Violence in intimate relationships from the point of view of adolescents: perspectives of the Complexity Paradigm*

ABSTRACT

Objective: To analyze adolescents' perceptions about intimate violence from the perspective of the Complexity Paradigm. Method: A qualitative approach configured as strategic social study. The study participants were adolescents between 15 and 18 years old, attending high school in two public schools in a city in the interior of São Paulo State, Brazil. Data collection was performed through a focus group and a semi-structured interview as a complement. Data analysis was based on the dialogical, organizational and holographic principles of the Complex Paradigm. Results: The study included 39 adolescents (14 males and 25 females). Through the emerging categories, it was noticed that intimate violence occurs through dialogical affection-jealousy/control by a naturalization of violent acts which permeates gender, cultural and social issues, and by technology as preponderant for intimate violence among adolescents, denoting new forms of control and coercion. Conclusion: The study introduces aspects present in intimate violence among adolescents, presenting them in an articulate and interdependent way. These aspects constitute a relevant contribution to the actions of health professionals.

DESCRIPTORS

Adolescent; Intimate Partner Violence; Student Health; Qualitative Research.
INTRODUCTION

Intimate Partner Violence (IPV) in contemporary times, especially among adolescents, has been occurring steadily. The World Health Organization classifies adolescence as the phase corresponding to the age group between 10 and 19 years, which is a period of biopsychosocial changes in which there is greater exploration of experiences and desire for a sense of autonomy, as well as searches and experiences which provide greater exposure to risky/vulnerable situations and practices, as well as violence[12]. Among these practices is the involvement in abusive intimate relationships, mainly resulting from the beginning of sexual relations and belief in romantic love. Gender identity construction and generation subordination can be associated with considerable vulnerability to an experience of victimization or perpetration of IPV among adolescent partners[2].

In addition, adolescents’ inability to respond to violence makes them more susceptible to short- and long-term physical, psychological and emotional harm compared to adulthood[13-14]. Given this, the moment of adolescence requires a particular look and policies[11].

IPV may be characterized as physical, verbal, sexual or psychological/emotional, and may arise from a close or personal relationship between two individuals. One of the forms of violence which is most manifested in intimate relationships between adolescents is known as Stalking, a notion which refers to the act of following, threatening and controlling the other individual, generating emotional states of fear and insecurity. The IPV manifestation may be punctual or continuous, unidirectional or bidirectional, and is not limited to sexual orientations, but may occur between homosexual and heterosexual subjects[7].

National and international literature reveals worrying rates of IPV among adolescents. In addition to the serious consequences, a longitudinal study emphasizes normalization and legitimation of abusive behaviors in IPV by adolescents[8]. An interpretation of the phenomenon as being normal was also revealed in a recent study[3], in which adolescents who had suffered some form of IPV did not feel it to be constituted as such, nor did they act with any difference in interpreting it. Thus, IPV victims in adolescence tend to consent to, exhibit such, nor did they act with any difference in interpreting it. The originality of the present study is emphasized, since there are no articles found in the literature which consider IPV from the perspective of the Complex Paradigm, as well as a lack of qualitative approaches and the need for studies with more contextualized perspectives. Added to this is the importance of looking at this phenomenon through health, especially nursing’s perspective, which needs to include contemporary issues permeating the lives of adolescents in its agenda, necessarily involving themselves in their health-disease process.

METHOD

STUDY DESIGN

This study implemented a qualitative approach using strategic social research based on the dialogical, organizational and holographic recursion principles of Complex Thinking, which were used as support to obtain and analyze the data.

The dialogical principle, when presenting organization and complexity, claims the conjugation of two complementary and antagonistic logics at the same time[11-12]. The organizational recursion principle enables interconnection which gives characteristics to the phenomenon, negates the linear cause/effect relationship and reveals the individual as a product and producer of their interactional processes[10,12]. Finally, there is the holographic principle, which looks at the whole and at the same time it embraces and allows for separation between the parts, without losing their specificities[31-12].

SCENARIO

The field of study was a municipality in the interior of the state of São Paulo, Brazil, which has a population of 61,040 inhabitants[13]. The study included 39 adolescents (14 males and 25 females) aged 15 to 18, attending high school in two public schools. Participants were from three 2nd year classes and one 3rd year high school class. The schools were chosen randomly and the preference for the 2nd and 3rd year was proposed by the school boards to enable better internal organization.

