organisms on the caseins and their peptides (Tarakci, 2004; Andiç et al., 2011). Our results were lower than those reported by Tarakci et al. (2004) for Herby cheeses.

3.2 Total phenolic compounds and antioxidant activity

The TPC, DPPH inhibition, and TEAC values of water-soluble extracts for all cheeses are shown in Table 2. TPC of Malatya cheese samples was varied between 161.70 and 935.78 mg

Table 2. Some biochemical and antioxidant activity of malatya cheeses.

Sample no	Lipolysis (ADV)	WSN %	TCA-SN %	%PTA-SN	TPC (mg/kg)	DPPH (% inh.)	TEAC (mmol Trolox/g)
1	2.72	6.09	1.80	1.22	217.63	4.44	2162.74
2	4.31	5.71	2.08	0.95	220.59	2.19	1979.93
3	1.79	4.72	1.90	1.02	239.11	3.13	2056.90
4	1.67	5.25	1.81	0.93	238.74	3.44	2458.63
5	2.58	6.38	1.94	0.83	252.44	3.31	2339.19
6	2.57	23.18	7.56	1.65	935.78	10.75	4308.34
7	2.49	23.70	7.65	1.75	902.44	8.49	1909.53
8	2.20	25.02	7.36	1.36	792.81	8.30	2863.17
9	2.24	28.30	9.55	1.75	750.96	10.97	3542.09
10	2.07	23.06	6.87	1.37	742.81	25.03	2136.88
11	2.16	21.61	9.45	1.43	666.52	28.24	2421.08
12	2.43	19.00	7.23	1.27	588.74	27.32	2850.54
13	2.79	21.23	9.41	2.06	559.85	7.14	1744.14
14	2.18	19.13	9.24	1.28	549.85	34.65	3295.10
15	2.33	21.17	8.72	1.46	684.67	17.48	3246.07
16	1.64	21.36	9.47	2.10	735.78	45.96	2969.71
17	1.62	20.44	6.27	1.15	825.78	15.13	2536.54
18	1.28	17.98	5.80	1.29	709.85	18.92	2780.09
19	1.85	22.12	6.14	1.36	668.00	9.78	2763.66
20	0.51	14.29	6.63	2.08	526.89	17.32	2496.50
21	0.76	3.91	1.98	0.98	219.11	7.15	1083.86
22	0.41	4.00	1.52	0.64	215.04	3.22	614.96
23	0.64	4.01	1.40	0.85	161.70	5.25	452.69
24	0.34	3.75	1.75	1.16	211.33	3.41	2106.75
25	0.45	3.79	1.84	0.75	190.22	5.81	1352.56
Min.	0.34	3.75	1.40	0.64	161.70	2.19	452.69
Max.	4.31	28.30	9.55	2.10	935.78	45.96	4308.34
Mean ± S.D	1.84 ± 0.95	14.86 ± 8.72	5.42 ± 3.19	1.31 ± 0.41	514.97 ± 264.22	13.89 ± 11.40	2341.95 ± 875.79

GAE/kg. These values were higher than those reported by Kose (2015) for Herby cheeses and similar to those reported by Kara (2019) for Herby cheeses and Canozar (2020) for Orgu cheeses. The DPPH inhibition of water-soluble extracts of Malatya cheeses was changed from 2.19 to 45.96%. The TEAC values of cheese samples were ranged from 452.69 to 4308,34 mmol Trolox/g. It is thought that the antioxidant activity of Malatya cheeses varies in such a wide range, the fact that these cheeses have different production methods and maturity. Malatya cheese is traditionally manufactured from raw milk and the curd is subjected to heat treatment at 80-90 °C by immersing the curd block in its whey or hot water (Hayaloglu et al., 2014). Therefore, it is thought that antioxidant activity varies depending on the scalding time and temperature. Hossain et al. (2020) determined that the lower heat-treated samples showed higher antioxidant activity. The heating of milk can reduce the specific order and amount of bioactive peptides of milk. It can also change the enzyme action and subsequent functional properties of cheese during ripening (Santiago-López et al., 2018). Also, Fox et al. (1994) determined that hydrolysis of casein by coagulants, plasmin, starters, and nonstarter bacterial proteinases and peptidases resulted in the formation of free amino acids and water-soluble peptides during the maturation of cheese. The smaller peptide

formation was attributed to the significant role played by lactic acid bacteria in the degeneration of primary proteolytic products from β -casein and α s1-produced by plasmin and chymosin, respectively (Singh et al., 1997).

3.3 Textural properties

Ercan (2009) reported that textural properties of foods play a major role in consumer appeal, buying decisions, and eventual consumption. For some foods, the texture is more important to consumers than color and flavor. TPA parameters of the Malatya cheeses are seen in Table 3.

Hardness is the maximum force applied to cheese in the first compression (Yasar, 2007). Hardness values of cheeses changed from 1347.82 to 29823.56 g. According to Table 3, the hardness value of cheeses varies over a wide range. Solís-Méndez et al. (2013) expressed that, the hardness and/or firmness of the cheese based on three factors: fat, moisture, and mineral content. Due to the high content of water or fat, the protein molecules separated from the cheese which increased softness. Similarly, in our study, the rate of dry matter of the first 5 and last 5 samples was found to be quite high, and accordingly, the hardness value was higher than the other samples.

Table 3. Texture profile analysis of malatya cheeses.

Sample no	Hardness (g)	Adhesiveness (g.s)	Resilience (%)	Cohesiveness	Springiness (%)	Gumminess	Chewiness
1	18636.42	-28.32	22.21	0.57	76.71	11562.88	7470.59
2	18033.00	-15.09	40.13	0.80	34.63	14367.17	4970.71
3	26751.01	-39.44	23.98	0.56	64.99	15631.38	10770.81
4	23017.16	-11.77	23.00	0.52	76.44	3476.00	200.48
5	26050.29	-6.60	32.73	0.70	65.14	17453.88	11379.27
6	1464.38	-3.27	38.17	0.78	46.20	1685.48	797.10
7	1464.38	-52.12	25.90	0.70	66.19	1010.25	673.06
8	1720.52	-22.62	38.56	0.79	56.52	1288.57	673.84
9	2451.46	-24.01	41.33	0.69	32.83	1332.04	230.23
10	2868.99	-20.85	30.78	0.73	60.89	2084.39	1267.38
11	4408.69	-30.04	30.73	0.68	64.59	2993.42	1851.22
12	3420.97	-34.30	34.54	0.75	58.35	2578.16	1508.29
13	4169.52	-64.93	23.50	0.63	66.04	2595.89	1663.19
14	5554.38	-35.03	34.86	0.75	60.50	4074.17	2512.56
15	4064.03	-31.24	31.55	0.75	68.67	3037.29	943.57
16	3063.16	-57.42	33.05	0.75	60.79	2290.59	834.17
17	1616.07	-38.83	24.57	0.68	57.00	1104.33	675.64
18	1503.27	-46.01	33.44	0.75	58.95	1126.62	663.70
19	1347.82	-9.35	36.47	0.77	64.52	976.15	581.97
20	4671.05	-93.20	34.13	0.72	65.92	3350.71	2208.66
21	25079.20	-47.63	38.38	0.79	70.59	19740.13	13962.14
22	19974.97	-30.11	42.53	0.79	73.51	16150.10	10655.26
23	29823.56	-28.18	34.71	0.73	62.89	16816.92	13701.66
24	18165.16	-40.49	29.65	0.71	64.59	13498.23	9051.32
25	16641.82	-16.85	35.81	0.78	64.62	12927.80	8392.51
Min.	1347.82	-3.27	22.21	0.52	32.83	976.15	200.48
Max.	29823.56	-93.20	42.53	0.80	76.71	19740.13	13962.14
Mean ± S.D	10638.45 ± 10096.86	-34.23 ± 20.10	32.57 ± 6.27	0.71 ± 0.07	61.68 ± 10.61	6926.10 ± 6659.17	4305.57 ± 4729.61

Adhesiveness is defined as the force required to separate food that adheres to the plate or mouth. It can be characterized by adhesion and moisture conditions in a foodstuff (Karatekin, 2014). The adhesiveness values of cheeses ranged from -3.27 to -93.20 g.s. Our results were lower than the value obtained by Zheng et al. (2016) for sliced cheese and were similar to findings obtained by Tarakci & Deveci (2019) for White cheese. As can be shown in Tables 2 and 3, it was determined that cheeses with a high proteolysis rate had a higher stickiness value. Likewise, it was found that the value of adhesiveness increased due to proteolysis in the study conducted by Okumus (2019) for Kashar cheese.

Resilience is expressed as the rate of cheese returning to its original shape before recompressing after the second compression. In the texture profile analysis, the time between the first and second compression is calculated as the rate of recycling in the height of the cheese (Okumus, 2019). Resilience values of cheeses ranged between 22.21 and 42.53%.

The ratio of the resistance of food to the second compression to its behavior in compression is defined as cohesiveness. It is also expressed as the power between the inner bonds that make up the product structure (Aydın, 2019). Cohesiveness values of cheeses changed between 0.52 and 0.80. These results were similar to the study obtained by Aydın (2019) for Kashar cheese, Jaster et al. (2014) for Parmesan-type cheese, and higher than the value obtained by Kaminarides et al. (2019) for ovine Halloumi cheese.

Springiness is expressed as the ratio of the cheese reinstatement to the maximum deformation after applying the first compression to the sample (Karatekin, 2014). Cheese samples are characterized as either plastic or elastic according to the springiness value

(Eroglu et al., 2015). Springiness values of cheeses changed from 32.83 to 76.71%.

Gumminess is identified as the product of cohesiveness and hardness (Yildiz et al., 2015; Kose et al., 2018). It characterizes semi-solid foods with a low degree of hardness and a high degree of cohesiveness (Kose et al., 2018; Kose et al., 2019). As can be shown in Table 3, it has been determined that the value of the gumminess level varies over a very wide range. The highest gumminess values obtained for sample no. 21 (19740.13) and the lowest for the sample no.19 (976.15). Generally, gumminess has increased with an increase fat content. Similar results were obtained Salari et al. (2017). Except for fat, total solids, moisture, protein to moisture ratio can affect on texture characteristics of cheese (Salari et al., 2017).

Chewiness value is an important quality parameter that affects the acceptability of the consumer for the product. As known, generally, older people want to make less effort to chew; for this reason, they prefer cheese samples with less chewiness values. In other words, chewiness is a parameter that simulates the amount of energy required to chew the sample until it is swallowed (Eroglu et al., 2015). The average chewiness value of cheese samples was found to be 4305.57. This value was higher than the values found by Zheng et al. (2016) for sliced cheese.

3.4 Mineral composition

Table 4 shows the values of calcium, magnesium, potassium, phosphorus, iron, copper, manganese, and zinc found in traditional Malatya cheeses.

Table 4. Mineral compositions of malatya cheeses (mg/kg).