SELECTION CRITERIA

The selection criteria for the participants were: i) To be attending the first to third year of high school, both genders and of any sexual orientation; ii) Delivering the Free and Informed Assent Form for adolescents under 18 years of age, and the Free and Informed Consent Form (ICF) of the adolescents’ guardians completely filled in and signed; and iii) Full participation in a focus group (FG).

DATA COLLECTION

Focus groups and semi-structured interviews were performed to obtain the data. A FG occurs through dialogue
The data obtained in the researchers’ evaluation showed redundancy and repetition after the 4th FG and 15th interview; thus, the inclusion of new participants in the strategies was finalized. The researchers followed a script which takes into account the empirical limits of the data, the integration of the data with the theory, and the theoretical sensitivity of the researchers analyzing the data for saturation reliability(13).

The researcher performed a member-check at the end of the FGs and semi-structured interviews, which means they consulted the participants again to see if their findings reproduced what the adolescents actually said, felt and thought about IPV. The teens listened to their recorded reports and were able to confirm their perceptions or rephrase some statement(s) when they thought they had expressed themselves badly or were not clear enough.

DATA ANALYSIS AND PROCESSING

An analysis of the obtained data was based on the Complexity Paradigm and a script with three phases was performed(16): i) Classification and organization of the collected information, determining the relevant points of the interviews and FGs, concomitantly providing a total view of the data, phenomenon and its particularities. The reports were transcribed in full and with the identification of each interview and FGs, concomitantly providing a total view of the data found by organizing them into categories, existing scientific literature on IPV among adolescents and the Complexity Paradigm. The data analysis and processing were based on the notion of contextualization constituting the proposed Paradigm and on the elucidation of some participants’ reports. This aimed at achieving the research objective and being authentic to the participants’ interpretations so as to accomplish credibility and validity in the data analysis.

ETHICAL ASPECTS

The study was approved by the Research Ethics Committee of the Universidade de São Paulo at Ribeirão Preto College of Nursing through Official Letter No. 279/2016, on August 31, 2016, according to Resolution no. 466/12 of the National Health Council on research with human beings. Accordingly, spontaneous consent was requested by signing the Informed Consent Form (ICF). In order to carry out the study, the approval of the Education Board of the Region and the participating school units was requested.

RESULTS

CHARACTERIZATION

The students attending the third year of high school were contacted in one of the schools which constituted the research sites, designated as S1, and totaled 17. This low number of students is justified by the fact that there was only one class in the school at full time. In the other school, designated as S2, there were three classes in the second year.
of high school, which had 28, 31 and 32 students. The teenagers at this school participated in the FGs at the end of the 2016 school year while attending the end of the second year of high school, and the semi-structured interviews at the beginning of the 2017 school year, when they were already in their third year.

Given the inclusion criteria, 39 adolescents participated in the study. The participants were: 7 from the S1 school (18%) and 32 from the S2 school (82%). In the S1 and S2 schools, 28.5% and 37.5% of participants were male, while 71.5% and 62.5% of participants were female, respectively. At the time of the survey, two female participants from the S1 and three female participants from the S2 (two female and one male) reported not having experienced any intimate relationships.

“It’s normal”, “It’s acceptable” and “It happens”

Feelings and reactions involving passivity towards IPV were characterized as accepted and common by adolescents:

I think it’s normal, you’re on edge. It happens. Sometimes squeezing the arm, grabbing the neck (P4/M-G3).

Emotional blackmail, it’s bullshit for a woman to fall for it (P4/M-G1).

The reports also highlighted issues related to gender and passivity towards violence perpetrated by women, denoting a taboo still existing in society and the reproduction of stigmatizing issues:

I think when a man is violent, he can swear, but not hit. The difference is in the force. If we punch him, he’ll feel it softly, now if he punches, we’ll get bruised (P5/W-G3).

Woman do something lighter, if their nails are long she scratches, uses her nails [laughs], pinches, tries to pull hair, when the guy has it [laughs]. But like, the man is stronger (I13/M).