Sample No	Ca	Mg	K	P	Fe	Cu	Mn	Zn
1	6008.85	673.97	608.54	157.92	4.30	2.01	0.68	23.35
2	7081.07	672.15	783.67	108.94	5.34	0.65	0.33	19.09
3	7069.41	766.52	720.58	126.14	4.84	0.51	0.32	20.73
4	6439.24	806.09	758.77	200.36	5.54	0.72	0.29	19.13
5	6648.72	634.59	730.40	117.41	11.68	1.89	0.33	14.40
6	5239.68	583.36	635.19	126.51	7.30	0.87	0.25	14.36
7	4784.08	587.74	628.51	109.04	9.33	1.42	0.33	16.87
8	5853.34	661.76	708.60	141.42	5.56	0.68	0.40	20.91
9	3237.89	609.87	439.92	140.46	3.91	1.30	0.40	28.54
10	4647.39	604.67	553.34	170.27	4.38	1.55	0.38	23.07
11	5336.46	582.50	749.91	111.12	4.99	1.24	0.34	30.62
12	5820.97	656.74	690.69	214.93	5.43	0.78	0.29	23.98
13	5480.10	656.33	714.88	90.25	5.28	0.65	0.25	11.88
14	5553.08	587.03	634.18	82.24	5.36	1.90	0.83	23.76
15	6972.68	684.71	922.35	233.65	4.93	1.22	0.30	21.45
16	4730.15	761.67	571.55	144.53	5.39	0.61	0.30	16.95
17	5066.74	548.44	633.64	167.68	7.56	1.25	0.24	16.81
18	4871.75	650.49	617.88	132.76	4.15	1.23	0.22	17.19
19	4809.72	653.12	699.43	84.26	4.49	2.05	1.07	14.42
20	4551.25	618.52	522.73	118.38	3.81	1.20	0.20	13.94
21	6044.11	567.93	547.30	203.41	7.06	2.30	0.29	18.52
22	5850.68	603.68	456.80	148.72	9.48	1.30	0.27	23.05
23	7052.82	632.36	751.38	214.04	4.20	0.76	0.37	19.16
24	6578.64	705.60	651.58	180.52	4.80	0.97	0.49	28.52
25	3624.58	597.35	347.23	187.31	4.10	1.81	0.60	19.78
Min.	3237.89	548.44	347.23	82.24	3.81	0.51	0.20	11.88
Max.	7081.07	806.09	922.35	233.65	11.68	2.30	1.07	30.62
Mean ± S.D	5574.14 ± 1044.82	644.29 ± 64.29	643.16 ± 123.40	148.49 ± 43.20	5.73 ± 1.97	1.23 ± 0.52	0.39 ± 0.20	20.02 ± 4.83

Calcium is responsible for many vital functions, such as blood clotting, normal cardiac rhythm maintenance, muscle contraction, hormone secretion, and enzyme activation. Dairy products are a very rich source of calcium and the majority of dietary Ca (70%) comes from these products. It is difficult to reach the recommended daily amount of calcium without consuming dairy products (Zamberlin et al., 2012). The minimum and maximum Ca values of samples ranged from 3237.89 to 7081.07 mg/kg. These values were higher than the value obtained by Ozlu et al. (2012) for Kashar cheeses and agreement with findings determined by Altun & Kose (2016) for Kelle cheeses. Zamberlin et al. (2012) and Šnirc et al. (2020) found that the highest calcium levels were found in hard cheeses. Likewise, in our study, it was found that cheeses with high hardness value had high calcium content.

Magnesium plays a significant role in many physiological processes, such as metabolism of nucleic acids and proteins, muscle contraction and neuromuscular transmission, regulation of blood pressure and bone growth, and a co-factor of many enzymes. On the other hand, magnesium deficiency can cause osteoporosis (Zamberlin et al., 2012). Mg concentrations of cheeses ranged from 548.44 to 806.09 mg/kg. These values were higher than the value obtained by Kose & Ocak (2019) for Herby cheeses and Cetinkaya et al. (2016) for Cami Boğazi cheeses.

Potassium is mostly present in milk (93%) in soluble form and the remaining 7% in the colloidal form. The K concentration in cheese is therefore associated with moisture (Lante et al., 2006). The average K concentrations of cheeses were found as 643.16 mg/kg. These findings were lower than the value obtained by Ocak & Kose (2015) for Herby cheese, Manuelian et al. (2017) for Cheddar cheese, and higher than the value recorded by Kirdar et al. (2015) for Kargı Tulum cheese.

The average P concentration of cheese samples was determined as 148.49 mg/kg. This value was lower than the value obtained by Canozer (2020) for Orgu cheeses, Oksuztepe et al. (2013) for Tulum and White cheeses, and Mattered et al. (2016) for Pecorino d'Abruzzo cheese.

Qin et al. (2009) reported that Fe is to be transported to cheese through the machinery and tools used in the transport, storage, and processing of milk. The minimum and maximum Fe concentrations of cheese samples ranged between 3.81 and 11.68 mg/kg. The obtained values were in agreement with the value determined by Yuzbasi et al. (2003) for Kasar cheeses and Christophoridis et al. (2019) for Greek cheeses.

Cu is an index of final product quality along with Fe because these metals play a nutritional and biological function. However, due to their unpleasant odor development and their

catalytic effects on the oxidation of lipids, they may represent a problem in dairy technology, preferably limiting the proteins and membrane lipoproteins of the milk fat globule (Lante et al., 2006). The concentrations of Cu in foodstuffs may vary depending on natural plant/animal characteristics, environmental conditions and methods of cooking, processing, and food handling (Christophoridis et al., 2019). The average Cu concentration of cheese samples was determined as 1.23 mg/kg. This value was higher than the average value obtained by Ozlu et al. (2012) for Kashar cheese and lower than the average value obtained by Altun & Kose (2016) for Kelle cheese. The minimum and maximum Mn concentration of cheeses changed between 0.20 and 1.07 mg/kg. These results were similar to the value obtained by Kose & Ocak (2019). It is stated that metals such as nickel and manganese in the composition of steel containers used in the heating and boiling stages of cheese production can enter the product (Ozlu et al., 2012)

The average Zn value of cheese samples was determined as 20.02 mg/kg. This value was higher than the value obtained by Ozlu et al. (2012) for Kashar cheese and by Kose & Ocak (2019) for Herby cheese. It is thought that the variations detected in the zinc content of cheeses in different studies to be caused by milk used in cheese production and equipment and tools used in the

production stage (Cetinkaya et al., 2016). This situation is also expressed by Ozlu et al. (2012). Also, it is reported that 85% of Zn in milk is exposed to casein micelles and is released from curd by becoming free in acidic pH values (Cetinkaya et al., 2016).

3.5 Correlation analysis

Table 5 and 6 shows the correlation coefficients of 32 parameters of Malatya cheese. It has been determined that there are very important correlations between variables. For instance, b, TPC, DPPH, ABTS, WSN, TCA-SN, PTA-SN, hardness, gumminess and chewiness values showed a significant negative and positive correlation with chemical, biochemical, textural and antioxidant properties and mineral content.

A significant positive correlation was found between TPC and antioxidant activity. Similarly, in many studies (Rufino et al., 2010; Augusto et al., 2014), a significant and positive correlation between TPC and antioxidant activity has been determined. TPC, DPPH and ABTS parameters showed a significant positive correlation with proteolysis (WSN, TCA-SN, PTA-SN) values. Indeed, Revilla et al. (2016), Perna et al. (2015), Erkaya & Şengül (2015), Kose (2015), and Gupta et al. (2009) found that antioxidant activity increased with the increase in water-soluble nitrogen content. In these studies, antioxidant activity was

Table 5. Correlation between the parameters.

	Dm	Ash	Fat	Protein	pH	La	Salt	L	a	b	Ca	Mg	K	P	Mn	Cu	Zn	Fe	
DM	1,000	0,911	0,661	0,856	0,886	-0,805	0,887	-0,807	-0,921	0,762	0,539	0,213	-0,085	0,361	0,002	0,065	0,125	0,112	
Ash		1,000	0,615	0,754	0,915	-0,862	0,981	-0,631	-0,846	0,646	0,531	0,311	-0,008	0,185	0,005	0,054	0,112	0,112	
Fat			1,000	0,545	0,456	-0,389	0,589	-0,544	-0,639	0,408	0,558	-0,035	0,174	0,240	-0,100	0,205	-0,095	0,510	
Protein				1,000	0,781	-0,651	0,732	-0,724	-0,821	0,769	0,368	0,166	-0,211	0,374	-0,107	0,012	0,178	0,109	
pH					1,000	-0,919	0,910	-0,579	-0,790	0,637	0,489	0,368	-0,070	0,287	-0,023	0,002	0,093	0,010	
La						1,000	-0,863	0,532	0,662	-0,513	-0,462	-0,298	0,026	-0,285	0,021	-0,009	-0,142	0,014	
Salt							1,000	-0,605	-0,802	0,587	0,511	0,300	-0,004	0,216	0,027	0,063	0,183	0,060	
L								1,000	0,829	-0,719	-0,178	0,016	0,367	-0,252	-0,091	-0,223	-0,106	-0,236	
a									1,000	-0,816	-0,330	-0,117	0,273	-0,316	0,019	-0,122	-0,058	-0,190	
b										1,000	0,220	0,190	-0,318	0,134	0,019	-0,057	0,071	-0,047	
Ca											1,000	0,423	0,737	0,252	-0,145	-0,284	0,016	0,199	
Mg												1,000	0,388	0,160	-0,035	-0,526	-0,013	-0,267	
K													1,000	0,048	-0,076	-0,361	-0,082	0,031	
P														1,000	-0,276	-0,072	0,259	-0,143	
Mn															1,000	0,542	0,142	-0,261	
Cu																1,000	0,025	0,185	
Zn																	1,000	-0,283	
Fe																		1,000	
TPC																			
DPPH																			
ABTS																			
WSN																			
TCASN																			
PTASN																			
ADV																			
Hardness																			
Adhesiveness																			
Resilience																			
Cohesiveness																			
Springiness																			
Gumminess																			
Chewiness																			

Table 6. Continued correlation between the parameters.