The possibility of the man being the victim rather than the perpetrator of violence in the relationship was lower. In addition, there was an association of violence against women with the Maria da Penha Law as a form of unilateral punishment. These ideas were explicitly presented in many accounts similar to the following transcripts:

Before there were no women beating a man, it’s difficult, and if there is now, it is infrequent (P8/W-G3).

Women get beaten much more than men. But when the man is beaten, the man never goes after his rights, because nowadays he doesn’t have the “José da Penha” law, he can go to jail, so women take advantage of it. A man doesn’t ask for help out of shame (I11/M).

A lack of understanding by participants of the sexual coercion/violence manifested in forced kissing was evidenced. This perception was reflected in the following reports:

I don’t think this [forced mouth kiss] is violence. We're dating, you know he'll always be wanting to kiss you, whether you want to or not. If you don’t want to, even in a fight, then you can quit. Because even I’m angry, sad, and I don’t kiss, he will think that I’m with another guy. And I’ll think the same of him (P7/W-G2).

If someone tries to kiss me forcibly, you know, if it’s a stranger, it’s violence, right. But not by a boyfriend, he’s my boyfriend right? (P9/W-G3).

The existence of a relationship implied giving in to her boyfriend’s wishes. Therefore, the adolescent’s emotional states no longer determine their own desire: denying a kiss would indicate a possible betrayal on one side or the other. From another perspective, giving in to a stranger’s kissing was considered violence, but letting your boyfriend was not. For the participants, even if the partner did not respect their partner’s limits or wishes, the ideal would be to have consent, as if it were a clause written in an invisible contract which strived for accepting a forced kiss. Thus, this form of sexual coercion was relativized as a pact in which violence is considered external to the relationship.

“VIOLENCE: ITS DIMENSIONS AND EXPERIENCES”

When the other, the partner, was the perpetrator of the violence, it was interpreted as a manifestation of love, thus denoting a syncretism of love and violence, as one sees in the following statements:

If I was going out I had to take her wherever I went (...). She was very loving, suffocating (...) (E2/M).

But he doesn’t want to control, he wants to prevent his girlfriend from having something happening, to avoid a fight or anything. This is love (P1/W-G1).

Several forms of physical, sexual, verbal and psychological violence were reported:

At the beginning of the relationship he controlled my clothes, where I went, who I talked to, I had this problem a lot, but then I complained, and he stopped ... But I don’t have male friends, he wouldn’t accept that (P5/W-G1).

She scratches me a lot ... but I do nothing, never did anything. Sometimes I swear, curse, but I don’t touch her, but look at my back, my arms, I’m all scratched (E4/M).

She kept calling me fat ... asshole ... such things ... because she was ashamed, and she kept making fun of me (E8-M).

When the participant was the perpetrator of violence, control and jealousy gained prominence as a justification for such acts:

I’m already possessive psychotic jealous, I have that kind of problem. The person has to accept as I am, this is love right (P1/W-G1).

Ab like, in the case of another man I say: ‘What are you looking at, she’s mine’ (P1/M-G3).

This reveals expressing jealousy as a manifestation of love and not of violence by adolescents. In this context, many forms of violence end up being veiled, such as psychological violence manifested in different ways such as jealousy and control, disguising itself as care.
Some participants reported violence as reciprocal in their relationship:

*I hit, swear, hit his face, then go home to cry. He does something, hits me, curses me and I return it too. I’ve even fainted at home, I was so upset. It was humiliation, but I can’t keep control* (P1/W-G1).

In two-way violence, physical, verbal and psychological aggressions were manifested.

**PASSWORDS AND TIME: MOTIVATORS FOR VIOLENCE**

Among the elements cited by adolescents as stimulators of the phenomenon (namely: alcohol and drug use, lies, among others), social networks and the duration of the relationship were the most cited elements by adolescents.

Violence manifests itself via social networks through the insistence of a partner to want the password of the mobile phone and digital social networks like Instagram®, Facebook®, and WhatsApp®, causing an invasion of privacy, manipulation and control over whom the other talks to. Not allowing this act is seen as distrust for those who want it. This may be observed in the following speeches:

*I see her cell phone conversations every day, she can’t have a password* (P6/M-G3).

*You can control what he sees and does. I once deleted a lot of girls from his Facebook because I can’t add male friends* (P9/W-G3).