	TPC	DPPH	ABTS	WSN	TCASN	PTASN	ADV	Hardness	Adhesiveness	Resilience	Cohesiveness	Springiness	Gumminess	Chewiness
DM	-0,935	-0,580	-0,687	-0,950	-0,902	-0,780	-0,319	0,921	0,205	0,128	-0,046	0,273	0,906	0,840
Ash	-0,946	-0,542	-0,604	-0,937	-0,859	-0,672	-0,148	0,939	0,196	-0,051	-0,248	0,230	0,903	0,817
Fat	-0,578	-0,682	-0,605	-0,643	-0,689	-0,622	-0,042	0,655	0,244	0,023	0,113	0,310	0,729	0,681
Protein	-0,743	-0,421	-0,611	-0,813	-0,812	-0,699	-0,350	0,775	0,265	0,124	-0,031	0,287	0,736	0,682
pH	-0,922	-0,404	-0,454	-0,913	-0,786	-0,561	-0,258	0,874	0,108	0,013	-0,207	0,260	0,816	0,740
Ia	0,885	0,263	0,528	0,826	0,633	0,478	0,223	-0,809	-0,041	0,056	0,225	-0,310	-0,779	-0,721
Salt	-0,939	-0,500	-0,580	-0,933	-0,833	-0,655	-0,215	0,910	0,174	-0,084	-0,259	0,281	0,863	0,790
L	0,683	0,506	0,702	0,729	0,728	0,687	0,491	-0,632	-0,139	-0,213	-0,113	-0,307	-0,675	-0,621
a	0,842	0,732	0,659	0,873	0,913	0,757	0,336	-0,863	-0,277	-0,119	0,097	-0,169	-0,843	-0,785
b	-0,674	-0,527	-0,578	-0,676	-0,696	-0,592	-0,435	0,679	0,156	0,208	-0,012	0,110	0,677	0,656
Ca	-0,521	-0,348	-0,231	-0,539	-0,491	-0,464	0,173	0,615	0,168	-0,198	-0,179	0,257	0,534	0,474
Mg	-0,299	-0,053	0,064	-0,264	-0,220	0,008	0,077	0,285	0,013	-0,359	-0,484	0,206	0,049	-0,032
K	0,034	-0,050	0,212	0,056	0,074	-0,021	0,485	0,060	0,170	-0,321	-0,212	0,066	-0,079	-0,127
P	-0,277	-0,074	-0,252	-0,318	-0,328	-0,363	-0,373	0,316	0,111	-0,033	0,012	0,248	0,236	0,264
Mn	-0,100	0,013	0,049	0,015	-0,032	-0,141	0,024	-0,041	0,345	0,072	0,068	0,101	-0,012	0,006
Cu	-0,108	-0,046	-0,126	-0,089	-0,128	-0,226	-0,159	0,052	0,145	0,125	0,169	0,288	0,187	0,230
Zn	-0,123	0,163	-0,001	-0,020	0,024	-0,215	-0,077	0,049	0,192	0,112	-0,071	-0,096	0,076	0,069
Fe	0,004	-0,241	-0,124	-0,113	-0,170	-0,248	0,113	0,188	0,177	0,044	0,119	0,146	0,252	0,238
TPC	1,000	0,527	0,680	0,954	0,861	0,689	0,292	-0,918	-0,108	0,028	0,212	-0,360	-0,877	-0,819
DPPH		1,000	0,443	0,556	0,700	0,505	0,037	-0,591	-0,300	0,051	0,210	-0,088	-0,544	-0,500
ABTS			1,000	0,679	0,656	0,540	0,433	-0,645	0,117	0,054	0,018	-0,447	-0,689	-0,717
WSN				1,000	0,937	0,728	0,365	-0,927	-0,094	0,066	0,172	-0,396	-0,889	-0,835
TCASN					1,000	0,803	0,321	-0,886	-0,274	0,035	0,143	-0,317	-0,837	-0,788
PTASN						1,000	0,214	-0,721	-0,566	-0,131	-0,043	-0,206	-0,699	-0,654
ADV							1,000	-0,258	0,314	-0,113	-0,121	-0,450	-0,267	-0,400
Hardness								1,000	0,214	-0,067	-0,266	0,331	0,914	0,881
Adhesiveness									1,000	0,236	0,087	-0,230	0,142	0,071
Resilience										1,000	0,826	-0,502	0,144	0,114
Cohesiveness											1,000	-0,366	0,025	0,023
Springiness												1,000	0,224	0,307
Gumminess													1,000	0,969
Chewiness														1,000

attributed to these antioxidative peptide fragments released by proteolysis and the effect of starter cultures used. TPC, DPPH and ABTS parameters showed a significant negative correlation with hardness, gumminess and chewiness values. This situation is thought to be due to the high degree of proteolysis of cheese samples. Similarly, Karaman & Akalın (2013) determined that the increase in the degree of proteolysis during ripening caused a decrease in the hardness values of the cheese sample. In addition, TPC, DPPH and ABTS values was found to be negatively, positively correlated and were not significantly correlated with mineral content. Correlation analysis results revealed that TPC, DPPH and ABTS values of Malatya cheese samples could be an indicator parameter reflecting chemical, biochemical, textural and antioxidant properties and mineral content of cheese samples.

As seen in Table 1, positive and negative correlations were found between TPA parameters. While the relationship between some parameters is not important, there is a very important relationship between some parameters. For example, there is a significant positive correlation between hardness and chewiness and gumminess. This may be due to the fact that chewiness consists of the product of hardness x springiness x stickiness (Kose,

2020) and gumminess consists of the product of cohesiveness x hardness of the sample (Kose et al., 2018).

4 Conclusions

Some basic characteristics of 25 different Malatya cheese samples were determined. It is estimated that the detected differences are mainly due to production methods and maturation conditions. According to correlation analysis, the samples with high contents of WSN, TCA-SN, and PTA-SN also showed higher values of TPC, DPPH, TEAC. Likewise, samples with high contents of dry matter also showed higher values of hardness, and Ca and samples with high contents of fat showed higher values of gumminess. Considering the TPA, antioxidant activity, chemical, biochemical, and mineral composition results of Malatya cheese samples, it is obtained that standard production techniques should be used in the manufacturing of this cheese to increase consumer perception and acceptability.

Acknowledgements

A portion of this study was financially supported by the Coordination Unit of Scientific Research Projects of Van Yuzuncu Yil University, Project Number: BAP-FAP-2019-8708.

References

- Akarca, G., Tomar, O., & Gök, V. (2015). Effect of different packaging methods on the quality of stuffed and sliced mozzarella cheese during storage. *Journal of Food Processing and Preservation*, 39(6), 2912-2918. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/jfpp.12542>.
- Altun, I., & Kose, S. (2016). Geleneksel Kelle peynirinin bazı özelliklerinin belirlenmesi. *Yüzüncü Yıl Üniversitesi Tarım Bilimleri Dergisi*, 26(4), 642-647. <http://dx.doi.org/10.29133/yyutbd.282843>.
- Andiç, S., Tuncurk, Y., & Gencelep, H. (2011). The effect of different packaging methods on the formation of biogenic amines and organic acids in Kasha cheese. *Journal of Dairy Science*, 94(4), 1668-1678. <http://dx.doi.org/10.3168/jds.2010-3586>. PMID:21426954.
- Association of Official Analytical Chemists – AOAC. (1990). *Official Methods of Analysis*. (15th ed., Vol. II, pp. 1235-1243). Arlington: AOAC.
- Augusto, T. R., Salinas, E. S. S., Alencar, S. M., D'arce, M. A. B. R., Camargo, A. C. D., & Vieira, T. M. F. D. S. (2014). Phenolic compounds and antioxidant activity of hydroalcoholic extracts of wild and cultivated murtila (*Ugni molinae* Turcz.). *Food Science and Technology*, 34(4), 667-679. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1590/1678-457X.6393>.
- Aydın, E. (2019). *Investigation of effects on ripening of different types of herb used in Kasha cheese production* (MSc thesis). Ordu: Ordu University Science Institute Food Engineering Department.
- Brand-Williams, W., Cuvelier, M. E., & Berset, C. (1995). Use of a free radical method to evaluate antioxidant activity. *Lebensmittel-Wissenschaft + Technologie*, 28(1), 25-30. [http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0023-6438\(95\)80008-5](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0023-6438(95)80008-5).
- Butikofer, U., Ruegg, M., & Ardo, Y. (1993). Determination of nitrogen fractions in cheese: Evaluation of a collaborative study. *Lebensmittel wissenschaft und Technologie*, 26(3), 271-275.
- Canozer, C. (2020). *Comparison of some characteristic properties of Diyarbakır Orgu cheese produced by traditional and industrial method* (MSc thesis). Van: Van Yuzuncu Yil University Science Institute Food Engineering Department.
- Case, R. A., Bradley, R. L., & Williams, R. R. (1985). Chemical and Physical Methods. In G.H. Richardson (Ed.), *Standard Methods for the Examination of Dairy Products* (15th ed., pp. 327-404). Baltimore: American Public Health Association.
- Cetinkaya, A., Akbaba, G. B., Özçakmak, S., & Gulbaz, G. (2016). Mineral and heavy metal content in Cami Boğazı cheese on sale in Trabzon, Turkey. *Gıda*, 41(5), 317-321.
- Christophoridis, C., Kosma, A., Evgenakis, E., Bourliva, A., & Fytianos, K. (2019). Determination of heavy metals and health risk assessment of cheese products consumed in Greece. *Journal of Food Composition and Analysis*, 82, 103238. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jfca.2019.103238>.
- Deshwal, G. K., Ameta, R., Sharma, H., Singh, A. K., Panjagari, N. R., & Baria, B. (2020). Effect of ultrafiltration and fat content on chemical, functional, textural and sensory characteristics of goat milk-based Halloumi type cheese. *Lebensmittel-Wissenschaft + Technologie*, 126, 109341. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.lwt.2020.109341>.
- Ercan, D. (2009). *Quality characteristics of traditional Sepet cheese* (MSc thesis). Izmir: Graduate School of Izmir Institute of Technology Food Engineering.
- Erkaya, T., & Şengül, M. (2015). Bioactivity of water soluble extracts and some characteristics of white cheese during the ripening period as effected by packaging type and probiotic adjunct cultures. *The Journal of Dairy Research*, 82(1), 47-55. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/S0022029914000703>. PMID:25592630.
- Eroglu, A., Dogan, M., Toker, O. S., & Yilmaz, M. T. (2015). Classification of kasha cheeses based on their chemical, color and instrumental textural characteristics using principal component and hierarchical cluster analysis. *International Journal of Food Properties*, 18(4), 909-921. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10942912.2013.864673>.
- Fox, P. F., Singh, T., & Mcsweeney, P. L. H. (1994). Proteolysis in cheese during ripening. In A. T. Andrews & J. Varley (Eds.), *Biochemistry of milk products* (pp 1-31). London: The Royal Society of Chemistry.
- Guinee, T. P., & Fox, P. F. (1993). Salt in cheese: physical, chemical and biological aspects. In P. F. Fox (Ed.), *Cheese: chemistry, physics and microbiology* (pp. 257-302). Boston: Springer. http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4615-2650-6_7.
- Guler, Z., & Uraz, T. (2004). Correlations in flavour and chemical parameters of Kasha cheeses. *Milchwissenschaft. Milk Science International*, 59(3-4), 149-151.
- Gupta, A., Mann, B., Kumar, R., & Sangwan, R. B. (2009). Antioxidant activity of Cheddar cheeses at different stages of ripening. *International Journal of Dairy Technology*, 62(3), 339-347. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1471-0307.2009.00509.x>.
- Hayaloglu, A. A., & Brechany, E. Y. (2007). Influence of milk pasteurization and scalding temperature on the volatile compounds of Malatya, a farmhouse Halloumi-type cheese. *Le Lait*, 87(1), 39-57. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1051/lait:2006025>.
- Hayaloglu, A. A., Deegan, K. C., & Mcsweeney, P. L. H. (2010). Effect of milk pasteurization and curd scalding temperature on proteolysis in Malatya, a Halloumi-type cheese. *Dairy Science & Technology*, 90(1), 99-109. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1051/dst/2009052>.
- Hayaloglu, A. A., Karatekin, B., & Gurkan, H. (2014). Thermal stability of chymosin or microbial coagulant in the manufacture of Malatya, a Halloumi type cheese: Proteolysis, microstructure and functional properties. *International Dairy Journal*, 38(2), 136-144. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.idairyj.2014.04.001>.
- Hayaloglu, A. A., Ozer, B. H., & Fox, P. F. (2008). Cheeses of Turkey: 2. varieties ripened under brine. *Dairy Science & Technology*, 88(2), 225-244. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1051/dst:2007014>.
- Hossain, S., Khetra, Y., Ganguly, S., Kumar, R., & Sabikhi, L. (2020). Effect of heat treatment on plasmin activity and bio-functional attributes of Cheddar cheese. *LWT-Food Science and Technology*, 120(2020), 108924.
- International Dairy Federation – IDF. (1992). *Trace elements in milk and milk products. Bulletin of the International Dairy Federation*, No: 278. Brussels: IDF.
- Jaster, H., Campos, A. C. L. P. D., Auer, L. B., Los, F. G. B., Salem, R. D. S., Esmerino, L. A., Nogueira, A., & Demiate, I. M. (2014). Quality evaluation of Parmesan-type cheese: a chemometric approach. *Food Science and Technology*, 34(1), 181-188. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1590/S0101-20612014000100026>.
- Kahyaoglu, T., Kaya, S., & Kaya, A. (2005). Effects of fat reduction and curd dipping temperature on viscoelasticity, texture and appearance of Gaziantep cheese. *Food Science & Technology International*, 11(3), 191-198. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/1082013205055002>.
- Kaminarides, S., Litos, I., Massouras, T., & Georgala, A. (2015). The effect of cooking time on curd composition and textural properties of sheep Halloumi cheese. *Small Ruminant Research*, 125, 106-114. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.smallrumres.2015.01.025>.
- Kaminarides, S., Moschopoulou, E., & Karali, F. (2019). Influence of salting method on the chemical and texture characteristics of ovine Halloumi cheese. *Foods*, 8(7), 232. <http://dx.doi.org/10.3390/foods8070232>. PMID:31261910.