*When someone doesn’t give their password, I’m sure they are hiding something, there is no violence* (P1/W-G1).

Thus, social networks are related to engendering new forms of violence and can be established in different dimensions, as in this report:

*(...) I think he [my boyfriend] is more on my Facebook than his own (...) Sometimes he gets very stressed with what he sees, then he starts punching the wall (...) He scares me* (G4-W).

*There’s a boy here from our school who beats his girlfriend because of Facebook, Whatsapp, these things, and the girl doesn’t even let him like a photo, that leads to a fight for sure* (P9/M-G4).

Several reports of participants expressed that the length of the relationship time was a factor conducive to violence, indicating that a longer relationship not only provides greater coexistence and intimacy, but also an wearing out of the relationship and loss of calmness by both. This may be observed in the speeches:

*As [the] time passes together it tires you, wears on you, becomes stressful ... it end up in this* (P3/M-G1).

*In the beginning of dating there is no serious fighting, now in my case we have dated for over a year, I stay at his house, we spend a lot of time together, there is no way, we fight frequently, we more psychologically attack each other you know, we now how to manipulate each other* (P11/W-G1).

*My boyfriend said: ‘I agree love, you’re right’. But a year goes by, two, three, then he no longer agrees. Then he retorts. Then he begins the pinches, the pulls, on him, on both* (P5/W-G4).

It was inferred that there was confusion between the notions of freedom, intimate relationship, and violent actions in many adolescent relationships over time. Moreover, the length of the relationship time was an element for the occurrence of two-way violence. In many reports, only after some time of relationship did one of the subjects of the relationship use physical and psychological aggression as a way to fight back against the violence suffered, as self-defense or as an alternative to end the violence they experienced.

**DISCUSSION**

Through the dialogical principle, a relationship and codependency between affection and aggression present in the intimate relationships of adolescents is observed. Conflicts and instabilities were faced by adolescents in two ways: first, through an association of violence with love, in which forms of violence are considered expressions of love or synonymous with love, especially through control over the partner and jealousy. These data confirm a study which reveals violent behaviors and jealous practices as accepted and associated with love in adolescents’ intimate relationships[17].

Given this, it can be considered that the dialogical affect-aggression was treated by adolescents as totally opposite and separate aspects, although their reports show that they were linked and solidified, but also hidden and in a process of invisibility. Concomitantly with this finding, difficulties in discerning between love practices such as kisses, and coercion to sexual practice were evidenced. Thus, a kiss does not fall into the category of sexual coercion for them.

The World Health Organization characterizes sexual violence as unwanted sexual acts or attempts using coercion, which include acts such as rape and harassment, which may be in the school or work environment, among others[18]. This phenomenon can be exerted by intimate partners within an informal relationship, in dating and marriages, and by strangers and in any context. In Brazil, according to the norms of Law No. 12.015/09, kissing and forcibly grabbing or pulling hair are considered sexual assaults and crimes against sexual dignity, and the person who commits such acts can be severely punished[19].

Among all types of violence between intimate partners in Brazil, sexual violence has the lowest rate, which is due to a feeling of embarrassment by the person who suffers violence, precisely because it is perpetrated by an intimate partner and is associated with the issue of power. Given this, sexual violence between intimate partners suffers an invisibility process for the sake of taboo and the erroneous belief that it is only practiced by strangers[20]. Moreover, stigma and shame may contribute to omitting suffered violence, leading to underreporting of cases[18,20]. This is reinforced by the lack of knowledge regarding notification and its importance by adolescents and by the fragile technical training of health professionals, producing ignorance and uncertainties in their decision making and difficulty in identifying and visualizing the phenomenon[2,17].

The second way for adolescents to deal with the instability of intimate relationships was to accept the violence, especially physical aggression perpetrated by females. This
reveals a social stigmatization of girls by boys, a reproduction of machismo and misogyny by disqualifying the act performed by a woman, as if the practice were categorized as having less offensive potential by adolescents[17]. Disbelief of men being victims, as being dominated rather than dominant, presented in the statements that “men cannot be beaten by women”, is a reproduction of an androcentric and ancient sexist discourse.