- Kara, S. (2019). *Determination of some quality parameters and bioactivity of herby cheese produced by traditional method* (MSc thesis). Van: Van Yuzuncu Yil University Science Institute Food Engineering Department.
- Karaman, A. D., & Akalin, A. S. (2013). Improving quality characteristics of reduced and low fat Turkish white cheeses using homogenized cream. *Food Science and Technology*, 2013(50), 503-510.
- Karatekin, B. (2014). *Effects of some manufacturing parameters on functional and ripening properties of Malatya cheese*. (MSc thesis). Malatya: Inonu University Graduate School of Natural and Applied Sciences Department of Food Engineering.
- Kırca, A., & Özkan, M. (2007). Değişik amaçlı bazı test ve analiz yöntemleri. *Gıda Teknolojisi Derneği Yayınları*, 34, 535.
- Kirdar, S. S., Kose, S., Gun, I., Ocak, E., & Kursun, O. (2015). Do consumption of Kargi Tulum cheese meet daily requirements for minerals and trace elements? *Mljekarstvo*, 65(3), 203-209. <http://dx.doi.org/10.15567/mljekarstvo.2015.0307>.
- Kose, S. (2015). *The effect of some herbs added to herby cheese on antimicrobial properties, antioxidant capacity and phenolic compounds of cheese*. (PhD thesis). Van: Yuzuncu Yil University Science Institute Food Engineering Department.
- Kose, Ş. (2020). Effect of sugar type and concentration on pasting and textural properties of corn starch in water and skim milk. *Cereal Chemistry*, 97(5), 921-929.
- Kose, S., & Ocak, E. (2019). Mineral composition of Herby cheese produced from raw and pasteurized milk. *Applied Ecology and Environmental Research*, 17(3), 7189-7201. http://dx.doi.org/10.15666/aeer/1703_71897201.
- Kose, S., Kose, Y. E., & Ceylan, M. M. (2019). Impact of sodium chloride and ascorbic acid on pasting and textural parameters of corn starch-water and milk systems. *International Journal of Agriculture and Biological Sciences*, 3, 9-16.
- Kose, Y., Altun, İ., & Köse, Ş. (2018). Determination of texture profile analysis of yogurt produced by industrial and traditional method. *International Journal of Scientific and Technological Research*, 4(8), 66-70.
- Kuchroo, C. N., & Fox, P. F. (1982). Soluble nitrogen in Cheddar cheese: comparison of extraction procedures. *Milchwissenschaft. Milk Science International*, 37, 331-335.
- Lante, A., Lomolino, G., Cagnin, M., & Spetoli, P. (2006). Content and characterisation of minerals in milk and in Crescenza and Squacquerone Italian fresh cheeses by ICP-OES. *Food Control*, 17(3), 229-233. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2004.10.010>.
- Manuelian, C. L., Currò, S., Penasa, M., Cassandro, M., & Marchi, M. (2017). Characterization of major and trace minerals, fatty acid composition, and cholesterol content of Protected Designation of Origin cheeses. *Journal of Dairy Science*, 100(5), 3384-3395. <http://dx.doi.org/10.3168/jds.2016-12059>. PMID:28237598.
- Mattera, M., Durazzo, A., Nicoli, S., Costanzo, M. G., & Manzi, P. (2016). Chemical, nutritional, physical and antioxidant properties of Pecorino d'abruzzo cheese. *Italian Journal of Food Science*, 28(4), 579-597.
- McSweeney, P. L. (2004). Biochemistry of cheese ripening. *International Journal of Dairy Technology*, 57(2-3), 127-144. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1471-0307.2004.00147.x>.
- Nielsen, S. S. (2003). *Mohr Titration Food analysis laboratory manual* (3rd ed.). New York: Kluwer Academic/Plenum Publishers. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4757-5250-2>.
- Ocak, E., & Kose, S. (2015). Van Otlu peynirinin üretimi ve mineral madde içeriği. *Gıda*, 40(6), 343-348.
- Oksuztepe, G., Karatepe, P., Ozcelik, M., & Incili, G. K. (2013). Tulum peyniri ve taze Beyaz peynirlerin mineral madde ve ağır metal içerikleri. *Sağlık Bilimleri Veteriner Dergisi*, 27(2), 93-97.
- Okumus, M. (2019). The effect of buffalo milk usage on physico-chemical, textural and sensory properties of Kashar cheese. (MSc thesis). Bursa: Bursa Uludağ University Science Institute Food Engineering Department.
- Ozlu, H., Aydemir-Atasever, M., Urcar, S., & Atasever, M. (2012). Erzurum'da tüketime sunulan Kaşar peynirlerinin Mineral madde içeriği ve ağır metal kontaminasyonu. *Kafkas Üniversitesi Veteriner Fakültesi Dergisi*, 18(2), 205-208.
- Perna, A., Intaglietta, I., Simonetti, A., & Gambacorta, E. (2015). Effect of genetic type on antioxidant activity of Caciocavallo cheese during ripening. *Journal of Dairy Science*, 98(6), 3690-3694. <http://dx.doi.org/10.3168/jds.2014-9097>. PMID:25892688.
- Qin, L. Q., Wang, X. P., Li, W., Tong, X., & Tong, W. J. (2009). The minerals and heavy metals in cow's milk from China and Japan. *Journal of Health Science*, 55(2), 300-305. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1248/jhs.55.300>.
- Revilla, I., González-Martín, M. I., Vivar-Quintana, A. M., Blanco-López, M. A., Lobos-Ortega, I. A., & Hernández-Hierro, J. M. (2016). Antioxidant capacity of different cheeses: affecting factors and prediction by near infrared spectroscopy. *Journal of Dairy Science*, 99(7), 5074-5082. <http://dx.doi.org/10.3168/jds.2015-10564>. PMID:27085414.
- Rufino, M. D. M., Alves, R. E., Brito, E. S., Perez-Jimenez, J., Saura-Calixto, F., & Mancini-Filho, J. (2010). Bioactive compounds and antioxidant capacities of 18 non-traditional tropical fruits from Brazil. *Food Chemistry*, 121(4), 996-1002. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2010.01.037>.
- Salari, S., Zanganeh, M., Fadavi, A., & Ahmadi, Z. (2017). Effect of xanthan gum and carboxymethyl cellulose on physical properties of cream cheese. *International Journal of Advancements in Technology*, 8(1), 1-5. <http://dx.doi.org/10.4172/0976-4860.1000176>.
- Santiago-López, L., Aguilar-Toalá, J. E., Hernández-Mendoza, A., Vallejo-Cordoba, B., Liceaga, A. M., & González-Córdova, A. F. (2018). Invited review: Bioactive compounds produced during cheese ripening and health effects associated with aged cheese consumption. *Journal of dairy science*, 101(5), 3742-3757.
- Singh, T. K., Fox, P. F., & Healy, A. (1997). Isolation and identification of further peptides in the diafiltration retentate of the water-soluble fraction of Cheddar cheese. *The Journal of Dairy Research*, 64(3), 433-443. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/S0022029997002227>. PMID:9275258.
- Šnirc, M., Árvay, J., Král, M., Jančo, I., Zajác, P., Harangozo, L., & Benešová, L. (2020). Content of mineral elements in the traditional Oštiepok cheese. *Biological Trace Element Research*, 196(2), 639-645. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s12011-019-01934-w>. PMID:31650448.
- Solís-Méndez, A. D., Estrada-Flores, J. G., & Castelán-Ortega, O. A. (2013). A study on the texture diversity of the artisan Ranchero cheese from central Mexico. *International Journal of Dairy Technology*, 66(1), 37-44. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1471-0307.2012.00881.x>.
- SPSS. (1999). *SPSS for Windows Release 10.0*. Chicago: SPSS. Inc.
- Tarakci, Z. (2004). The influence of helis (Prangos sp.) on characteristics of vacuum-packed Van herby cheese during ripening. *Milchwissenschaft. Milk Science International*, 59(11-12), 619-623.
- Tarakci, Z., & Kucukoner, Z. (2006). Changes on physicochemical, lipolysis and proteolysis of vacuum packed Turkish Kashar cheese during ripening. *Journal of Central European Agriculture*, 7(3), 459-464.
- Tarakci, Z., Coskun, H., & Tuncturk, Y. (2004). Some properties of fresh and ripened herby cheese, a traditional variety produced in Turkey. *Food Technology and Biotechnology*, 42(1), 47-50.

- Tarakci, Z., & Deveci, F. (2019). The effects of different spices on chemical, biochemical, textural and sensory properties. *Mljekarstvo*, 69(1), 64-77..
- Yasar, K. (2007). *Farklı Pıhtılaştırıcı Enzim Kullanımının ve Olgunlaşma Süresinin Kaşar Peynirinin Özellikleri Üzerine Etkisi* (Phd thesis). Adana: Çukurova Üniversitesi Fen Bilimleri Enstitüsü.
- Yemis, O., Bakkalbasi, E., & Artık, N. (2008). Antioxidant activities of grape (*Vitis vinifera*) seed extracts obtained from different varieties grown in Turkey. *International Journal of Food Science & Technology*, 43(1), 154-159. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2621.2006.01415.x>.
- Yildiz, O., Yurt, B., Toker, O. S., Ceylan, M. M., Yilmaz, M. T., & Baştürk, A. (2015). Pasting, textural and sensory characteristics of the Kofter, a fruit-based dessert: effect of molasses and water concentration. *International Journal of Food Engineering*, 11(3), 349-358. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1515/ijfe-2014-0313>.
- Yuzbasi, N., Sezgin, E., Yildirim, M., & Yildirim, Z. (2003). Survey of lead, cadmium, iron, copper and zinc in Kasar cheese. *Food Additives and Contaminants*, 20(5), 464-469. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/0265203031000094654>. PMID:12775465.
- Zamberlin, S., Antunac, N., Havranek, J., & Samarzija, D. (2012). Mineral elements in milk and dairy products. *Mljekarstvo*, 62(2), 111-125.
- Zheng, Y., Liu, Z., & Mo, B. (2016). Texture profile analysis of sliced cheese in relation to chemical composition and storage temperature. *Journal of Chemistry*, 2016(8690380), 1-10. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1155/2016/8690380>.