Men also suffer, albeit differently and to a lesser extent than women, the consequences and deprivations imposed by gender relations[17]. A study of Brazilian adolescents reinforces this conception and exposes the invisibility of violence against men because it is not considered by many to be gender violence[17].

The statement by participant E11-M that when a man is beaten he does not go after his rights because there is no “José da Penha Law”, makes explicit the lack of knowledge about Brazilian legislation which supports the safety and protection of any person, including males. Law No. 11.340/06, known as the Maria da Penha Law, is known to be specifically designed to curb and prevent domestic and family violence against women[21]. This law became well known in the country through the campaigns and initiatives of feminist movements, lawyers and the Brazilian government, but it was not disclosed with the same vehemence that men who suffer from domestic and family violence also has judicial protection for their safety, supported by the Brazilian Penal Code. Thus, a man must seek the police station and register a police report for the Penal Code to be applied.

Moreover, it is well known that the invisibility and taboo of man as a victim is the result of an androcentric view and social violence of gender relations. The latter establishes stereotyped roles which are socially constructed for men and women. Generalized and strict characteristics, values and standards are imposed, whether veiled or not, for different genders. With many recurring examples in society, these ideas that women are a fragile gender, cannot drive, and are divided between women to marry and those to enjoy are spread; while a man is strong and cannot cry because that is a “girly thing”. Gender-based violence coupled with the myth of ideal love – which is also misrepresented in terms of power – enables and promotes violence between intimate partners in both heterosexual and homosexual relationships[17,22-23].

In the principle of organizational recursion, it was possible to look at the interconnection that characterizes intimate partner violence. Intimate relationships based on the principles of jealousy and possession legitimized violence, justified unthinking actions, and exempted the perpetrator from liability. In addition, many forms of violence have become invisible, and both the perpetrator and the victim of the violence were often unaware of its manifestation and meaning in the relationship, or when aware, made it accepted and consented. In the participants’ testimonies, the various meanings given to violence emerged as a normal and acceptable phenomenon, something that happens commonly in the relationships of intimacy among adolescents. These beliefs and the veiling of violence are characterized as the main factors in the perpetuation of the phenomenon. In seeking to elaborate new meanings and break with reductionism, the principle of organizational recursion reveals that violent actions and experiences in relationships are products and producers of other experiences and behaviors. This aspect becomes clear in the bidirectionality evidenced in several national and international studies, in which both genders mutually assaulted each other and were assaulted[16,19-25]. However, even if there is a high percentage of two-way violence within an intimate relationship among adolescents, the damage and consequent harm from violence is greater, more severe, and longer lasting for women than men, whether physical, emotional, verbal, psychological or patrimonial[4-5,20]. In addition, there is a relevant number of women who claim to fight back against the violence suffered as a form of self-defense, which makes it possible to explain the high rates of violence of female authorship[25].

One tried to obtain a broader view of the phenomenon through the holographic principle, but in different dimensions and with its particularities and connectivity. In this study, the interactions and connections of sexual, physical, verbal and psychological violence in the reports and experiences of adolescents are highlighted. The dimensions of verbal and psychological violence were the most frequent among participants, manifested in both the position of authors and victims, the latter being reinforced by different studies[6,17].

The duration of the intimate relationship was revealed as a motivating element for the violence, showing that the longer the relationship, the greater the likelihood of the violence occurring. This finding confirms the results of recent studies[4,25-26]. A demonstration of loss of calmness and patience coupled with the tiredness generated by the insistence in monitoring digital social networks practiced by the partners were the main justifications for the physical and psychological violence which emerged throughout the relationship period in the present study.

The reports of adolescents and their interconnections through the holographic principle showed that digital technologies, especially smartphones and virtual social networks have paradoxically become factors for exposure to violence which were materialized by the insistence on obtaining access to passwords for phones and social networks as a means of gaining control over the partner; they may become obsessive and it may cause mood swings. Thus, in this context of virtual environments, new ways of reaching the partner’s emotional state and self-confidence/self-esteem emerged, as well as other forms of IPV such as cyberviolence, demonstrated by receiving and sending videos and sexual photos without the consent of the partner.

The feeling of insecurity regarding the partner’s relationship and attitude towards the mobilities, uncertainties, instability, uncontrollability of life events, associated with the element of relationship durability fostered control behaviors as strategies used by adolescents in their intimate relationships.

Thus, it is necessary to debate gender and sexuality relations in the spheres of education, safety and health to rethink traditional sex education. This is because many health and education professionals are unprepared and do not know or cannot take a direct approach to the phenomenon, judgments
The results indicated dialogical affection-jealousy/control present in relationships; organizational recursion of author-victim of violence; naturalization of violent acts which crosses gender, cultural and social issues; and technology as being preponderant for IPV among adolescents, denoting new forms of control and coercion. This deepening, contextualization and respect to the singularity of the participants was enabled by the use of the qualitative approach, especially considering that most quantitative productions are unveiled in the research theme, denoting important knowledge gaps in the qualitative approach of the phenomenon with such complexity.

In sum, the Complexity Paradigm has made an essential contribution to the search for developing a comprehensive view on the theme, providing greater clarity on the elements which make up the phenomenon, and especially on the interdependence and interconnectedness between them in an articulated and contextualized way. New studies addressing gender specificities and perspectives of other social actors, such as health and education professionals, are recommended.

CONCLUSION

The results indicated dialogical affection-jealousy/control present in relationships; organizational recursion of author-victim of violence; naturalization of violent acts which crosses gender, cultural and social issues; and technology as being preponderant for IPV among adolescents, denoting new forms of control and coercion. This deepening, contextualization and respect to the singularity of the participants was enabled by the use of the qualitative approach, especially considering that most quantitative productions are unveiled in the research theme, denoting important knowledge gaps in the qualitative approach of the phenomenon with such complexity.

In sum, the Complexity Paradigm has made an essential contribution to the search for developing a comprehensive view on the theme, providing greater clarity on the elements which make up the phenomenon, and especially on the interdependence and interconnectedness between them in an articulated and contextualized way. New studies addressing gender specificities and perspectives of other social actors, such as health and education professionals, are recommended.

RESUMEN

Objetivo: Analizar las percepciones de adolescentes acerca de la violencia en las relaciones de intimidad desde el punto de vista del Paradigma de la Complejidad. Método: Abordaje cualitativo, configurándose como investigación social estratégica. Los participantes en el estudio fueron adolescentes entre 15 y 18 años, asistentes a la educación secundaria de dos escuelas públicas de un municipio del interior del estado de São Paulo, Brasil. La recolección de datos se llevó a cabo mediante el grupo focal y, como complementación, la entrevista semiestructurada. El análisis de datos fue fundamentado en los principios dialógico, recurso organizacional y hologramático del Paradigma Complejo. Resultados: Participaron en el estudio 39 adolescentes (14 del sexo masculino y 25 del sexo femenino). Por medio de las categorías emergentes, percebió-se que la violencia en la intimidad está atravesada por la dialógica afeto-cúmplices/controle, la naturalización de atos violentos que permea cuestiones de género, culturales e sociales y por la tecnología como preponderante para la violencia de intimidad entre adolescentes, denotando nuevas formas de control y coerción. Conclusión: El estudio traz aspectos presentes en la violencia en la intimidad entre adolescentes, mostrándolos de modo articulado e interdependiente. Tais aspectos se configuram en relevante contribuição para as ações de profissionais de saúde.

DESCRITORES
Adolescente; Violência por parceiro íntimo; Saúde do estudante; Pesquisa Qualitativa.

REFERENCES


Brasil. Lei n. 12.015, de 7 de agosto de 2009. Altera o Título VI da Parte Especial do Decreto-Lei no 2.848, de 7 de dezembro de 1940 - Código Penal, e o art. 1oda Lei no 8.072, de 25 de julho de 1990, que dispõe sobre os crimes hediondos, nos termos do inciso XLIII do art. 5o da Constituição Federal e revoga o Decreto na Lei no 2.252, de 1o de julho de 1954, que trata de corrupção de menores [Internet]. Brasília; 2009 [citado 2016 ago. 18]. Disponível em: http://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/Ato2007-2010/2009/lei/L12015.htm


Financial support: The Coordenação de Aperfeiçoamento de Pessoal de Nível Superior (CAPES), Fundação de Amparo a Pesquisa do Estado de São Paulo (FAPESP - 2015/24069-5).